

CONTENTS

Editorial

Reflection to Contemporary Contradictions in the Mind of the Artist 6

Dhirendranath Ganguly

Psychiatrist Dhirendranath 12

Basudev Mukherjee

An Outline of Dialectico-Historical Materialism 22

Dhrubajyoti Majumdar

Science and the Military-Science-Industry Complex 30

Ashish Lahiri

Religion As Surrogate : Case Study of a Bengali Patriot 35

Ramkrishna Bhattacharya

Death in Judicial Custody (1995-1998) in West Bengal 48

Question and Answers 71

Book Review 73

Publication of *Psyche and Society* (PAS) started from May, 2003 as a bi-annual journal of Pavlov Institute, 98, M.G. Road, Kolkata-700 007, Ph. 2241-2935, a Registered Society Under Societies' Registration Act, XXI of 1860 (Vide Reg. No. S/20300). The Journal will be available in the first week of May and December each year. PAS publishes articles in the fields of Biology, Sociology, Psychology and Psychiatry. Manuscripts for publication should be sent to the Editor, *Psyche and Society*, 98, M.G. Road, Kolkata-700 007. Communications, letters to the Editor and book reviews may also be sent to our e-mail address : pav_inst@yahoo.co.in

Each issue is priced Rupees twenty five (Rs. 25/-) only, and the annual subscription Rupees fifty (Rs. 50/-) only inclusive of ordinary (Book Post) postal charges. Subscription may be sent by M.O./DD/A/c. Payee Cheque (Kolkata only) in favour of **Pavlov Institute and Hospitals.**

There is a need for change

We can again recall those old, familiar and oft-repeated words of Marx, 'Philosophers have interpreted the world in many ways, and now point is however to change it.' By this change we really refer to a social change. A change which will give all the people of the country employment appropriate for his capabilities and a minimum living standard for himself and his family, including a roof over his head, education and health services. But how can we bring about this change?

Today if we raise this topic for discussion among a few people, we will probably see three kinds of reactions. Some may say, changes are taking places as part of the normal social evolution and other changes are not possible. There is a logic in this argument. So far amongst all the stable and strong changes we have seen taking places in the world there is a heavier weightage for these so-called normal social evolutions.

Another group may say a radical change is required in society and for this a social revolution is necessary, without which there cannot be any changes. They also have a logic. A number of social revolutions have taken place and there have been unprecedented social changes through these revolutions or in their ensuing periods -- there are also examples of this in history.

Yet another group will certainly say, in this situation it is impossible to have a social revolution; instead reformative work in the normal course will take time, but still the desired social changes can happen or be made to happen. These apart, there is still another group who has to be mentioned -- they are the confused. Meaning thereby that they do not understand the total situation. Therefore those who are a bit clever among them, follow the others or carefully sidestep the issue. And those who are upright and fair are sometimes encouraged, sometimes depressed when discussing the subject.

In this situation, any body may raise a question -- in that case what is your position in this? A simple answer to this is -- we also are confused like a lot of you. In spite of this we have to say a few words on this subject. This is because these days there are many philosophically balanced people who say that this confusion is a political view. But we do not think so.

Like for example we think that one cannot think of any social changes without involving politics. This means that whether we accept it or not, those who think of social changes must have some political views, no matter how hard they try to hide this. It is seen that our intellectual people say a lot of things about our social systems, but hesitate or better to say are afraid to talk openly about politics. There is only one reason for this, fear of facing the rage of the state and of losing whatever facilities they may be getting. It is certain that some have stopped thinking of them out of anger or hatred, but they consist of only a few in numbers as they are seen subsequently isolated or withdrawn and therefore are not included in this discussion.

Then we have to accept, if any intellectual person who believes in social changes claims that he is not a spineless individual then we have the right to ask him to clarify his political views. If he does not answer we have to assume that he is an opportunist. This means we never consider that if one has a political view, we should immediately jump in to apply it. But we do feel that that socially conscious individual will on the different social occasions clearly

express his views or reactions. But the majority of our renowned intellectuals do not follow this. This disappoints us. Then the question arises in our mind, our revered person may be perfect in all respects, but when it comes to expressing his political views why does he keep quiet, why doesn't he protest against the unfair and unjust!

Any duplicity in our actions can result in serious problems. For example there are occasions when we may be mentally aware of the consequences when faced with state actions, but externally we put up a very brave front. As a result we get people outside unnecessarily excited and in a dilemma. This is because we are unable to maintain a continuity in our work on this. Anybody can argue against this, saying that one cannot know or understand the situation ahead without embarking on social changes. This is because the way itself shows us the way ahead.

Even accepting this I will say we will not gain anything by stealing from the house of thoughts, we all have a full account of ourselves of how much we do or say for society. Therefore those who give various arguments later for not remaining a revolutionary, are actually giving the wrong arguments.

Then to summarise our views, each socially conscious intellectual will have to clarify his political status or views. If he cannot do it then it will be assumed he is not a socially conscious intellectual. It is possible that as an individual he is an intellectual or a scientist or a revered person; but that intellectual has in no way any connection with the social changes mentioned by Marx. In fact if anybody says no social changes of any form is possible and the present *status quo* will continue, even then we will say, this is also a political argument and whoever has said it is behind the opposition to all changes.

The problems will be serious if he is a learned teacher, because he will have many students and he can quote to them from *Sankhya* or *Vedanta* (whom Vidyasagar has described as a false philosophy), and establish Shankaracharya through new stereotyped explanations (with the help of Kant's philosophical theories) and tell them we will never be able to know that part of this great Universe which Shankaracharya had tried to explain as an illusion of this material world. Therefore whatever is happening in whatever form, let it be continued, it is futile to try and understand, it is futile to try and change, and so on.

We can now visualise that after hearing these speeches the farmer will not be enthusiastic about putting his plough to the field after the rains, or the worker in a factory in Bellilious Road, Howrah quietly thinking about his destiny on an extended period for loadshedding, will not be enthusiastic about going back to work on the machine even when power comes back. Because much of the earthly matters is an illusion.

But it is also true that the political situation of our country or even the world is not at all satisfactory. For example some well-wisher may quietly mention to you that in the last century no country in the world has seen a political personality of standing repute who has gone through the University portals (I have in mind our own well-known Joshiji). This means a nation can be ruled without any higher education, and play around with the fate and destiny of crores of people! Even designations like dacoit, murderer, corrupted, morally depraved are not enough for the politicians!

But we can now expect that the world is moving ahead and therefore a number of educated people will hold the rudder of the country. Are we then falling behind in our political thoughts? But this cannot be accepted if sociology is a science. Meaning thereby, can the progress of science lag behind?

There are some people who say that in the ancient times a number of high-class cultures

had formed whose thoughts still guide us. Similarly later in the middle ages we lagged behind in our thinking. Therefore in this case social change means going either forward or backwards. If this is true then it applies to only social sciences, because in the case of science and technology we are going forward and the question of going backward does not arise at all.

But one point arises here on this discussion, we know that under the social analysis of the Marxists, the driving force or foundation of any society is economics and everything else are only superstructures. In that case in the ancient times those aristocratic civilizations depended on the backward agricultural economics and the system of slavery or castes. So when that economics collapsed, the civilizations associated with it also collapsed.

But the foundation of the industrialised, urbanised economics of today is much more strong and centralised. This in no way can be termed as a retarding economics which is falling behind. Even the economics of the so-called socialist countries which had started was a kind of mixed type and misleading, and probably this was the reason why it could not last. In that case can we say we are lagging behind at least from the aspect of economics?

Many people say all these situations cannot be explained only through economics. Even if we accept it, can we really say we are lagging behind when we see the advances that are taking place in science and technology? On this some may say social changes take place at a meandering tortuous pace. Therefore the part that is moving is not visibly obvious to us. This means that we cannot see the changes in that part, but changes are definitely taking places.

Whatever it may be, changes have taken places and continuing. It is doubtful whether we are walking backwards, but even if it is a relative matter, many are saying that there has been a degradation in the moral or ethical standards of man. Refining this somewhat, some are eager to say that the ethics of man are not developing in step with the development of the surrounding material matters. This is not at all a pleasant sight for us.

Meaning thereby the way we have swelled ourselves like the frog in a well in the pride of material progress, can we have the right to that pride if moral improvements do not take place to the same extent? It certainly will not be there, nor should it be there. But the responsibility for all these changes is on politics. In fact even the social practices of some countries are ultimately driven by political culture. Therefore if the political environment is so bad, how will good people come into politics?

We can no longer wish away this subject as 'an argument for escapism'. Throughout the world the political environment has sharply deteriorated. We are not aware how the great people will deal with this situation. Because from the account given by America, the most advanced country in the world, the majority of their people do not express any enthusiasm about politics. This is applicable for both the educated and the ordinary people.

We have to consider why we are not at all enthusiastic about politics. One of the reasons for this is certainly that administering society with politics has become so centralised that we feel quite alienated and helpless.

That is we are constantly realising in an unbiased way that this machine known as the state is operating and will remain so. We will not be able to influence this structural adjustment or arrangement in any way. So what do we gain by unnecessarily spending time on this. We accept that many educated, good people are thinking on these lines. But let me mention another aspect of this subject which comes to my mind.

Those who are intimately connected with the administration of this state know that the state from top to bottom is totally administered by technocrat-bureaucrats, whether it is

planning the economics of the country or applying it at the grassroots level. If this huge machine does not work properly it is not possible to complete any work in this nation. Some may raise the question, in that case what is role of politics in the administration of the nation. After taking into consideration of all aspects, we can say, directly, practically nothing. That is apart from the politicians giving some benefits to their supporters (increase in salaries of the staff, employment for party people, etc.) they cannot do anything.

We should mention the political parties do not have, nor is it possible to have, any power to influence this huge administrative machinery. It is also true that in order to get some benefits for themselves or the party the politicians are regularly approaching the administration bringing themselves practically to the level of a 'naked king'. As a result a beautiful relationship develops between the administration and politics. Therefore the concept of 'you scratch my back, I scratch yours' is an on-going work culture of the administration.

Let us accept this, because enquiries will show that this situation is prevalent in some form or the other in the democratic structures in all societies of the world. Hence in our case also it cannot be different. But then how is it that in some societies, like for example the European society, there is so much good services delivered on a daily and long-term basis by social administration?

It is true that so far in India we cannot imagine this state of the work culture prevalent in Europe. This is because we cannot imagine that the civil society can go on functioning faithfully in its administrative work with concern for the common man protecting his democratic values.

On one hand being ruled by others or being a colonial country for a long time and living under the influence of strict imperialistic society we have not been able to develop within ourselves even the minimal democratic values. On the otherhand we have not been able to spread the roots of this kind of democratic values in this huge administrative machinery of the country.

Consequently we shall see that the Hindi speaking rich farmers have used the administration for years together and got all kinds of benefits from the government without paying any taxes. Even if this may seem apparently innocent, it is always the case that the fate of crores of people is decided by the stroke of pen of some government official.

Those who are involved in politics understand this very well, but he will have to get some benefits somewhere else, and therefore out of fear accepts everything himself or suitably explains these to the party. Till today this kind of social administration is going on in all societies of the world in the name of democracy.

But even within this the work of service to humanity is comparatively better in those societies where the value systems of people intimately connected with the huge administration is much deeper, as for example in the European society. There is even a lot of noise made if there is any problem. It is exactly for this reason that we give so much importance overall to the culture of politics.

Even if we do not want to accept it is true that so far in the administration of this country the Congress culture is the only culture. It also seems hard to imagine that the social democrats, socialists, communists have been and are going around in this country for a long time, but have not been able to make any mark on this Congress culture. Then at least we would have seen even the slightest change (inspite of colossal wastage to build this country by second and third fifth year plans) in this disgraced society known as India. Though it is better to accept here that Indian now means only Indian Cricket and Indian Currency. P A S

Reflection to Contemporary Contradictions In the Mind of the Artist

Dhirendranath Gangopadhyay

Art and literature has grown out of the effort to remove the incompleteness and weakness of the existence of the individual; this is true even if partially. The ancestors tried to tame our cruel nature with the help of magic. At that time magic was like a weapon, but very much stronger. Magic is at the root of religion, science and arts. Magic was used for the benefit of the community and arts was used in the interest of the community. With the increasing development of the sense of self-independence the objectives of arts and literature also became more complicated. With his alienation from his community there grew a sense of helplessness in the mind of the individual -- there was feeling of insecurity. This naturally had its effect on literature. His desires or reluctance, his happiness or sadness, his hopes and disappointments all became subjects of arts and literature. And again security of the community and a sense of being a part of the community were also reflected in literature.

The face of arts and literature became more complex in a society full of classes. The more the conflicts between the common interest of the community and the interest of the class became more obvious and intense, it had a corresponding effect on literature also. The problems facing the artist became more serious. On one side was the pain of alienation from the outside world (nature and society), on the other side the demands of the self-development of the individual -- the conflicts of these two opposing viewpoints resulted in a clash of interests and a variety of expressions in arts and literature.

While a capitalist social system has created a situation which helps opening up conditions for the individual with an early development of arts, improvement in technological education, etc., it has also brought for him anxiety and tension by further spreading and deepening the state of alienation. The two tendencies viz., the spread of alienation and the development of individualism are particularly noticeable in literature today. At times the artist is totally immersing himself in his creation, while at times he also becomes intensely self-conscious, separates himself from his work and wants to analyse the social structure and the individual.

In all situations the artist is conscious about himself. Of course the consciousness is determined by earlier conditions and dependant on his learning. This losing oneself in emotional excitation does not mean becoming blindly influenced -- 'For make no mistake about it, work for an artist is a highly conscious, rational process at the end of which the work of art emerges as a mastered reality -- not at all a state of intoxicated inspiration.' -- to quote a modern world-renowned critic (Ernst Fischer in *The Necessity of Art*). But this is not the appropriate place for a detailed discussion on individual psychology.

The expression of the individual or self-consciousness seen in arts and literature in the first stage of alienation shows the influence of social and communal consciousness. Subjectivism is not always merely self-appreciation or self-praise. In the poetry written for Aphrodite or the songs of prayer to appease the gods we hear the echos of the primitive magical works. In that poetry the measures, beats and similarity-- all the requirements for all forms of magic

are present. When the hapless, disappointed, unsuccessful individual all together express their pain, we realise that his aim is to express allegiance for the community, to remove alienation by staging a common refrain.

The individual has been alienated from the community due to the demands for primary necessities, the virtue of lore of the magician has gradually become the artist's brush or the writer's pen. His songs have echoed the cries of alienation, his writings reflect his 'self' identity. The concert of combined voices has given way to a variety of tunes of self-realisation. The individual has been increasingly alienated from his group corresponding to the increasing strength and variety in the magical touch of his skilled hands, but inspite of this he has influenced the community and society within the confined limits of self-realisation. Consciousness about the community and society is not yet completely lost; the desire to protect his compatriots is being expressed in his eternal love-songs.

Today in this widespread state of alienation is this spark of love protected in the individual ? Will we see fire and heat when it comes in contact with the appropriate inflammable environment? What is the possibility of converting the hard and cold state of individual relationship ?

We see a special condition in modern art and literature. Analysis of alienation and determining its cause has become an integral part of the individual. To him the outside world has today become disjointed and meaningless; he is therefore trying hard looking for wealth and riches. But there also he finds inexplicable complications. Therefore his poems today are difficult to understand, his writings compositions are devoid of reality and feeling, his art is without a subject, is abstract and his plays are absurd and strange. There is no eagerness to identify himself with the community because he finds his individualism meaningless or impossible — he is unable to give hope or security to the individual. It is unlikely that some day the individual voices will be united into one voice. There is a lot of glamorous skills in the separate parts, but there is disappointment, fear, guilt, anxiety and signs of confusion in the main subject. Literary art today reflects not just indifference, but mainly the conflict with life. Opposition to society has turned into opposition to life and the writer has turned towards the wounds of the mind instead of the evil wounds of society. Even until a short time ago in the helpless cry of the divided community there was a desire to survive with others. Instead, today there is sky-high self-conceit and pride. Instead of the healthy signs of a complete individual we see the signs of a sick megalomaniac¹. This egotism is to hide the distrust in the future of the human society, intense disappointment with mankind and his inferiority complex. Or alternately, he may be totally withdrawing himself and displaying schizophrenic² behaviour. The current educated person does not want to admit the presence of alienation in the modern literature or that it is indicative of an abnormality. An abnormal mental state or mental illness is so widespread that it is becoming a normal state, and instead the healthy and satisfied individual can today be considered abnormal or ill. The realisation of social and individual values have been destroyed. There is no regard for the past, no trust in the future. Our fate is to aimlessly go around the maze of the incomprehensible present. The fatalism of the middle-ages has taken a new form today. The fate of man today is governed by machines. He had lost faith in labour, intelligence and justice. Literature today has self-pity, unsympathetic words of ridicule or self-introspection for self-criticism. Instead of a painful correction of a great tragedy we see a Stoic³ indifference. People who could be termed as ill or neurotic are today included by the critics in their new vocabulary. The term 'outsider' is a frequently used and highly respected term in arts and literature.

The flagbearers of the current peculiarities from amongst the knowledgeable have today entered or are welcomed into the portals of progressive literature. The entry to a socialist country is no longer difficult to get for these people. Today the conscience or commitment is not a problem for the established writers. No individual who is specially encouraged by his own conscience or some idealistic inspiration is a subject for literature: 'The problem of our age is not a problem of conscience or commitment. The problem is rather why people who have no personal conviction of any kind allow themselves to suffer for indefinite or undefined causes, drifting like shoals of fish into invisible nets. The problem is mass-suffering, mute and absurd ...' This quotation from Sir Herbert Read, echoes the questions raised some decades ago by George Orwell and Aldous Huxley. They want independence for these uncommitted people but they are not aware what is independence.⁴

These indications of this age are today visible and without any doubt also clear. The roots which had appeared in literature after the First World War have today become a large tree. This tree has also put its roots beyond the socialist world and into the mind of the Marxists. Their problems have today become the problems of the world. 'Positive hero' is today ridiculed. Negative talks are today the method of discussion accepted by all. Today whatever a lonely individual himself says in this world is the best form of self-expression. Abstract art is today the best example of excellence in art.

Naturally, the question arises — what does all these indicate? Are these tendencies good or bad? Do these negative or inconclusive conditions give any signs of influence on society or literary arts? Before we try to find an answer for this it is first necessary to see how the problems and conflicts of the modern age is affecting the mind of the artist. We will find a way to correct this once we know the reason.

First: On one side in the age of automation the development of technology has not only alienated the individual from society but also from his own existence, and correspondingly the publicity mechanism of the government and large industrial houses is similarly confusing his mind and turning him into 'mass-men'. The sensitive mind of the artist is today lost in the midst of these two contradictory forces.

Second : A national problem, the crisis of transition is one side making the individual a staunch nationalist and drawing him towards the history of the nation, while on the other side the mutually dependant nation and the nationalism of the countrymen, their national pride and boundaries are collapsing in the gradually shrinking world. Absorbed in a newfound internationalism and scientific humanity man today wants to dream of a new human relationship.

Third : As a result of modern scientific discoveries, the imagination of man is running in two opposite paths. On one side the unrestricted travels in the universe of sun's strength and form millions of light years distant; and on the other side his strange introductions with new basic grains amongst the tiniest of alms.

Fourth : In the context of the possibility of mass destruction from atomic effects we seen the possibility of a great power trying to save mankind from destruction.

Fifth : On the one side the display by a lucky few with a lot of wealth and on the other the silent prayers of the innumerable hungry, weak and sick people.

Man is certainly being influenced to some extent by these contradictions and conflicts in the out side world. But the literary-artists are much more influenced and concerned by the so-called much-publicised 'problems of existence'. The old faith in religion and values of the western world have today disappeared. They therefore faces an uncertain existence between birth and death. In the eyes of the bourgeoisie intelligentsia, man has become alienated from

nature since he has lost connection with his organic origins. In physical characteristics he is not different from an animal, while with his higher cerebral cortex, his sense of discrimination, he wants to go beyond his animal instincts. This has created a tremendous conflict. It is said that man is becoming increasingly unhappy and alienated from nature with the improvement in his intelligence, sense of judgement and of aesthetics. His cries of fear of death is unsettling him. 'Reason, man's blessing is also his curse, it forces him to cope everlasting with the task of solving an insolvable dichotomy.' The biggest problem for man today is the problem of existence. He has to solve this to be able to survive. But he does not have the ability to find a solution. Where is the solution for alienation between body and mind? It is not possible to identify oneself with his origins and also surpass his origins both at the same time.

This neo-Freudian culture responsible for self-destruction and absurdity in modern literary art. Modern literature is greatly influenced by philosophy of existentialism and Freudian psychopathology.

Why have these Freudian principles today so much overwhelmed the literary-artists? Why do we not see man today as a part of his own generation? Why is reality no longer portrayed today by the artist's paint brush? Why is there an effort to establish Kamu-Kafka in the land of 'socialist realism'? Why is there so much influence of Becket and the absurd drama? While writing about the activities of the artist's in the major Marxist newspapers in our country, why is there so much reference to Freudian thoughts, to quotations from Paul Elec on his reactionary thoughts? What is the reason for the praise for the mental and social attitudes in the pages of 'Mononshil' newspaper?

In answer to all these questions we can probably give one possible argument. Although an old one, the argument can probably be accepted : The progress of social consciousness has not been able to keep up with the speed of scientific developments and industrialisation. Therefore the extent and depth of alienation is going on increasing. We can no longer keep the realities within our perception. The world of Galileo, Copernicus and Newton is considerably different from the modern world of relativity, quantum and atom. The common man is alienated from the world of the scientist. That world is only one of abstract mathematical terms. Social consciousness and control can be a minor but one of the many reasons for disaster of technology. A person sitting beside the radar, with the nuclear button in his control -- his absence of social consciousness or commonsense or a momentary error can cause the end of the world. It is as if the future of man depends on some divine power outside control.

This apart the ongoing discovery in the nuclear world of materials with opposing forces is also influencing the mind of the artist. He wants to interpolate into literary arts an 'anti' for everything he sees today. Alongside anti-novel, anti-drama an antiman is also being created: I know that some bourgeoisie writers in the West are trying hard to create an antipode to man -- an anti-man. Inhumanity and cynicism are counterposed to humanism. I am horrified by the thought of a shrunken, contradictory, passive, anti-hero, a destroyed split personality that has no strength left to fight its 'minus'. A clear realisation cannot keep up with the pace of scientific discoveries, with the gathering of information and knowledge. The scientist is daily adding to his stock of innumerable new data, but correspondingly the artist is not getting new visions. It takes time to fully comprehend all the new developments, and it also depends on how correct is his understanding of this information.

The world today is being run by science and the scientist. Even until a few days ago there were the supreme leaders, those who lived in the old world. In the post-war period renowned scientists like Juliet Curie and Bernal have taken the place of Romain Rolland,

Barbus and Gorky. The writer today is not as self-confident of himself or as firm as the scientist. We can say without much doubt that the widely respected literateur is not there today. Is not the expression of anger in the literary world somewhat connected with frustration due to the loss of leadership?

We have to accept that the influence of the literary world is gradually declining. The supremacy of the second signalling system (in Pavlovian terms) of the brain is today well-established. The inquisitive mind of man is being excited by space-travel, by his mechanical mind. There is no point in reading the usual writings to understand life; the policy of the serious reader will have to be to take a philosophical view to find the value of life or the reasons for the problems of existence. Cinema, radio, TV or other similar sources are available for his amusement. Science cannot show him the way to truth which is generally acceptable. Literature is unsuccessfully trying to be popular by going deep into the interior overcoming the boundaries of race, class and community. The artist and the writer is not able to correctly assess the mentality of the readers of this generation. In trying to keep up with the pace of mental changes he is being superficial or he is going deep without accepting the change. To quote Ilya Errenburgh, we can say ; ' The literature and art of today have not yet embraced these tremendous changes which have already occurred in the spiritual world of the reader and the spectator. The writer today is lost without a contact with the reader.'

But does this still give us a complete answer? What do we see when we turn our sights away from outside world which is beyond our intelligence and outside our control and go to the inner world? Our intellect and consciousness is influenced and controlled by the lack of knowledge of the individual and the community. We do not have the power of any self-control or to take any independent decision. The outside world is controlled by machines and the inner world full of fools. The independence of desire and practice is controlled by bureaucracy and the independence of thought is governed like animals. We are helpless, powerless and incompetent. We are prisoners in a world created by ourselves. This search of the human mind has become the reason for self-torture.

Man uprooted by centrifugal force is today thrown out of any connections with society and confined to narcissism. He is desperately trying to find a shelter for himself giving up all the historical connections. Another question that arises is what is the reason for considering man today as only a 'psychological being' instead of a 'social being' ? Why is there a tendency towards Freudian theory of unconscious instead of the Marxian theory of reflection judging mental health. As a result, are we not succumbing in the efforts to portray man as a machine who is active and follows rules? The origin of alienation is natural, not historical -- the publicity that it is neo-Freudian is perhaps only helping to maintain those who have lost hope and are obstructing progress.

In my view the Marxists were not able to give much attention to the individual psychology of man in the earlier part of the post-socialist revolution period. In the eagerness to show man as a predominantly social being there was tendency to use the results mechanically and immediately. As a result the superficial practice of socialistic realities in many cases made literary art comparable to publicity.⁵ As a result of including the individual as a part of the social structure the socialist man was in many cases seen in an inferior form. Since more attention was given to economic factors while analysing the mind of the individual and of society, ignoring their conflicting relationship and their mutual dependence. The result is that, Pavlovian neurosciences have not been fully developed.

Man driven by his deep animal instincts tries to find his own comforts, the nature of man

cannot be changed or the individual of this age is an automated machine -- for a writer influenced by bourgeois mentality, this is bound to result in the futile and incomplete efforts. For an individual driven by the mechanical world he is unable to take a total view on life. Mind-body parallelism and theory of individual versus collective unconsciousness reflects the modern compartmentalised view of life.

'The individual can not help his age; he can only express that it is doomed.' -- The promises we had heard in literature in the first stages of alienation, are today in its final stages -- its overall effect fast disappearing from the sky. At first sight it seems as though physical sciences are freshly discovering the outside world, and psychology has entered the depths of the internal world and lost its way in the mysteries of its darkness. So the artists with an imagination are therefore unable to find a way to associate with the outside world, particularly with its society and community. It is therefore a futile effort to understand this breakup using any of the earlier methods. He is also unable to find any new methods. The literature is also not able to get a proper impression in his mind of the fast changing social scenario.

Today the scientist has a substitute for the brain and has the facility for making new discoveries in many new fields with the help of instruments which are an improvement on the power of the human brain. The artist does not have that opportunity. He has therefore chosen the vast ocean-like path of philosophy, divorced from reality; or the simple theory of incentive reaction of the pragmatic people. The writer is at times directly ignoring or not accepting the reality and at other times he considers the human being as something mechanical and a slave of his surroundings. In the present critical situation, the all-round desire for savings, the era of senseless cruelty, in this stage of extreme alienation, we do not see any indication of the beginnings of good times.

The method of removing alienation in society is moving ahead on its own. This snail-like progress of history should be further examined and followed up.

Man has a lot of hope on science in this nuclear and automation age. Although there is a qualitative difference, the hopes have some similarity with the faith and dependence on magical powers seen in the olden times. There is a faint but definite influence of modern science on very recent literary arts. Science and literary arts -- the future anxiously awaits the effect of the ancient magical powers on both of them. Today in the new historic situation we see the possibility of the alienation of intelligence and emotion disappearing, and the possibility of a fusion of the breakup. In this age of science we are going to see the brain becoming more passionate and fair. We see a revolutionary flood of change coming in the nature of opinion and expression of the literary artist to meet the demands of the changed perception of the reader and the spectator. The severity of the perception of the artist will again be reflected in his life -- this hope is not a distant imagination but a scientifically based inference. The artist who depends on science will now get a realisation -- 'Man is capable of creating situations he wants and needs', -- then literature will not only express the dangers of nuclear destruction, 'Man with his unlimited power is weak and powerless' -- the writer will no longer accept this self-contradictory statement as self-evident. When he becomes familiar with the source of modern psychology, he will then realise that the constant changes in self-contradictory situations create intense self-contradictory conditions, negative stimulus then builds up an opposite positive meaningful reaction, and an active fearless reaction overcomes inactively due to great fear. This scientific understanding will encourage him towards a new creation. Then he will no longer consider continuing alienation as inevitable and cannot be

opposed.

The brain of different people become naturally weak or most of the time remain in a stage of inhibition. In the case of partial inhibition, some other part is activated and thus maintains a balance, yet a total change is delayed. But in total inhibition the all-pervading alienation of today is somewhat comparable to the slumber of *Kumbhakarna*. As soon as he wakes up we will see a flurry of activity, a cry for unity and related actions; and all this will see the end of alienation. Dullness and excitement are mutually fulfilling and involved in the conflicting rules of the brain. Ripples of excitement are hidden within the visible waves of activity, the large possibility of unity is hidden within widespread alienation. The literary artist will have to take an active interest and effort to make this possibility a success, a reality.

1. A patient of megalomania has a very strong sense of self-pride. The more helpless he feels as an alienated self the more he finds himself immersed by the triangle of heaven, earth and hell ready for sacrifice. Hitler can be considered as a classic example of a 'megalomaniac' of the modern day.
2. A patient of schizophrenia feels confused or lost in the midst of the conflicts of the external mundane world. The conflicts and divisions between the production facilities in a socialistic situation and the misappropriation of profit in an autocratic situation is reflected in a patient of schizophrenia. In modern literature, particularly in poetry, the inconsistency between the total situation and its parts is considered as indicators in a patient of schizophrenia. The poetry will withdraw himself as this conflict intensifies. May be in the not too distant future he will try to express himself with a few familiar terms as a schizophrenic patient.
3. Stoic -- A follower of the Greek philosopher Zeno; one unaffected by happiness and grief.
4. It has been said about the modern British playwrights and dramatists: But it is perhaps sign of the times, and no mere coincidence, that they should all share the same basic theme; the under-mining of order by chaos -- to put it one way -- or the revolt articulate or inarticulate, intelligent or instinctive, of the individual against any social framework. As an example we can quote Samuel Beckett : But what matter whether I was born or not, have lived or not, am dead or merely dying. I shall go on doing as I have always done, not knowing what it is I do, nor who I am, nor where I am, nor if I am.
5. Proletcult movement may be mentioned here.

(written in July 1966).

Translated from Bengali by **Pradip Sen**

P A S

Psychiatrist

Dhirendranath

Basu Dev Mukherjee

[We consider Dhirendranath (alienist ?) as one of the leading pioneers of psychiatry in India. In the first issue of this magazine we had included a general discussion about his life; where it had also referred to his teacher academician Pavlov. The main purpose of that discussion was to give an introduction to his personality. The first of so-called Bengali renaissance, Dhirendranath had many introductions -- he was a psychiatrist, a dramatist, an author on science in Bengali, Pavlovian psychologist, editor of the Bengali journal Manabmon, a Marxist social scientist, and many more. But over all other introductions, being a psychiatrist can claim to be one of the fundamental ones. Amongst all the psychiatrists who have worked for long time in India Dhirendranath was the outstanding and unique. But this was not known outside the circle of his patients who had benefited. On the other hand, he had established a new school of thought (gharana) in the field of psychiatric treatment. In this article we shall try to demonstrate how this trend flowered with the thoughts and expertise of Dhirendranath. Ed. PAS]

It was 1950 when Dr. Dhirendranath Ganguly(1911-1998) started his practice in psychiatry in

Calcutta; at that time psychiatry was not a very popular field of medical practice. The opportunity to take advantage of treatment of mentally-affected was limited to only a few in numbers. Besides, anybody known to be mentally affected was marked with a social stigma. But the work did not spread until the outdoor departments of Medical Colleges started regular treatment of the mentally affected people. This happened after our independence. Until then, the more seriously affected people were termed as dangerous under the Lunacy Act, and confined to jails or asylums. As a result they remained out of sight of the public. Besides, many educated people were also convinced that the influence of ghosts, and evil spirits (possessive state) can result in mental illnesses. Hence, use of amulets, gems, peace-offerings etc., were well established practices for treatment of such conditions. It is not that the condition is much better today; but the situation is slowly changing.

Just about this time Dhirendranath started his practice in psychiatry using a novel method. If he wanted he would have associated himself with the psychiatry unit of any medical college in this State, and like many others got a foreign degree of being a specialist in this subject and returned to start a roaring practice. But he did not do that. The reason for this is not very clear to us, and we can only make a guess. Mentally he was a very independent person. Besides the people with whom he came in contact at the time (Dr. Jyotirmoy Sharma, Dr. Somnath Mukherjee and others) were all Marxist followers and had private practices. Hence it was probably more convenient for him to practice on his own, particularly keeping in mind the use of Pavlovian neurological methods in his work. As a result he could not make any mark in formal psychiatry in this State or even in the Country.

Before Dhirendranath, the person who had given some original thought to psychiatry or psychology in India was Dr. Girindrasekhar Basu (1887-1953). Although he was not a strict follower of Freudian principles, he was still known as the person who formed the Psychoanalytical society of India. He started his medical practice after completing his medical education from Calcutta Medical College at the age of 29 years. At that time he had just been introduced to the name and works of Freud through magazines. An English edition of Freud's work first came to this country in 1921. Girindrasekhar was in the first batch of M.Sc. students in psychology in Calcutta University (1915). He first started in general practice and then added on psychiatry also. His thesis for D.Sc. was *Concept of Repression* (1921). He had sent this to Freud who highly acclaimed the work. It can be said that Girindrasekhar was the first Indian who started practice in psychiatry in Calcutta.

Later Girindrasekhar joined in teaching and research work at Calcutta University. In 1930 he started psychiatric treatment at R.G.Kar Medical College (then Carmichael) and later in 1940 established Lumbini Park Hospital on land given by his elder brother Rajsekhar. In course of time this became a major centre for teaching in psychiatry in this region, since till then Calcutta University had not started the course in psychiatry. It is gathered that Girindrasekhar used all indigenous and western treatment methods to heap the problems of the patients. He also regularly used hypnosis for treatment.

He has written a total of eight books in English and Bengali. He has published 42 articles in English journals in India and overseas. This apart he has many articles in literature and popular science topics which are of a fairly high standard and have been recognised as fundamental writings at the time. Throughout his life he had tried to identify Freud in Indian culture and traditions. In this he had a strong attraction towards Freud, and at the same time we see many tussles. However it can be said that he has no publications on major psychiatric disorders.

A number of minor and major publications in Bengali on psychology and psychiatry started appearing from the latter part of the nineteenth century. But the centre for psychological studies which Girindrasekhar established in the nineteenth century (though under the Calcutta University) was qualitatively different both in its quality and skill. Later his student Tarun Chandra Singha started publishing a journal called *Chitta*, but it did not last very long.

From early nineteenth century arrangements for asylum were started in Calcutta for psychiatric patients; but psychiatric treatment was started on a regular basis in the post-independence stage after the psychiatry divisions started functioning in the various medical colleges.

On the otherside, if we have to talk about the developments on the treatment of psychological problems around the world, it has to be mentioned that in Europe and America under the leadership of biological research psychiatric treatments were developing like any other department of medicine in the hospitals. Freud (1856-1939) also went to America and established psychoanalysis (at the 1909 Conference at Clarke University). The principles of psychoanalysis, which did not get any recognition earlier in Europe, spread around the world particularly amongst the educated people after these principles were recognised in America. Again, practically as a protest against this, behavioural science got publicity and spread in America as a result of the work of Watson, the father of modern behavioural science and later of Skinner. It was seen that in this widespread and amazing development of psychiatry in the under-developed countries like ours was influenced by biological psychiatry of the European schools, and work continued in the different hospitals based on this, where treatment was confined to the use of a few medicines or with E.C.T. . However, along with biological psychiatry, psychoanalysis and behavior therapy have been imported from America into these under-developed countries. But the specialists here were not very knowledgeable how the two different principles of psychology and psychiatry could be combined, and as a result they continued in their own separate ways. The educational institutes have been teaching a very outdated principles of psychoanalysis and recently in some places may also have incorporated behavioral science with it. The most serious thing is social sciences have no connection with the theoretical teachings and the practical applications. Hence in reality psychiatry is prevalent everywhere as a form of biological psychiatry. The worldwide development of psychiatry in the twentieth century can therefore be summarised as follows.

1. In the beginning Freud influenced the entire world with his principles of Psychoanalysis and his 'talking cure' gradually became the accepted treatment for psychological problems.
2. In course of time the principles of psychoanalysis eroded substantially due to the influence of the bio-psycho-social theories and the traditional psychiatrists established their own schools giving emphasis to their own ideas.
3. Work on military psychiatry started after the end of the First World War and this was the first time work on any form of community psychiatry taking a particular shape.
4. Community mental health movement has made a beginning -- special departments have been started in hospitals and medical colleges for mentally affected people.
5. Research on antihistamine group of drugs have led to invention of antipsychotic and antidepressant group of drugs and these are being widely used.
6. Around the 60's lithium was first used for treatment and this first showed the way that psychiatric problems can be treated as well as prevented.
7. The influence of psychoanalysis has re-emerged and competing with it is German diag-

nostic system and Gestalt psychology.

8. Gradually an accepted method for treatment of psychiatry cases has been started in hospitals.
9. It has been possible to create an environment to free chronic psychiatry patients from the mental health centres, Jails and asylums.
10. Efforts have been made to popularise psychotherapy.
11. Biological psychiatry and psychotherapy are being integrated.

This is the situation at present. But it must be said that from the beginning psychiatry was treated like an orphan and as a result throughout this century it has overwhelmed with various external influences. As examples 1. Freud took the help of physics to save his theory of metapsychology (Law of Conservation of Energy). 2. System theory and cybernetics is being regularly used to confirm psychiatric diagnosis. 3. That biotechnology or genetic engineering may be useful for treatment of psychological cases has had a great influence on psychiatry. 4. External influences are continually affecting psychiatric practice, particularly in psychotherapy.

From all this we can conclude that no single theory is enough to assess or analyse a person or remove his problems relating to distressed condition. As a result at times it has shown a kind of overall philosophical crisis, which has given birth to different forms of changed ideas like structuralism, postmodernism, feminism, etc.. Put simply these can be termed as crisis of spiritual people, which has been particularly seen after the Second World War. While they have lost confidence in the established beliefs, the unforeseen advance in science and technology has created immense opportunities for material improvements for individuals. But man is gradually becoming alienated, lonely and without companions. Therefore the effort to unite man remains unaffected by forming new paradigms without relying on the old paradigms and thereby creating new perceptions or philosophies.

In this context we have to keep in mind that in backward societies like ours various forms of blindfaith and superstitions get embedded in our minds from childhood days. They later flower with the right environment and condition. It is true that we cannot explain various worldly incidents and for this from our childhood days we get strange suggestions from strange ideas which remain in our mind. As a result, even after reaching adulthood scientific ideas probably get transformed into parapsychology in the case of many educated people. The outstanding example of this is the famous film director Satyajit Roy, son of the outstanding father of scientific culture in our society, Sukumar Roy, and his belief in a life before birth ('Sonar Kella').

It has been seen that in any advanced society, in addition to psychology, the functioning of what we understand as the normal mental state plays a significant role in the total lifestyle and development of society. This means that a ring of backward and unscientific thoughts and ideas can be created in the minds of the common man which leave alone general mental state, it also forms an environment where different kinds of psychic beliefs can be formed about the behaviour and activities of the human being. As a result it becomes difficult for normal logic and judgement to find a place in the mind of the common man. In fact it is also possible that for decades on end man can remain in darkness. We can say that Dhirendranath is the foremost pioneer of having worked on this subject in any society of India. Throughout his life he fought against these obscurantist ideas through his lectures, holding seminars and workshops, publishing papers and books, even through informal discussion (addas). The seriousness he gave to this work can be realised from the fact that at the slightest opportunity he

would always say a few words on this obscurantism. He would also immediately pull up anybody around him (of whatever stature) who showed any weakness for this obscurantism. To him any prejudice about psychology and a backward mentality fell in the same category. It is difficult even to guess how much conviction of mind is necessary to be devoted like this through his entire life.

While on the subject we must keep in mind that when working with psychiatry patients, he would never do anything which would affect their trust. I had initially faced a lot of difficulty because of this. I later learnt that in this way he had resolved the conflict between, to use terms from our science, ultimate value premises versus proximate value premises. We can also call this the conflict between momentary truth and permanent truth. We can use a number of examples to show that Dhirendranath has used God as a weapon to convince someone who believes in God. Once when a lady from the royal family of Bhawal came for treatment of depression, Dhirendranath had argued with her about *Gita* continuously for one hour. The lady was well educated and whatever arguments she put forward quoting *Gita*, Dhirendranath would counter-argue again quoting from *Gita*. Also, I have regularly heard him making such suggestions like, 'you believe in God; God is a well-wisher, He certainly is able to feel your problems and troubles. 'Then he would regularly advise patients thinking of committing suicide, 'Whoever has given you this life is the only person who has the right to take this life, and nobody else. Remember, whether it is your own or of anyone else, taking away life is a great sin.' I used to get surprised by this behaviour of his before getting used to it. For example when he would tell somebody seeking help, 'Being a Brahmin I am blessing you, all your sufferings will go away,' I used to be surprised. Now in practical life I understand when elderly people appealingly say, 'please let me touch your feet, and bless me. I will get well then. You are like a God.' In this kind of a situation hurting the feelings of a patient is like pushing him further towards pain. But there was never an instance where he would let go a patient who voluntarily wanted to know or understand something. In fact if he found that many patients were waiting outside and he cannot give time then, he would ask him to come back at a less busy time and then spend 4-5 hours with him talking continuously; I have seen this happening regularly in his working life. On the contrary we would feel upset if we went to him with some work and could not get it done.

In fact the advanced view at that time on major psychological matters was anybody diagnosed with mental illness must be admitted at Ranchi Mental Hospital. Post-independence, and particularly amongst the people in the Eastern Area, the Ranchi Institution had played a significant role regarding the treatment of psychiatric cases admitted there. But it must be mentioned that at that time what was known as psychiatric treatment in our country was to keep the patient tied up and administer shock therapy -- in other words to send them into exile and later when there is some medicine available in the market to use it as much and in whatever way you like. Dhirendranath started his professional career in this environment. At that time the only instrument he had for treatment was the research work on the higher nervous system by Pavlov (1846-1936) titled 'Hypnotic Suggestion Therapy' (hereafter referred to as 'Suggestion').

In the initial stages for excitement everybody prescribed Bromide and for depression Caffeine for treatment, and Dhirendranath followed the same procedure. Later we saw the emergence of Reserpine and ECT or shock-therapy. But right from the beginning he was strongly opposed to treat psychiatry patients only with medicines. To him the human being has emerged as a result of the confluence of three streams -- social science, psychology and

biology. Throughout his life he nurtured his professional work with these thoughts and beliefs and has enriched daily psychiatric treatment methods by integrating these with the different areas of humanities. Anybody can appreciate these by listening to his suggestions. To carry on working with such dedication in an uncertain profession throughout one's lifetime is rare not only in our country but in all countries. I am calling it 'uncertain' because at that time psychiatry as a profession, leave aside getting recognition had not even sown its seed. In spite of this Dhirendraah started his work and went ahead in this way.

Gradually, medicines for psychiatry treatment started coming into the market (in 1952 Chlorpromazine first came into the French market). He also was prescribing the new medicines, but in a very small doses. We shall discuss later his own arguments in this matter. There is no doubt that there was a qualitative improvement in his professional work as a result of using the medicines, and he would acknowledge this also. But he did not make his ideas and methods solely dependent on medicines. Instead, whenever possible, he would try to avoid using medicines to alleviate the problems. Whenever he saw a patient and felt only suggestion was necessary, he will never prescribe any medicine. In these cases one could feel from his behaviour and movements that using medicines for psychiatric cases was similar to accepting defeat. As a result he would scold any patient who wanted to know anything about the use of medicines. One can say he would be forced to prescribe any medicine if there was no other alternative. It can be said in this context that Dhirendranath wanted to complete through suggestion what is today known as cosmetic psychopharmacology. For example a particular behaviour of a person may fall within normal range of variation like he may be very ill-tempered or somewhat neurotic, but in his surroundings this behaviour is undesirable, unwanted or unrewarding and therefore wanted to use some medicines to remove these traits. Dhirendranath would use suggestion in such cases. We have seen many cases where candidates wanted to be mentally prepared to face a major competitive examination and would come to him for suggestion. He would prepare a cassette for them.

This apart various side effects were also seen in patients due to uncontrolled and excessive use of medicines. He would feel highly embarrassed with this. He would also keep a close watch to make sure that the patient, alongside the use of medicines, is able to maintain his work-abilities. But towards the end of his working life a number of new medicines had come into the market, and with their much lower level of side effects he appeared to depend a little more on medicines than previously. An overall despondent situation was certainly a reason for this -- we shall discuss this further later on. But it has to be said here that though he was totally disappointed with the condition of the national and international experts particularly the Marxist followers, till the last day of his life he remained unmoved in his philosophical thoughts and ideas.

Philosophical Thoughts and Ideas

It is necessary to say a few words to explain what exactly I mean by philosophical thoughts and ideas. This is because it is needless to say that psychology and psychiatry has been influenced for a long time by different philosophical thoughts (particularly of the West). In the midst of this it is not easy to stay firm in one's own philosophy till the last day of his life. Towards the later days of his working life he would repeatedly say something in very simple words which clearly expressed his worldview on philosophy. Later after consideration I realised that the source for this was Pavlov. He would say something like, 'The different expressions of idealistic thoughts which you see are all projections into the external world or objective world

of what is happening in our inner world. Different kinds of philosophies are constantly being formed from these, and just opposite this resides the philosophy we know as dialectical materialism.'

I have said earlier Dhirendranath was a Marxist in its broadest sense, but he did not follow Marxism blindly like a religious dogma. I personally learned from him the essence of the term, 'Freedom is the recognition of necessity'. Marxism was never a blind faith to him. It was a methodology and a source of knowledge to him. He deeply experienced the historical determinism of the Marxist principles and the indeterminism in various incidents and experiences in his own life. The cycle of inductive and deductive logic, the method of generalizations and specifications of psychiatric disease classification, the identity of the dissimilar or the dissimilarity of the similars are examples of his conviction, which have taught us the internalization process in our day to day worldly knowledge and experiences. Of course there were normal and abnormal mental condition -- problems regularly troubled him and similar matters agitated him throughout his life and on which he could not find solutions to many questions during his lifetime. Whenever he got the opportunity he would be eager to discuss these problems with anybody. But he had a wonderful openness about the matter, as a result of which he could easily go on discussing with any Marxist of whatever colour. As a result even after spending a length of time discussions with him many found it difficult to understand his political stand. It is strange but true -- around 1970 he had anticipated the situations Russia and China are experiencing today and had shared these with people close to him. I have even heard him saying, 'Socialism will not come to these riff-raff countries, the first successful socialism will be in America.' It is fact that listening to him at that time, we used to consider him as a 'reactionary'. But today at every stage we realise the depth and extent of his thoughtfulness. Nobody should conclude from these that he would show disrespect to any form of Marxist worker. His nature was exactly the opposite. He did not work at the lowest level and therefore sincerely liked all party activist and even fed them at his home and whenever necessary gave them shelter also. Dhirendranath respected their 'iron determinism' (in the words of the respected Gopal Halder). Yet here I have not found a solution to one question.

He had never done any menial labour himself. He would jokingly say, 'In my life I have never carried a shopping bag.' But Pavlov himself gave considerable importance to, and also went through menial labour. Dhirendranath much preferred and also took part in intellectual work. Is this a characteristic which is specific to the Brahmins of our country? Because in our society the Brahmins look down on any form of menial labour. For this reason they have never been able to do any hands-on practical work in science. A surprising exception to this was Vidyasagar who had said that he would sell vegetables in the market if he was ever unemployed. We cannot think on these about Dhirendranath. The matter becomes more relevant in the context of forming an association or by training students and going ahead with his scientific work. Here we can put the example of famous scientist Meghnad Saha, this in a situation where even to form a small association one has to do everything himself. Is it because of this failure that Dhirendranath could not organise his Institution properly? Even in his personal academic affairs he was considerably disorganised and on this he was not at all methodical and in fact was always dependant on others. For example his first book 'Bichchinnatar Bhabishyath' (The Future of Alienation) was printed under the supervision and initiative of Arunachal Bose, the poet, when he had advanced in age, and it must be said that the Bengali society only then came to know how high was his stature. About this he admitted, 'This work

could not be completed without the perseverance of Arunachal.'

In a different way, it can also be said that he was a very obstinate person, and if he decided to do anything he would not give up without completing it. Also, if he disagreed with anybody even in the slightest way he would cut off connections with him or them. He would always do whatever he considered appropriate. He would quietly and silently go on with his work in his own way out of anybody's sight (perhaps this is a characteristic of such people). Compared to Pavlov who liked to continuously stick to one particular work Dhirendranath liked to work on different subjects at the same time, -- this is evident from the method of his working. But probably temperamentally he was not able to organise all this work properly and give it a proper shape. This particularly comes to mind when I think of the work on psychotherapy started by him. On this subject he was qualified to be one of the top level psychiatrists of the world; but he was not successful due to lack of proper documentation. This apart, whatever he had achieved throughout his life made him competent to write a book on Pavlovian psychology to psychiatry and it is not that he did not see the necessity for this. But he could not do it because he involved in various subjects. But overall he was a learned person and gave due respect to all educated people irrespective of their field or vocation. I remember once he was charmed by the learning of Ananya Roy, the 22 year old son of Manindra Roy, the poet. However, he had a serious complaint about the professional politicians of our society -- that apart from memorising a few slogans they do not study anything. Sometimes he would sadly say, in his times people had to understand Marxism by reading *Capital* but today one can be a Marxist by learning a few quotations. He would also talk about another subject in a very simple way, and I understand now the importance of what he said.

I have already said earlier that to him 'ultimate value premises' was an important benchmark to assess an individual. In his view in this assessment our Marxist politicians do not have that ultimate value premise. This is because they have grown up reading publicity material on Marxism, not the history of science or the science itself and as a result in reality they have a very immature idea of what exactly is 'Scientific Humanism', our ultimate value premises. When I first heard him saying this, considering the importance of politics I could not accept it at that time; but now I understand the significance of his words for the purpose of preparing inside us a process of logical bent or a process of scientific attitude for creating a mind for overall ultimate value premise.

Nearly all of us have been influenced by Western teachings in our own professional education. As a result in our science education we have been more influenced by the Western approach to science. There we find two main directions. One is a Platonic world-view -- where apart from what we see around us importance is also given to aspects deeply embedded in our mind like intuition, introspection, unconscious drive etc. and on the other side there is the Aristotelian world-view -- where the external influence of the five senses are only acknowledged for the purpose of acquiring knowledge. Surprisingly it is seen that throughout the world these two views have somehow found importance in the history of psychology and psychiatry. For example Freud and his followers have been influenced by the Platonic view in their work on psychology. And under the influence of Aristotelian philosophy has been formed psychiatry also known behavioural science, a branch of medical science based on biology (Adolph Mayer 1866-1950). Although unfortunately Pavlov is also identified with this behavioural science, but this is totally incorrect from all aspects. This is because according to the Pavlovian philosophy, psychology is the study of whole human nature, i.e., adaptive, preadaptive, non-adaptive (not only behaviour). If we say Behaviour it connotes mechanically only what we see. But

students of Pavlov see psychology with a much wider world-view.

However, what we can say here is that in our domestic culture we accept the characteristics of *Upanishad*, *Gita*, Vivekananda, Arambinda and such others in the same way as water, air and light and we can easily assume that it does not create any difficulties in our day to day professional lives. Rather, it helps to accept as our fate or destiny similar to the introspection of Platonic idealistic thoughts. From this point of view it can be said that in our country most of the scientists see Science in the same way as the apron they wear in the laboratory (although in that sense it is not appropriate to consider medical practitioners as pure scientists). And in the same context it can be said that amongst the entire medical fraternity of our country Dhirendranath was a wonderful exception and a protest personified. It should be mentioned further that during my tenure of long thirty years with him I have not seen any trace of religious belief in his family. It is indeed a remarkable incidence in a Brahmin family in his time.

In a wider perspective he believed in Marxism (according to him Marx is a deeply learned humanist). It sounds better to say that he was a Marxist social scientist. He had extensively studied the subject, and could easily surpass any Marxist scholar. We understand dialectical materialism as the principle of Marxism. He considered Lenin's book 'Materialism, Empirio-Criticism' as the ideal. Other Marxist experts considered this world-renowned Pavlovian theory, the second signalling system (formation of language), invaluable for building up a world view. As a result even though the true Marxists may not have understood the scientific research work of Pavlov, or perhaps mechanically followed them, it certainly had an additional importance or weight. (In this context I gratefully remember at least one person close to me, Gopal Halder who knew and appreciated the extraordinary work being done by our 'Doctorbabu'). As a result, I do not know how much the Marxists understood him, but they certainly bowed to him from a distance. This is because on the one hand he was a learned Marxist and social scientist, and on the other hand he was a Pavlovian psychologist. On the other hand it is unfortunate but true that although Dhirendranath spent such a long time in Calcutta studying Pavlov, but in spite of there being innumerable communist parties in the city nobody could reap home the benefits of his work.

Anyway, there certainly was a bit of problem on the political status of Dhirendranath, he did not exactly want to be a tail of the party. But he also dealt with the 'mind' of the individual. This in a situation where the Marxists always talked in terms of the 'mind' of people collectively and never brought into any discussion the mind of the individual. As if that was a despicable and wrong thing to do. I had heard a story from him. At that time with the enthusiasm of some workers of the undivided communist party a big argument had started in the office of the journal *Parichay* under the guidance of the well-known historian Sushobhan Sarkar, about this 'individual mind' and 'collective mind'. All the imposing intelligent people were on one side with Dhirendranath on the other side. These discussion sessions were held on a number of occasions and Dhirendranath had to fight bitterly to clear up the misgivings of a few thousand year old ideas keeping Marx in the forefront. He had to raise his voice to say that *Sara Ripu* (six vices) will not go away from the mind of man just by revolutions about the class struggle. It will take a thousand years to remove the proprietary mentality from the mind of the individual. Dhirendranath had to spend a lot of effort to make these party comrades understand, something for which Marx or Lenin did not find the time, but they were also eager to know about the individual. Anyway, at the end of these heated discussions it was seen that Dhirendranath was failure with the intelligentsia and comrades of the party and

he was on his own. Even then Dhirendranath did not give up. To enlighten the world of these half-educated, frogs in the well he published the journal *Manabmon*. And in this journal year after year he published international level articles in Bengali on human psychology and social psychology.

This way from the philosophical point of view he had to fight on a number of fronts. Bringing to the forefront various pragmatist (from philosophical angle) psychologists like from Freud to Adler, Yung, Kamu, Kafka and others anti-communist publicity has been going on during the fifth, sixth and seventh decades of the last century in various forms mainly from America. He has fought against all this practically single-handedly in this Bengal and through the Bengali language. Many Marxists did not like his feverish activities about 'individual psychology'. Dhirendranath had to resort to his pen to make them understand. Revolutionary extremists appeared on various occasions with their revolutionary principles. He had to use a lot of effort to make them understand. What has to be said is in all these struggles to him psychiatry became practically the main issue. This is because most of the time all the people in these groups (who probably felt humiliated to present themselves as a patient) would come to him with the pretext of depression or anxiety and harass him presenting their own principles. He would say, 'There are a number of blindspots in the minds of our socially conscious educated people which would take a lot of time to remove. And for this our socio-cultural influence is responsible.' He had himself and alone handled all this opposition. And he also had to alone look after his own medical practice. He did not have any help or assistance for this. Let me just mention in this context that according to Marxist principles in all these arguments, logic is the science of structure and it is the skeleton of thought and existence. This logic is of two types, one of which is Logic of Classifications of objective phenomena or external appearances, which we call formal logic. And the other is Logic of Change of this objective phenomena, or dialectical logic. The limitation of formal logic is that after a stage we do not get any further knowledge from it. As a result we have to think of the changed situation or dialectical logic.

Psychiarist Dhirendranath saw formal logic as a classification of the normal or abnormal psychological status, and dialectical logic as the 'essence of adaptational distress' of the normal and abnormal mind. Therefore we have to examine how he was able to resolve in his own way these two subjects, because the two logic together form the entire circle of our knowledge. We will be able to understand from this discussion to what extent Dhirendranath was successful in completing this circle.

In this context I consider it appropriate to mention one thing, during the sixties and seventies student struggles and revolutions by the New Left Youth were taking place throughout the world. As a result later many student-youth were suffering from various illnesses and came to Dhirendranath for treatment. He had carefully studied the youth of this period. He had prepared considerable volume of documents on this and these have later been published in a book form. About his experiences at this time he would say -- ascetic, leftist-extremist, one who has abandoned his home, gypsy, adventurer are all emotional people (with preponderance of First Signalling System) and such people are all in one class. They could possibly have some genetical similarity. He would particularly give importance to social-reforms and politics and say -- Our familiar ascetics and the leftist-extremists are of the same class. They are very sensitive and therefore cannot tolerate social unfairness and oppression. For this reason once they had formed a secret terrorist group and later when they could not have such success, built a hermitage (ashram) and stayed there, not being able to return to their homes.

The ideals of religion, of social-reforms and politics all became similar to them. At that time we would jokingly say, 'Sir, now has the secular NGO taken the place of that hermitage.' He would smile at this.

The philosophical ideas which he learnt from his teacher Pavlov about human mind were like this. The human mind is essentially resident within the brain and its individual nerve-cells are extremely sensitive. They can lose their properties even with the slightest injury from external environment and therefore to protect them they become in a phase of inhibition very fast (protective inhibition). In the living world our nerve-cells require the maximum rest and when our mind experiences any form of limitless distress beyond the adaptational capacity of our nervous system, the cells undergo a functional or organic disorder, and the only treatment is to give them rest. The essential core of the workings of the human mind is the force, mobility, equilibrium etc. of the reaction to its natural excitement and inhibition process.

(To be concluded) **P A S**

An Outline of Dialectico-Historical Materialism

Dhrubajyoti Majumdar

[Over more than 40 years, *Manabmon* the journal in Bengali of Pavlov Institute has established itself for introducing the modern theories and trends in biology, anthropology, sociology and psychology. In this we have always been guided by the synthesis of theory and practice of dialectics of the inherent philosophical world-view. And explanation and analysis of the science of dialectics have been published in *Manabmon* at various times in its different forms. We feel that the present article follows the same tradition -- as the use of dialectical science is essential to understand properly the present international situation, full of dangers. Particularly, why socialistic efforts are going backwards throughout the world -- its correct explanation will only be found through dialectical thoughts. It is not possible to explain any kind of change in the structure of formal logic -- this Marxist theory will also help us move ahead in our practical life. Ed. PAS]

Karl Marx has himself said -- his single basic and most distinctive contribution is probably the definition of materialism in history. Of course there has been considerable controversy on the actual significance of this definition. According to many, the dialectical analysis by Marx was made only in the context of the history of mankind; therefore extending it outside this area is quite irrelevant. According to those who support this view, it was essentially Friedrich Engels who applied dialectics to the world of nature. And following this discussion, they had also suggested a distinction between Marx and Engels. However it is not considered necessary to enter into any controversy for the purposes in this article. In fact we do not agree that there is any fundamental difference in the views of Marx and Engels. Moreover we also do not accept any mechanical boundary or distinction between dialectical materialism and historical materialism. It is for this reason that we, conjointly, are using the term 'dialectico-historical materialism'. This will get further clarified in due course.

First, by using the word 'history' in its widest sense, we are accepting that 'natural history' and 'social history' is a continuous process. In our view, this in fact is the scientific view. With this wider use of the word 'history', the main objective of the materialistic definition

of the Marxists was -- the purpose of the organic and social evolution of the material world is within the great universe, that is from the dialectical occurrences or chain of events in the total natural organic world. Marx himself has said: Hegel had established the science of dialectics; I am straightening it up. The statement proves that the dialectic thoughts of Marx was not restricted only to the social history of man. Hegel had tried to explain the evolution of the universe from the imagined absolute ideas through dialectical process. Marx has explained the birth of the universe beginning from the material world through social dialectics. This in summary is the dialectical science of Marxism.

Actually, neither Marx nor Engels was the originator of the science of dialectics. Neither was it Hegel. It has been evolved through the multi-faceted socio-historic struggle of man. Philosophers from Plato to Hegel have tried to limit this scientific principle within the boundary of spiritualism. On the other hand, materialistic thoughts were essentially confined within the realms of being mechanical. In the interest of advancement of society Marx and Engels have made materialism as conforming to the science of dialectics; and through this it (science of dialectics) has achieved a historic reality. In the words of Lenin: The science of dialectics covers both the theory of Logic and the theory of Knowledge. And in this process the dialectico-scientific analysis is developed into an infallible world-view. This science not only interprets the world, it also teaches how to change the world.

Therefore we have to start our discussion from the science of dialectics.

1. Essentials of the Science of Dialectics

1.1. Scientific principles relating to Dialectics

The word 'dialectics' has appeared in the western terminology since ancient times. The significance which the word has gained in modern times through attaining depth, has also resulted in the use of equivalent or corresponding terms in our vernacular. Needless to say these equivalents have as their origin the context in which the word used. But of course it is not possible to appreciate the proper or relevant significance of the 'duality' in the term if we only see the literal meaning of the word without going into the depths of the science of dialectics.

1.2 Dual or Two-pronged Dialectics

(a) After going through the history of philosophy and science Engels has drawn a distinction between two kinds of dialectics, viz. (i) objective dialectics and (ii) subjective dialectics. Objective dialectics has developed through the overall and mutually interrelated history between nature and human society. On the other hand, dialectical knowledge of the entire universe which is being consistently developed through the knowledge, practice and association of mankind, that in essence is subjective dialectics as captured in the thoughts are perceptions of the human mind. Therefore the universe (as a part of it), the history of the human society and the thoughts of mankind -- whatever progressive actions on dialectical development are present, the science of dialectics extends to them in all its forms. In summary we can then say -- the science of dialectics covers all the common links of all kinds of motion, change and development.

(b) Hegel was the first person who formulated a complete and well-organised structure of principles of dialectics after a complete and historic assessment of the religious, philosophic and scientific views both of the East and the West. But his principles could not in practice get established as a science of dialectics. This is because under his theological and idealistic 'absolute' principle, he had shown his dialectic principle only as a dialectic development of philosophy. With this he tried to 'prove' that the universe and fragmented conscious-

ness has originated from the dialectic spread of 'the absolute'.

(c) This kind of theological or idealistic statements could possibly solve some technological problems with the help of an overall picture related to the theory of knowledge. But the imaginary dialectics of the internal matters relating to so-called 'the absolute theory' cannot be used to explain the development of dialectics that has taken place in the universe. Moreover, the materialistic details on dialectics of Hegel have not also successfully explained the basic contradictions motivated in the socio-economic fundamentals in the history of the human society. As a result, the dialectic details of Hegel have failed to play any conclusive role in a basic change in society.

Marx and Engels -- the two have successfully achieved the convergence of basic materialist data with dialectic principles and formed materialist dialectics. This was because their principal aim was -- Philosophers have given various interpretations of the universe. But the actual point is to change the world. And this way they succeeded in uniting, the appropriate recognition of the material world with the struggle for its social progress.

1.3 Basic Concepts of Dialectical Materialism

(a) Dialectical Principles: There are two basic principles of dialectics (i) Principle of Universal Interconnection and (ii) Principle of Universal Development.

(i) According to the first principle, the universe exists in its totality; therefore none of its internal existences or events are different from others. For this reason continuous scientific research have given on different laws for conditional dependence, mutual actions and reactions and mutual dependence. [According to Marxist principles a world-wide socio-economic situation has developed through this principle of universal interrelation, through the development of a capitalist society and a division of labour across the world.]

(ii) But man has also learnt through his socio-historic combination of knowledge and work that there is nothing permanent or eternal about the inanimate nature and living nature and the socio-historic environment. Everything is going on changing according to well-defined laws and rules. [Therefore there is nothing perpetual and everlasting about the capitalist society of the world. Its socialistic endeavours was started from its internal conflicts. But this endeavour will certainly have to be extended world-wide.]

Even in the use of this initial and basic moral statement we particularly see the characteristics of duality. The principle of universal interconnection shows a state of universal permanency and the principle of universal development shows all forms of changes or motion. In effect, in the world stability and movement, continuity and break, gradual development and skipping over the basic, endless and successive -- these are all intimately connected. The moveable and immovable are always tied together in the dialectic existence of a matter in motion. There is no matter without motion; no motion without matter.

(b) Law of Contradiction: (i) The dialectical materialism does not agree that there is any action of supernatural powers involved in the development of matters which takes place in the overall arrangement of movements in the universe. According to this scientific theory the source of strength in the overall stability and basic metamorphosis in the material world is present within the universe itself. That strength is contradiction or opposing dialectics.

When seen very simply from the surface it will appear that each stable material item has an inseparable identity. The experts of metaphysics have formed their principles of 'pure similarity or identity' based on such hurry, unclear experience. But when considered scientifically within each similarity there is a dissimilarity, a difference, a division.

For example each individual person is certainly an inseparable identity. Ram is of

course Ram and Rahim is certainly Rahim. Thus, there is an identity for each individual ($A = A$). But seen in a wider perspective it can be easily understood that in the past each individual person came through the union of two individual or separate gametes or seeds. The embryo or foetus which grew inside it interacted with the surroundings of the womb and gave birth to the individual child. Right from the beginning the metabolism which was started with the birth of the embryo on the basis of the interactions dependant on the surroundings included both anabolism and catabolism; viz. creative and destructive activities. Therefore, it will not be scientifically incorrect to say, right from the point of conception in the mother's womb there is present within the individual a union of contradictory forces that is 'life' and 'death'. But during the determined period of his lifetime the individual remains the same person despite all the various changes ($A_1 = A_2 = A_3 \dots = A_n$). For this reason according to the science of dialectics every similarity is an identity of opposites. Death of an individual is an established change of this similarity. [A so-called 'socialist' state is such an identity of opposites. Meaning that within the worldwide capitalist socio-economic situation a different and uneven developmental condition is prevailing. But the worldwide basic conflict is bound to be present even within this different situation. That basic contradiction is the contradiction which lies between world-economics and the boundaries of the national state. The capitalist socio-economic situation is the main reason for this basic contradiction; there is a conflicting relationship between individual ownership and social production. Therefore 'national socialism' cannot be established within the boundaries of any one or a few essentially underdeveloped or backward countries without taking control of the developed countries through extensive rebellion by working class people. As a result, we see the contradiction between the rich and the working-class even in labour-states. This results in bureaucratic degeneration. In the end with the help of this bureaucratic rich class of the world they formed themselves into a new rich class. This counter-revolution does not disprove the science of dialectics of the Marxists. In fact it is Marxism which can explain it. And again prepare the ground of revolution.]

(ii) There is no disagreement between the dialectic 'law of contradiction' and the apparently logically accepted 'law of disagreement' -- the latter is applicable when referring to generally stable matters.

(c) Three Basic Laws on Dialectical Development: There are three laws which are used to explain the various changes depending on the central importance of dialectical contradictions. Here also, the laws follow scientific principles since they result from the internal material laws of earthly changes.

(i) Unity of Opposites: This law is the first expression of the central point relating to dialectic disagreement. With this, it is possible to explain the basic functions involved in any similar matters changing from a relative stable state to a dynamic state in motion.

When any static similar matter (like an item, individual, living being or any socio-economic situation) exists in a more or less settled state there is a kind of unity amongst its internal opposing forces. In this case that dialectic situation is called 'Unity of Opposites'. Of course this is not an isolated event. According to universal principles of inter-relationship there can be a state of unity in any situation involving others. For example relative stability in a state of unfavourable equilibrium. [Similarly, the true story of the 'classless society' in a so-called socialist state.]

But even in this state of unity, competition and contradiction continues between the two basically opposing forces. Equilibrium in the internal strengths is maintained by the combination of the two contradictory situations viz. environmental and internal. This gives rise to 'Collision of

Opposites'. As a result of the internal collision a new identity (similarity) is created. Thereby, the earlier structural framework gets appropriately modified with the strengths of the new contents. This is like what happens when the chick grows out of the egg. [Or USSR to CIS. In this case, in the background of the ever-increasing contradictions between the working people and the strong and ever-conscious bureaucracy, gives rise on the one hand to an extreme nationalist feeling, and on the other hand the bureaucrats with the support with the socialist forces builds a new framework suitable for going over to a complete capitalist situation.] In the case of the above complexities two opposites have simultaneously come in the wider concept of the world-wide class struggle. The newly formed bureaucrats of the alienated socialist states were in the initial stages opposed to capitalism. But with the increasing turmoil of internal problems and with background of the basic contradiction of the workers there was bound to be a mutual relationship between bureaucratic class and the world capitalists. [Here the overall success of the bourgeoisie-power has further complicated the turbulent problems of the world capitalists. In the absence of an alternative society the competition among the capitalists is pushing towards another world war. Of course the basic reason for this is the world wide development of the socio-economic situation and the internal contradictions within the boundaries of the national state. There is no solution for this in the capitalist structure.]

Anyway, the second law is required to explain the different stages of any dialectical changes.

(ii) Change of Quantity into Quality and Vice Versa : In practice, changes in whatever form do not take place suddenly, although experience at the time may indicate this. In the case of every change the internal equilibrium is changed in small measured stages. This is commonly known as 'evolution'. But in the case of national development there comes a stage when gradual changes in measured quantities is no longer possible. At this point we get a qualitative jump or leap. That is, the basic characteristic of the old similarity changes here. In the case of social development this stage is known as 'revolution'. In the case of basic social revolution the socio-economic structure goes through a total change. The same thing happens in the case of counter-revolutions. [But a final settlement has not yet taken place in the case of old Soviet Union. This is because the country is not outside this world, and the working class is still agitating. The success of this agitation will depend on the world-wide struggle of the workers.]

As a minor example it will be easier if we mention the internal dialectics of a troubled body. An individual dies when the anabolism and catabolism are totally ceased. Here we get a primary negation, or a living person becomes a 'negative'. But is it the end of the human species? Certainly not. The person continues to 'exist' on one side through his descendants and / or through his creation; and on the other side the remains of his body gets merged with nature. This is the 'negation of the negation'.

The importance of the third law is certainly to be accepted and necessary to explain this matter.

(iii) Negation and Negation of the Negation : In the science of Logic, we 'agree' or 'disagree' with a statement by using terms of 'affirmation' and 'negation'. This also is a form of duality. But in class-based logics for the purpose of settled and methodical expression this duality is certainly inevitable or absolute. In that case, both agreeing and disagreeing with any situation is certainly incorrect, because it will go against the Law of Contradiction. For example two statements viz. *Rabindranath is alive* and *Rabindranath is not alive* cannot both be acceptable simultaneously.

But the theory of negation established as an important component of the science of dialectics, is occupying a special place in the flow of materialistic or socialistic or philosophical movements or changes. That negation is certainly not inevitable or absolute; rather, it is relative. That is dialectical negation does not mean a particular being becoming an abstract non-being or nothing. Specifically, a dialectical negative reaction is not merely an expression of prohibition. Rather, this reaction in the case of a real change is a sign of quantitative development. Therefore dialectic negation will have to be understood in a situation relative to its surroundings, as a form of dialectic change of any matter, living being or society, a transformation from one situation into another situation. For this reason, it is not possible to fully follow the relevance of dialectical negation if we exclude the component relating to negation of the negation.

The true lovers of the subject try to understand negation of the negation through the Law of Double Negation of formal logics. But that is not possible, because double negation means using 'no' twice, and as a result comes back to the original statement. It does not mean this has no value (it has a value). In the earlier statement we have already seen that we use double negation in our day to day life. But this dialectical negation and negation of negation cannot be followed through normal expressions in our language. This is because in the case of double negation (it is as if) we are going in a circular way on a level plain, while negation of negation goes up in a spiral form.

In the case of any development or change there are certainly two kinds of negation present while moving from a primary stage to the next basic stage the characteristics of the primary stage go through a change through the first negation. Or in simple words, the primary or initial situation is made void. But the features of any change in a natural process is such that in the changed situation the qualities of the earlier state are present in a sublated form. This is the second negation, and through it the negation-process of the first negation is (partially) cancelled. As an example I am quoting a statement by Marx to explain a (necessary) historical social change.

"Capitalist production methods result in a capitalist method of acquiring personal wealth. This is the primary negation in the build-up of (truly) personal wealth acquired on the basis of the own efforts of the small master. But according to the universal principles of permanency capitalist production arrangement itself gives rise to negative reaction. This is the negation of negation. But as result of this personal wealth of the individual producers is not re-established. Instead the individual regains his property on the basis of wealth acquired during the capitalist days, *i.e.*, on the basis of ownership of his savings, land and means of production."

Of course, in the background of the socio-economic situation world-wide, an opposite condition can happen through a more complex negation of negation phenomena is also being proved in history in Soviet Union and other countries. This will be easier to understand if we use the Law of Double Negation of formal logic to explain it. Expressed as a formula: Capitalism → Non-capitalism (*i.e.*, socialism) non-socialism (*i.e.*, non--non capitalism) capitalism. Therefore from capitalism we come back to capitalism.

But it is not so simple. First, in a country socialism does not come immediately on cessation of capitalism. What happens is initially a foundation is laid for forming a world socialism. In that case the first negation has not been successful. In fact, movement in the reverse direction has started (from 1924) through the counter-revolutionary actions of the bureaucracy. As a result, there was negation of the negation, but in the reverse direction.

[But this is not the end of history. The whole situation can be reversed if world socialistic

revolutionary programme is adopted. Here we recall a warning by Marx. In 1845 itself he had remarked : If the world-wide socio-economic situation is not fully understood or controlled by the working class it will not be possible to build even locally the first stages of socialism.]

2. Science of Dialectics in the Study of Logic

The main point arising from a summary of materialistic science of dialectics is that whatever arguments have historically come up in the thoughts of man on the basis of dialectical development of social materialism, none of it can be outside the overall framework of the science of dialectics. For this reason, from the point of view of dialectics the study of logic has to be divided into two main sections: one being static logic and the other dynamic logic.

Static logic is essentially applied in the case of all situations that are present in earthly orderliness. That is, whatever matters of relative stability exists in our world, static logic examines its nature and mutual relationship and maintains normal order in the language of logic. Since matters of stability in earthly matters is involved in various forms of relationships, static logic is known as classificatory logic. Formal logic and a large part of mathematics come under this category. But any meaningful proof of this is only possible through dialectical logic.

Since dialectical logic or dynamic logic tries to explain the development of all contradictions, so it is called Logic of Method. It should be remembered that there is no fundamental disagreement between this logic and classificatory logic. The entire science of dialectics, the dialectic present in all forms of static and dynamic form and their development in this world, is explained through their dual role.

3. Logic as a Principle of Knowledge

In order to make any logical explanation, at one stage some fundamental questions have to be raised out side the different established framework of logic. Particularly, question will definitely arise, how beginning with the numerous concepts and the different fundamental ideas we became aware of the different categories. The various discussions which have taken place in the history of philosophy can essentially be divided into two sections: One based on experience or Empiricism and the other based on intelligence or Rationalism. Kant had tried to combine them in the help of his *Critical Method*.

But out side the practical world, all these theories are being used to find solutions to the known problems of the alienated person. As a result these could not help explain the unity, continuity and universality of human knowledge. Hegel had tried to establish an explanation using the extensive framework of his 'absolute theory'. But it is not possible since it is based on theology. Marx and Engels established the foundation of a dialectico-historical theory of knowledge by using the materialism of science of dialectics. We are giving a summary of it here.

(a) According to the fundamental view of the science of dialectics a material dialectical development in human thinking has taken place through a socio-historic reflection of material universal dialectics.

(b) A description of this material evolution of the human being can be seen at every level of birth and development of knowledge and thinking through the socio-historic associations of knowledge and work.

(c) The individuality of the individual person has developed through the above socio-historic evolution. Therefore, the thoughts and feelings of an individual is very much dependant on society. Therefore, raising scattered questions relating to the knowledge of an individual ignoring the background of the socio-historic development of the human race is rather

irrelevant.

(d) Just as the 'life in the womb' of a child is a summarised continuation of the evolution of the living world, similarly the history of development of man after birth is in brief the socio-historic evolution of forming into an individuality.

An explanation of the structure of the principles of dialectical science is clearly seen through two scientific applications:

(i) First is 'Gnosiology' which is derived from the process of negation of the negation, dialectically refuting the existing theories. The development of this theory has been particularly helped by psychology, a part of Pavlovian physiology. It has helped to meaningful explanation of the human feelings.

(ii) Alongside this dialectical logic works closely with dialectical principles. Its function is to take the thought process from the stage of arguments to dialectical state of movement. This process essentially works on the basis of the fundamental principles of the science of dialectics.

4. Science of Dialectics as a Development of Ontology

According to a number of persons, the explanation given by Marx regarding the science of dialectics does not throw up any overall theory of 'dialectical materialism'. But we have said earlier, this view is rather mechanistic. On the contrary, based on dynamic analysis of the science of dialectics, we will say: (i) The universal view of the science of materialistic contradictions is dialectical materialism. But it has to be remembered that in the case of principles by Marx and Engels dialectical materialism was not created merely by a mechanical mixture of historically created fundamental materialism with the principles of contradiction as available from history. In fact, here also we see the process of negation and negation. When fundamental materialism has been accepted by relying on the historical significance (or basis of development), then the earlier mechanical materialistic character has become dynamic *i.e.*, entirely covered by the natural socio-historic dialectics. And it is only through this route that the dialectical principles of Hegel have evolved into the science of dialectics. In fact this evolution is not a mechanical or mathematical summation of 'Hegel' and 'Fauerbach'. Rather it is through mutual entry -- 'dual transcendence'.

For this reason, in the superior view of materialistic dialectics, 'material' does not signify an everlasting substance. To a dialectic materialist, 'material' is a philosophical category and its only meaning is objective reality. A dialectic materialist does not issue a final order about the fundamental characteristics and nature of a material. Rather, he depends on historically developed scientific research.

(ii) While showing their total and universal opposition to dialectical materialism many have imagined its fundamental differences with historical materialism..

Again some, even without accepting the so-called differences in principles of Marx and Engels have created a mechanical distinction between dialectical materialism and historical materialism. According to them, 'dialectical materialism' is an ontology about universal nature and its application in the case of history of the human society is 'historical materialism'. But in our view even thinking of such distinction essentially contradicts the science of dialectics. This is because according to our explanation if we use the term 'history' in its wider sense then it can be dialectically shown that --

(a) Just as the principles of dialectics have been successfully transformed only on the basis of basic materialism, similarly materialistic science of dialectics can explain the world with its living beings, the human society and the dialectic dynamism of the human mind

depending on the complete history of natural social materialism.

(b) The natural dialectics of the material world and the living world have historically compiled the dialectical details of the social world. As a rule, we can say -- The history of nature has been evolved through historic nature. [In this case, we should note the limitations of expression. In the former case, the word history has been used in the wider sense, and in the latter case in its narrower or restricted sense.]

(c) Therefore, only if we remove any mechanical barrier of the historical development of nature and the social history of the human being, we can say:

(i) dialectical materialism is itself (in its wider sense) historic; and

(ii) (in the narrower sense) historical materialism is certainly dialectico-materialistic.

(d) Moreover, just as historical materialism has evolved from dialectical materialistic views in the case of social history, similarly it has been possible to understand the total views on 'dialectical materialism' through historical development.

For these reasons, based on the overall, dynamic consideration of the science of dialectics, we have used the term 'Dialectico-historical materialism' conforming with the universal principles of the science of dialectics.

Bibliography

1. Marx and Engels, *The German Ideology*, Progressive Publishers Moscow and Lenin, *Materialism and Empirio-criticism*, FLPH, Moscow.
2. Marx, *Capital* Vol.I, FLPH, Moscow.
3. Engels, *Dialectics of Nature*, FLPH, Moscow.
4. Lenin, *Philosophical Notebooks*, *Collected Works*, Vol.38, Progressive Publishers, Moscow.
5. Marx, *Poverty of Philosophy*, Burman Publishing House, Calcutta.
6. Marx and Engels, *Communist Manifesto*
7. Lenin *Collected Works*, Vol. 30
8. Harry K. Wells, *Alienation and Dialectical Logic in Dialogues on the Philosophy of Marxism*, Sommerville and Parsons, Greenwood Press, New York.
9. Lenin, *Materialism and Empirio-criticism*.

[Written in July, 1990]

P A S

Science and the Military-Science- Industry Complex

Ashish Lahiri

It is a commonplace that wars have contributed heavily towards the development of technology, both directly and indirectly -- directly, by solving practical problems needing urgent solution, and indirectly through triggering scientific research by throwing up newer and newer questions. The USA is a case in point. Initially the American Republic believed mostly in the applied sciences. However, with each new war, it became apparent that their scientific and technological institutions were inadequate, in the sense of being unable to cope up with newer emergencies. Such a situation continued till as late as the Second World War. It is curious to note that in 1945, Vannevar Bush, in charge of directing US wartime technological effort, had to confess that his country was relying too much on European basic science for its technological development.¹

With typical American urgency, this flaw was remedied quickly. The rest is history. We all know how this thrust eventually led to the US becoming the major force not only in technology, but in the basic sciences as well. Today it is the uncontested leader in both divisions.

During the First World War, the initial successes of Germany were largely due to the fact that German industry had already become science-based, particularly the chemical industry. Strangely enough, at the outbreak of the World War II, Germany virtually dismantled its science organisation. Probably the basically retrograde and semi-religious ideology of Fascism had a lot to do in this renunciation of science, which was typified in labelling and condemning the theory of relativity as 'Jewish' science! On the other hand, Britain reorganised its technological efforts and geared the whole of its scientific structure, including the universities, towards the war. The same thing happened in the USA. Not only was there a total mobilization of industry, but the universities also launched highly effective military research programmes. In the words of Alexander King, 'These were the first technological crash programmes in history and they succeeded magnificently, producing jet aircraft, microwave radar, revolutionary aids to navigation, new explosives, bomb-sights, proximity fuses, and finally, the atomic bomb. One significant feature was the way academic scientists, working in teams with engineers and military experts, proved capable of producing fundamental innovations which were determinative in winning the war.'² In this they were greatly helped by the refugee German, Austrian, and Italian scientists. Here then we find one of the clues to the defeat of the Nazis in the Second World War. The lesson is simple: No state can ignore science and hope to win a war in this age of imperialism.

The Use and Abuse of Science policy : J.D.Bernal

The link between science and the state was rather loose before the First World War. The story goes that during that war, the American Chemical Society offered its services to the War Department. The response was: 'Thanks, but we already have a chemist.' The Depression of the 1930s caused some people to become aware of the role that science policy might play in economic and social development of the country. However, this did not provide the state with the means to guide the direction of scientific research, or even to organize it in a more coherent manner. France alone, under the Popular Front, created the post of Under-Secretary of State, which was given first to Irene Joliot-Curie, then to Jean Perrin. The fact that two Nobel prize winners occupied in 1936 a ministerial position is the first clear indication of the state recognition of the role played by science in economic, political and social affairs.

This was inspired in part by the Soviet experience. For it was indeed in Soviet Russia that a close link had been forged between science, society and politics. There, scientific research was considered inseparable from the political system.

It is in this context that the pioneering role of J.D.Bernal's epoch-making book *The Social Function of Science* (1939) has to be considered. Prior to this, no other work had studied the relations between science and society with comparable depth. He was the first to have perceived and analysed **all** the aspects of scientific and technological research activities as objects of social research. Bernal deplored both the lack of public interest in science prevailing at that time and the scarcity of resources. He had no doubt as to the immense progress science would accomplish and the great service that it would, through technology, render to society. A combination of two conditions was the *sine qua non* in his view for these promises to be realised: far greater, virtually unlimited, resources must be implemented. In other words, gone were the days of individual research, research for the sake of truth and truth alone.

However, Bernal never could reconcile himself to the eventuality that the virtual merger of science with the state would precipitate something diametrically opposite to what he had so passionately envisioned. The imperialist states pounced on his ideas and promptly utilised them with a vengeance to promote their unwholesome ends. In the process, science itself got debased, so to say, into a tool of imperialism.

The Military-Scientific-Industrial Complex

In the First World War, as we have noted, science was neglected at the outset. Nevertheless, before the end of that war science came to be accepted as an essential auxiliary for the production and servicing of new devices such as the airplane or wireless. But in the Second World War, grimly called the "Physicists' War", science was important from the beginning and by the end became a dominant factor, not only in the evolution of 'inherently tyrannical' new weapons such as long-range rockets and the atom bomb, but also in the co-ordination and direction of military operations themselves. In fact, what we call operations research, without which any marketing activity is unthinkable today, was a product of the war operations. During the war practically the whole of science in Britain and America was turned to war service. The development of newer and newer technologies led to the development of new military theories too. One of these was the famous Trenchard-Douhet Theory of strategic mass-bombing.

Strategic Bombing : Trenchard-Douhet Theory

The Trenchard-Douhet Theory of winning wars by destruction of enemy war potential by strategic mass bombing was responsible for most of the devastation of the Second World War. What was the main content of this theory?

After World War I ended, military planners began studying the lessons of the war in order to determine how to avoid the nightmare of trench warfare in the future. Air power planners, in particular, were looking for ways not only to avoid the carnage of World War I, but also to ensure that the demands of army and navy officials did not constrain the airplane's continued development. Government research institutes such as the U.S. Air Corps Tactical School and the Soviet facility at Lipetsk, were established. Four men with visions of the role of aviation in future engagements emerged as "air power prophets". They were: Billy Mitchell of America, Giulio Douhet of Italy, and James Molony Spaight and Sir Hugh Trenchard of England.

The idea of bombing to deprive the enemy of the means and the will to continue to fight became known as "strategic bombing." A bombing campaign was seen as a psychological as well as a physical battle. Trenchard studied the effects of British bombing attacks on towns in Germany and estimated that the psychological damage was twenty times greater than the material. And interestingly, living under the threat of an attack was as damaging to civilian morale as an actual attack. The German city of Trier experienced only seven raids, but underwent more than 100 air raid alarms — each one demanding that people leave their jobs or beds and hurry to shelters in fear. Workers who spent the night in shelters listening to and waiting for the sound of bombs did not come to work the next day or were too tired to perform their jobs properly. In this way, bombing could destroy a nation's production without destroying its factories.

With the build-up air forces, these theorists knew that a single massive bombing would not win a war. Instead, the plan, as outlined by Douhet, was first to gain air superiority by destroying an enemy's air force, preferably while on the ground. The next step was to bomb, concentrating on the industrial sections of the cities, in order to prevent the enemy from rebuilding its military power. Since bombsights were extremely inaccurate at the time, a

massive amount of bombs would have to be dropped over a large rectangular area on the assumption that one of them might hit the actual target. Civilians would have to take shelter in order to avoid stray bombs. Once the nation had surrendered, ground troops would move in to occupy the country.

Strategic Bombing in Germany

Nothing would better illustrate the application of this theory to practice than the bombing of Germany by Britain in the Second World War. Hamburg, port and industrial centre, then a city of 1,80,000 people, was raided nine times between Jul 24 and August 2, 1943. It received 10,000 tons of bombs -- more than fell on London during the whole blitz of 1940-41. The city was reported by the Air Ministry to be "to all intents and purposes in absolute ruins." The smug comfort was, this success was achieved at the cost of *only* 87 aircraft! In three raids on Cologne between June 28 and July 5, some three quarters of the city were destroyed. Berlin, heavily raided in August, was systematically bombed during November and December, with the deliberate intention of paralysing it as the greatest centre of military administration and production. Apart from these, many other industrial and transport centres of Germany were devastatingly bombed. 'From the beginning of the war to the end of 1943, 200,000 tons of bombs were dropped on Germany The Germans dropped about a third of that amount on Great Britain during the same period -- mostly in the raids of 1940-41.' ³

What, however, about the result of this unbelievably large scale of strategic bombing? Somewhat controvertibly, Professor Bernal commented : 'The Trenchard-Douhet theory ... was responsible for most of the devastation of the Second World War *without producing any strategic advantage.*' ⁴ Bernal should know. He himself was an important part of the British and Allied war efforts. Moreover, in this particular case, he has the support of men like C.P. Snow and professor Patrick Blackett.

The Counter-Force Strategy

During and after the Second World War, scientific and technical research, conceived with military strategic ends in mind, became the source of newly discovered forms of technology : nuclear energy, radar, jet planes, DDT, computers, missiles, etc. . The demobilization of researchers at the end of the war, far from signalling the end of 'mobilized' science, gave rise to systematic efforts to take advantage of research activities in the context of national and international objectives.

The perfecting of nuclear weapons, missiles, and computers alerted the most traditional law of the balance of power : it was no longer enough to avoid being at the mercy of the enemy, one had now to *forestall* him, to cripple him.

This is best exemplified by what is known as the **Counter-force Strategy**. After the Second World War the United States spread its nuclear rocket bases over a large part of the world. These were sought to be protected 'either by hardening them, that is, by putting them in submarines, the Polaris nuclear submarine system.' The effect of this on strategy has been revolutionary. Inspired by the **game theory** strategists, such as Professor Edward Teller, and supported by the military research corporations, of which the most famous is the Rand Corporation, a new **counter-force strategy** was evolved. In this strategy the first strike is aimed at crippling the **striking capacity** of the other side with the object of winning the war without losses. This strategy realizes that it will be difficult to destroy all the hidden weapons and therefore it will require a much larger production of bombs. This is technically called **over-**

kill capacity. This in spite of the fact there is already enough nuclear material stored and capable of being delivered to kill everybody in the world many times over. The fact that the ordinary population near the hardened sites would also be killed and further destroyed by fall-out is called, once again technically, a **bonus kill**. It is considered a humane policy because it does not aim at cities as the so-called 'deterent policy' did which preceded it. ⁵

Push-Button, Inhuman Warfare

It has been claimed that the ultimate purpose of the introduction of the 'humane' electronic control and direction into weapons is to remove the human element in warfare still farther from the actual combat zone. To utter crudely, the real purpose is to ensure the safety of the weapon-user by keeping him well away from the results of his work and from immediate retaliation. Needless to say, the use of such weapons does not make war any more humane, as claimed by its hypocritical practitioners. Far more physical pain and suffering were caused in a shorter time to more people in Korea and Viet Nam by the use of high explosive and napalm than in any comparable war in the past. On the contrary, the great gap between action and result fosters the irresponsibility of modern warfare. Push button war permits well-meaning and apparently civilized men to perpetuate with a clear conscience the most ghastly massacres, the effects of which they never see, except on TV screens. The recent wars on Iraq are a case in point.

Concentration and Militarization

In this new kind of strategic perceptions, the balance of terror, the arms race and the fear of technological gaps, scientific and technical research itself constituted a powerful strategic, diplomatic, and economic weapon. All these factors combined to consolidate the powers of imperialism. The two most characteristic features of scientific research and development in the western world today, and particularly in the USA, are : **concentration** and **militarization**. Both these characteristics are related to monopoly-controlled industry. As a matter of fact, one of the major features of the twentieth century has been 'the complete dominance of large combines, trusts or cartels, partly commercial, partly industrial. Even the names are familiar all over the world -- Du pont, General Motors, Krupp, Schneider Creusot, Imperial Chemical, I.G.Farben, etc. , not to mention the nominally dispersed empire of Standard Oil or the wide range of Morgan interests.' ⁶

Since the Second World War, the government has become the main source not only of university research funds but also of industrial research. The research and development contracts, almost exclusively for war material, have proved very convenient for monopoly firms, as the government pays the costs and takes all the risks, while, once in production, industry takes all the profits. ⁷

The growing influence exerted by technological and scientific affairs on imperialists politics in general could be regarded as a cause as well as an effect of the international climate of insecurity. The 'tyranny' of the arms race operated through a **scientific-military-industrial complex**. At the centre of the whole drama was the armaments industry. If one has to concretize the idea of imperialism, one can simply look at the US armaments industry. It controls the economy, it controls science, it controls, needless to say, politics. The irony of history is that it was a supreme army commander and President of the United States who uttered the first grave warning against the dangers inherent in the operations of this complex. In his famous farewell speech as President, General Eisenhower ominously referred to the

scientific and technological elite and the military-industrial complex to which this elite owed its existence (*New York Times*, 22nd January 1961). Gunnar Andreasan poignantly brings out the sinister import of this memorable speech. ' When the man who has learned the facts first as the supreme military commander of the West and later as the President of the United States finds it necessary to use such words as " Liberty is at stake" the first time he feels in a position to speak freely, the things are undoubtedly serious. Eisenhower urgently stressed the fact that armaments production was so enormous that the industry's influence on public opinion, the administration and political life was decisive.' ⁸ It works through highly influential lobbies. Andreassen is amazed to observe that 'members or groups of the US parliament' often vote for much larger sums than either the Pentagon or the government ask for. In no other country in the world does this happen.' ⁹ This peculiarly American phenomenon perhaps accounts for the fact that the USA is so unique even among the imperialist countries.

The working of this nexus is nowhere more explicitly brought out than in the history of the "The Bomb" and the Ballistic Missile. But that is too long a story to narrate here.

Notes

1. Vannevar Bush, *Science the Endless Frontier*, p. 121, National Science Foundation, USA, 1960
2. Trevor Williams (ed.), *A History of Technology*, Vol. VI, Part - 1, p. 122, Clarendon Press, Oxford, 1978
3. Sir John Hammerton (ed.), *Practical Knowledge*, Vol. 6, pp. 325-26, The Waverly Book Co., London
4. J.D.Bernal, *Science in History*, 3-839, Pelican, 1969; italics added
5. Bernal, op. cit., 3-840
6. Bernal, op. cit., 3-705
7. Bernal, op. cit., 4-1254
8. Gunnar Andreason, *In Twenty Years*, p. 163, Denmark, 1964
9. op. cit., p. 164

PAS

Religion As Surrogate : Case Study of a Bengali Patriot (Continued)

Ramkrishna Bhattacharya

[What follows is the third part of a monograph on Brahmabandhab Upadhyay (1861-1907), one of the prime movers of the Swadeshi Movement in Bengal (1905-08). *Sandhya*, the Bengali evening daily he edited, brought anti-imperialist politics to the masses. But most of his life he was engaged in religious quest – from traditional Hinduism to Brahmoism, and from Brahmoism to Christianity, at first as a Protestant and then as a Catholic. Only a few weeks before his death he volunteered to perform a penance (*prayaschitta*) and wore the sacred thread again.

What made this man tick? How was religion related to his strong nationalist feelings? The case study seeks to find answers to these questions.]

Upadhyay had originally started his journalistic career in English. Rathindranath Tagore, son of Rabindranath, who belonged to the first batch of students of Santiniketan Brahmacharyasram, was much impressed by Upadhyay's command over language : "I have rarely met any one who could speak or write such beautiful and chaste English."⁷⁶ Upadhyay published and edited

a series of journals, *The Concord* (1856-86), *The Harmony* (1890), *The (Monthly) Sophia* (1894-99), *The (Weekly) Sophia* (1900), and *The Twentieth Century* (1901). Politics was never at the centre of the issues covered in them. When in 1900, he took to writing in Bengali, the style was at first nothing exceptional. The issue was Hindutva – not the Hindu religion but the social customs by adhering to which a man is to be known as Hindu, irrespective of the god or gods he worshipped and even if he was an atheist like a Carvaka or a Jain.⁷⁷ His Bengali articles were published in *Bangadarsan*. The journal originally had been edited by Bankimchandra Chattopadhyay and later revived by Rabindranath Tagore and his associates in 1901. The speech Upadhyay delivered in 1904 against Rev. J. N. Farquhar⁷⁸ was also written in the high-style, standard, chaste Sadhu code then prevalent in Bengali prose.⁷⁹ But the open letters he wrote in the weekly *Bangabasi* on his journey to and during his stay in England (1902-03) reveal a radical change in style. Upadhyay was now addressing the common reader, the man of the street, not just the well-educated people of his own kind. The editorials of *Sandhya* (1905-07) followed the new style of writing. Upadhyay had an exceptional stock of Bengali proverbs and idioms and they helped enliven his writing. The titles of the editorials were both funny and flavoured with almost untranslatable vernacular idioms. He harnessed every Bengali Hindu custom and ritual such as the worship of Itu, a village goddess, Dolyatra, Sivaratri, Sripanchami, and even Jamaishashthi (a secular custom of feasting sons-in-law) to preach the message of Swaraj.⁸⁰ A pedestrian style of this kind was unprecedented in the short history of political journalism in Bengali. Rathindranath Tagore once described this new style of writing as "a virile colloquial Bengali of a Hitlerian type."⁸¹ The word 'Hitlerian' is perhaps employed to suggest 'demagogic'. However Upadhyay's style is more reminiscent of the Old Testament prophets, urging their people to give up sloth and rousing them to action.

At the same time, Upadhyay published a journal called *Swaraj*, the style of which was more serious and grave. The sentences were short, expressions emotive and the appeal, direct. A master of style, Upadhyay could write Bengali with rare flair. It is not for nothing that Tagore compared the language of *Sandhya* with heady wine which sent a fiery sensation in the blood of his countrymen.⁸²

Upadhyay cared little for fact or reason; he relied almost wholly on intuition and inspiration. He swayed his readers by appealing not to their brain but to their heart. Naturally such an approach has its dangers as well. Upadhyay did succeed in rousing the people of Bengal, but in order to do so he had to compromise with all sorts of superstitions and prejudices.⁸³ Anything and everything was grist to his mill; the only purpose was to evoke the patriotic spirit and drive people to action, to boycott foreign goods and follow the Swadeshi path.

This also explains why Upadhyay failed to leave any legacy, except perhaps the Bankim Cult which he fostered along with Aurobindo Ghosh (Later Sri Aurobindo).⁸⁴ Whatever influence he had on the people of his own time – and it was indubitably great – died with him. He had no political philosophy of his own. All that he had was a burning zeal for independence and an unquenching hatred for the foreign rulers for whom he always used the derogatory term, *phiringi*.⁸⁵ Fear of police repression (which included search for seditious literature) made Animananda burn all the political writings of his master.⁸⁶ Very few of Upadhyay's correspondence with Tagore have survived. Even the letters written to him by Tagore were destroyed by Upadhyay's patriotic disciples for fear of police reprisal.⁸⁷ Whatever little of his Bengali writings have survived gives a very partial picture of Upadhyay's achievement. He was a prolific writer, specially during 1905-07. But most of these writings are lost.

Bhupendranath Datta regrets that Upadhyay remains "misunderstood" in our country even today (1961).⁸⁸ And this is nothing unexpected. Could Upadhyay ever understand himself fully or truly? He carried within him the seed of being perpetually misunderstood. He himself

complained on several occasions that people misunderstood him.⁸⁹ Actually he was never sure what he would do with his own life. On the one hand, there was his uncompromising patriotism, and on the other, an almost equally strong desire for renunciation (*sannyas*). He could never decide to which of these two ends he should devote himself. The habit of taking drastic decisions while he was still undecided, was ingrained in his very nature.⁹⁰ It is possible that his decision to perform expiation (*prayaschitta*) was the beginning of a new Act in the drama of his life. But death drew the curtain too soon. It is also possible that Upadhyay came to know himself only a few weeks before the end of his brief life. He planned to turn over a new leaf by joining the Bharati order of the Dasanami community of *Sannyasis* allegedly founded by Sankaracharya.⁹¹ This, he is said to have believed, would enable him to combine his twin passions: to work for his country, and at the same time, be a *Sannyasi* proper. The sleepless nights Upadhyay passed during the last two months of his life bear testimony to the inner struggle he had been undergoing.⁹² He no longer performed any regular Christian ritual. Upadhyay, after his return from England (July 1903) did not cease to honour Christ and worship Madonna. But he was no longer interested in proselytizing.⁹³

It is curious that, although Upadhyay used to wear saffron clothes and walk barefooted, he was never ordained as a *Sannyasi* either in the Hindu or in the Catholic way.⁹⁴ His Hindu friends must have impressed upon him that his action of throwing away the sacred thread had to be expiated first. Only after he had put on the sacred thread, having performed the necessary penance, he could aspire to be a *Sannyasi* (and put off the sacred thread again!).⁹⁵

All this may appear to be utterly fantastic to many today. But the fact remains that for Upadhyay religion proved to be a poor substitute for his burning patriotism. The equation he made between the Hindu identity of an Indian Christian (one could be a Hindu in spite of being a Christian by religion and a Christian by religion in spite of belonging to the Hindu community) found no taker.⁹⁶ That is perhaps the tragedy of Upadhyay's life. Trying to be both Hindu and Christian at the same time, he was misunderstood and consequently largely forgotten after his death by both Hindus and Christians.⁹⁷

It is as an untiring freedom-fighter that Upadhyay deserves to be remembered, not as a theologian or a Christian proselytizer. Whatever the Catholics of India or abroad may think of him now – an apostate or a true Catholic to his last breath – Upadhyay's religious identity is of little concern to the historians of India's freedom struggle. On the other hand, it appears that the radical turn that Upadhyay took in politics from 1904, and more pronouncedly after 1905, had something to do with the treatment he had received at the hands of the Delegate Apostolic and his followers.⁹⁸ Blind submission to any authority went against the very grain of Upadhyay's character. Still he tried his best to be obeisant and humble. When such attempts to conciliate himself with the authority of the Church failed, he had to turn back and wage war – no holds barred – against the European missionaries. Fr. Lacombe refers to a letter of Upadhyay which speaks of his intention of going to the South to start a campaign against the European clergy (sic).⁹⁹ Fr. Lacombe rightly understood that the animosity was not so much religious as political. In his first article in *The Tablet* Upadhyay deplored the fact that Christianity in India

is too much mixed up with beef and pork, spoon and fork, too tightly pantalooned and petticoated to manifest its universality. What appears to them [*sc.* Indians] very strange is to be told to accept the English as their teachers *who seldom fail to bring guns with their religion wherever they go*.¹⁰⁰ (Emphasis added)

Abbe Jean-Antoine Dubois (1765-1848), the French Catholic missionary in South India, too had felt the same thing long before Upadhyay's eyes were opened. Two Jesuit missionaries, Fr. C. G. Beschi, s.j. and Fr. R. de Nobili, s.j., had adopted the dress and custom of Hindu monks

and succeeded in converting thousands of upper-caste Hindus in Madura, before British imperialism made its appearance in its true colours. Abbe Dubois later regretted :

The Hindus soon found that those missionaries whom their colour, their talents, and other qualities had induced them to regard as such extraordinary beings, as men coming from another world, were in fact nothing else but disguised Feringhis¹⁰¹ (Europeans) and that their country, their religion, and original education were the same as those of the evil, contemptible Feringhis who had of late invaded their country. This event proved the last blow to the interests of the Christian religion. No more conversions were made. Apostasy became almost general in several quarters, and Christianity became more and more an object of contempt and aversion in proportions as European manners became better known to the Hindus.¹⁰²

If the imperialist rulers and the missionaries indeed appeared to be the same kind of Feringhis, and if they dealt with the Indian converts in an equally discriminatory manner, it is no wonder that such a fierce spirit as Upadhyay would revolt against both.

And the story is no different in case of the Protestants. Even the ordained priests of Indian origin were grossly discriminated against. Rev. Lal Behari Day (1824-94) was never placed on the same footing with the European missionaries. As a catechist he was paid less than his European counterparts but that he did not mind. What rankled him was the discrimination made in the treatment of the Indian converts.¹⁰³ Long before Upadhyay came to realize this, the Protestants of Bengal belonging to the Churches of England and Scotland had felt themselves insulted and humiliated. They did not lose faith in Christianity but tried to form an Indian Church of their own with only the Apostolic creed to guide them.

Let us take another example. Kali Charan Banurji (1847-1907), uncle of Upadhyay, was baptised in 1864 in the Scottish Presbyterian Church. But after a few years (1870) he boldly declared : "In having become Christians, we have not ceased to be Hindus. We are Hindu Christians, as thoroughly Hindu as Christian. We have embraced Christianity but we have not discarded our nationality. We are as intensely national as any [of] our bretheren of the native press can be."¹⁰⁴

The word 'Hindu' is of course rather dubious in its import. It may mean an Indian by nationality or one belonging to the Hindu community having faith in any of the gods of a 330 million-strong pantheon, or one born a Hindu but having no faith in any god at all. Upadhyay and his follower, Mokshadacharan Samadhyayi (1279-1388 BS = 1873-1931) used to interpret the word 'Hindu' in the last sense.¹⁰⁵

It is obvious that people like Kali Charan Banurji felt ill at ease with the European Christian community in India. But they had burnt their boats and were not prepared to renounce their newly earned faith in Christ. As "native" Christians they too became, to employ Upadhyay's apt use of a Hindi proverb, akin to "a washerman's dog ... of little service either at home or abroad".¹⁰⁶ In order to assert their identity as Indians, the most politically oriented converts used to work as moderate Congressmen, never deviating from the path of constitutional agitation. Their attempt to form an Indian Church proved abortive, not merely because the European authorities frowned at such endeavours, but also due to the fact that the Indian Protestants themselves were unable to unite.¹⁰⁷

Unlike his Protestant counterparts, Upadhyay, one of the very few Bengali Catholics to participate in the Swadeshi movement,¹⁰⁸ adopted and advocated an extremist line to challenge British rule in India. In this way alone could he come to terms with himself and forget all his failed attempts to indigenize Christianity and his theological explorations to preach Catholicism via Advaita Vedanta. In his case religion proved to be an imperfect surrogate.

It is not accidental that both the uncle and the nephew, though belonging to two different Churches, were aggrieved about the superciliousness of the European missionaries. Kali Charan in his presidential address to the Bengal Christian Conference (1877)

criticized the missionaries of de-nationalizing Indian Christians and making them into compound-Christians, and for having transferred the theological and ecclesiastical differences of the West to India, thereby dividing the Indian Christians into numerous denominations.¹⁰⁹

Upadhyay too was equally concerned with the problem of "denationalization".¹¹⁰ However, to him nation or nationality was not merely a *political*, but a *social* concept. In the second number of *The Twentieth Century* (Feb, 1901) Upadhyay declared :

We shall voice in moderate language national aspirations for political advancement and while supporting social reform shall set our face resolutely against denationalisation.¹¹¹

Yet the difference between the uncle and the nephew is glaring enough. In spite of having undergone the same kind of humiliating experience at the hands of the European missionaries, the uncle never lost his faith in the 'divine dispensation',¹¹² that is, the British rule in India. Bipin Chandra Pal has summed up Kali Charan's political attitude thus :

He was certainly not an Anglophile, but neither was he moved in his political activities by the least little suspicion of anti-British feeling. He was proud of his race and country and felt hurt by the cruel actualities of the position of the Indian Christian community which was dependent on British and other foreign Christian missions for their economic life and sustenance. He wanted to establish an Indian Church which would be free from foreign domination. But though a man of sturdy independence, Kali Charan honestly believed that in the existing condition of his country a return to Hindu or Moslem rule would be disastrous to the moral and spiritual future of his people. In this I and my Brahma friends in the Congress were at one with him.¹¹³

Upadhyay, on the other hand, had no illusion about the British rule, specially after 1905. His was a case of acute anglophobia. It knew no limits and, more often than not, made some people (specially the Sadharan Brahmos) wince at his down-to-earth language when he attacked the British.¹¹⁴ Side by side with this counter-racism Upadhyay went on projecting the four-fold *Varna* system as a model to be emulated under all circumstances even by the Indian Christians. Such revivalism was, strangely enough, totally social, *not* religious.¹¹⁵ Upadhyay's Hindutva was unlike the neo-Hinduism propounded by Sasadhar Tarkacadamani and Krishnaprasanna Sen, or even by Swami Vivekananda. His Hindutva was Hinduism with all the Hindu pantheon left out of consideration. To the neo-Hindus, on the other hand, Hindutva stood for religious worship first, other issues being at best secondary.

The difference between the uncle and the nephew exhibits two alternative courses of politics that were left to the Indian converts. Most of the Indian Christians were thoroughly loyalist or mostly a-political. Only a handful of the Protestants became Moderate congressmen.

This fate of the Indian Protestants, particularly of those who, like Kali Charan Banurji were patriotic (although of a Moderate type) and refused to hate the people of their own race, fared no better. They too were unacceptable to their ecclesiastical superiors because they refused to toe the loyalist line and meekly become "Macaulay's Children".¹¹⁶ At the same time, they were regarded with suspicion by their own people. Neither Kali Charan nor any prominent Protestant convert went to the extent of volunteering to perform any expiation ceremony. But even if they would do so, the cloud of doubt regarding their true identity would still have been

there. Such is the fate of a Christian convert who would like to be patriotic in the colonial milieu.

Earlier in this chapter we have spoken of denationalization. The Church, both Catholic and Protestant, was a chief agency of alienating the Indian converts from their own people. In this respect the European missionaries, barring a few honourable exceptions, acted as collaborators of imperialism. Even as late as 1925 Gandhi complained :

I have a letter from a Christian Indian before me telling me that he and his friends find it difficult to make the change [i.e. join the national mainstream], because of the opposition of their superiors. Some of them tell me that they are even zealously watched, and any movement on their part to identify themselves with national movement is strongly condemned.¹¹⁷

This is why Gandhi declared in 1935 :

If I had power and could legislate, I should certainly stop all proselytizing. It is the cause of much avoidable conflict between classes and unnecessary heart-burning among missionaries. ... In Hindu households the advent of a missionary has meant the disruption of the family coming in the wake of change of dress, manners, language, food and drink.¹¹⁸

When he was told that no such thing was associated with proselytization then (1935), Gandhi retorted :

The outward condition has perhaps changed, but the inward mostly remains. Vilification of Hindu religion, though subdued, is there. If there was a radical change in the missionaries' outlook would Murdoch's books be allowed to be sold in mission depots? Are those books prohibited by missionary societies? There is nothing but vilification of Hinduism in those books.¹¹⁹

A more detailed discussion on the political significance of missionary activities in India will lead us further away from the life and works of Upadhyay with which we are at present concerned. However, enough has been said above to show why Christianity proved to be an inadequate substitute for burning patriotism in case of Upadhyay.

As Gandhi noted : "Christian missionaries come to India under the shadow, or if you like, under the protection of a temporal power, and it creates an impassable bar."¹²⁰

[to be concluded]

Notes & References

76. Rathindranath Tagore, p. 50.
77. However, Upadhyay had a strong distaste for Buddhism. In an article published in *Bangdarsan* (Magh 1308 BS) he squarely blamed Buddhism for "the utter ruin of Hindusthan" (*Samaj*, p.43; *Rachanasamgraha*, p.29), for it had struck at the root of the *Varna* system. In the first issue of *Sandhya* he enumerated several periods of transition (*sandhya*) in Indian history. The first saw the appearance of Sri Krishna who gave the *Gita*. "The second *Sandhya* saw the great calamity in the guise of Buddhism. Ashram and Dharma having been broken to pieces, chaos and disorder reigned in Society. The third *Sandhya* saw the rise of Sankara. He broke through the absurdity of Buddhism and waved triumphantly the banner of Hinduism" (trans. in *The Blade*, p.131). Upadhyay used to offer a curious anthropological argument. Baron Fr. Von Hugel reports that Upadhyaya's "geniality towards the long varied Vedantic tradition in no degree softened, indeed evidently intensified the Swami's (sc. Upadhyay's) animus against all and every Buddhism. Thus he insisted that the Vedantic tradition is Indian, Aryan; while Buddhism

- is essentially Mongolian; that Buddhism has been overwhelmingly non-Indian and Mongolian even since its expulsion from India. Indeed he showed a disposition to suspect Mongol blood in Goutama himself or (at least) among his immediate, or early followers" (Quoted in *The Blade*, p. 206)! Von Hugel further says : "Buddhism, even present-day Buddhism, was sheer Atheism for this Swami; indeed his heat against it was too great for him to express, perhaps for himself to have reached much fixity of outline or clearness of insight in this angry contemptuous rejection of it" (ibid). Such a blood theory and race hatred have nothing to do with a true understanding of Buddhism, but they accord well with Upadhyay's predominantly choleric temperament.
78. The name of the Rev. J. N. Farquhar, a Scottish missionary, was transliterated by Upadhyay as *Parkaahaar*, i.e., eating pork and, by implication, one who eats pork.
79. For a more detailed survey of Upadhyay's Bengali prose, see Bhattacharya, 1410 BS.
80. *Rachanasamgraha*, pp.116-129,205-26.
81. Rathindranath Tagore, p.50. Dutta and Robinsor quote the words, "of a Hitlerian type" (p.135). But Rathindranath omitted this reference to Hitler in the Bengali version of his reminiscences (see pp.62-63). Rathindranath, however, is thoroughly mistaken when he writes : "It was this inborn national pride which made him finally give up Christianity and take to a militant form of Hinduism towards the end of his life" (ibid). Upadhyay's Hinduism was social rather than religious. Thus the contraposition between Christianity and Hinduism in Upadhyay's case is inappropriate. He was merely following in the footsteps of Roberto de Nobili (1577-1656), the Catholic missionary in South India and Matteo Ricci (1552-1610), another Catholic missionary in China. Both of them adopted the local customs of South India and China respectively, but did not give up Christianity. On the other hand, by wearing the garbs of a *sannyasi* or a Buddhist monk or of a Confucian scholar they gained both respect and a number of converts.
82. "Abhas," *Char Adhyay, Rabindra-Rachanabali*, vol. 8, p.514.
83. Cf. his invocation of the 'rural gods' (local deities) (*Rachanasamgraha*, p.223), glorification of Siva as a Vedic god (ibid, pp.217-19) and, more particularly, his attack on the English people as a race (Datta, Foreword to Mukhopadhyay-Mukhopadhyay, 1961, p. xvii), not merely the imperialists and their lackeys.
84. It is often forgotten that Bankim earned the eponym, "Rishi" (sage) only after his death. Celebration of Bankim's birthday at Kanthalpara, his native village, was started only in 1907. "On this occasion (8 April 1907) he (sc. Upadhyay) hired a steamer. It was full with members of the Nationalist party and volunteers," crying *Bande Mataram* (Bipin Vihari Das Gupta, former editor of *Bande Mataram*, contributed the chapter on the Swadeshi Movement in *The Blade*. The extract is taken from ibid., p.145).
85. For the primary and secondary meanings of this word, see Appendix A below.
86. 'The disciple Animananda possessed a complete collection of Upadhyay's work both in English and Bengali. When the police came to ransack his school for "seditious literature", he made a bonfire of it all. What a sacrifice it must have been for one who since his death had become so fond of his guru!' Turmes, p.71. Animananda, however, collected some of Upadhyay's English writings (viz. copies of *The Twentieth Century*) which are now preserved in the Goethals' Library, St. Xavier's College, Kolkata.
87. "Already on August 7th [1907] the premises of the Sandhya had been searched, both parties (sc. Upadhyay and the Government) had their spies. The search was not unexpected and Upadhyay's manuscripts passed street to street until they were burned in

- Nimtollah Ghat Street in a timber godown! What a pity for future historians! To mention but one item, the letters of Rabindranath to Upadhyay perished in that bonfire" (*The Blade*, p.168).
88. Foreword to Mukhopadhyay-Mukhopadhyay, 1961, p. xiii.
89. *The Blade*, p. 181. See. also pp.130n and 204.
90. Kartik Chandra Nan was somewhat amused to find Upadhyay after his expiation: "I was simply surprised at this sudden change from a 'Sannyasi' into a gentleman dressed in a white garb with shoes on. So I added : "When are you going to marry?" He remained silent, but [Mokshadacharan] Samadhyay[i] answered: "Is it not good that he has returned to the Hindu Samaj?" I added : "It is all right, this *Prayascitta* ceremony, but how will you manage the eating of the bread in the Church (holy Eucharist)?" "That is quite a different thing", he answered' (quoted in Turmes, p.54). Samadhyai was the officiating priest in the expiation ceremony, not Panchanan Tarkaratna (as Dutta mistakenly writes in his Preface to Debsharma, 1961, p.xviii). I too had made this mistake (Bhattacharya, 1987, p.120) by following Dutta). Samadhyai also officiated in Upadhyay's last rites at Kalighat on 6.11.1907 (see *Varia* 4, p.311).
91. Simha, p.99. However, I could not find any evidence that Sankaracharya empowered the Bharati community to work (for the people) while living in the midst of householders. The *Yati-dharma-nirnaya* merely states that the Bharati does not know the burden of sorrow and he carries the full weight of learning (p.387).
92. Kartik Chandra Nan reports that Upadhyay slept perhaps only once during the last two months of his life. "He performed no devotion either in the morning or at night. He might have done so privately but we never saw him doing so. He became irregular in the devotion that we did every wednesday in the presence of the picture of Christ ..." (Turmes, pp.53-54). Animananda records several events which show Upadhyay's vacillation since 1897: Upadhyay was not always keen to be known as a Christian, although all the while he was celebrating the feast of the church, receiving the holy sign of the cross, hearing masses and sometimes skipping all these (*The Blade*, pp.180-82), Whatever might have happened before 7.10.1907, the day Upadhyay performed the expiation ceremony, is of little importance to the study of his mindset between 7.10.1907 and 27.10.1907, the day he expired.
93. Rev. Bimalananda Nag, a Protestant missionary, reports that in Feb/March 1907 Upadhyay said to him, "I have entangled myself too much in political affairs, but as I read Dr. Cuthbert Hall's lectures, I seriously thought if I should not give up all these entanglements and begin to preach the religion of Christ as I was doing before" (*The Blade*, p.186).
94. In an article published in *The Tablet*, the mouthpiece of the English Catholics, he wrote (January, 1903) that since his conversion he had worked "as a lay man" towards the end of "winning over India to the Holy Catholic Church" (*The Blade*, p.113).
95. Simha, p.99. Indranath Bandhyopadhyay, Panchkadi Bandhyopadhyay and Panchanan Tarkaratna are said to have prevailed over him to go for a formal expiation ceremony. Upadhyay, however, had been living like a Hindu monk, wearing saffron and walking barefooted since 1894. He preferred to take refreshment away from the inner chambers of the Hindu households, because a *Sannyasi* should not have any contact with the domestic arrangement of the *grihi*-s. See Gangopadhyay, p.16.
96. The issue is of course highly complicated and calls for thorough analysis. I shall come back to it later. At present I should confine myself to saying that what Lipner writes in

- this regard (pp.377ff) seems to suffer from one vital shortcoming : he has not taken into account the more glaring fact that Upadhyay's penance was a *political* act, as Dutta has earlier suggested (1961 Foreward to Mukhopadhyay-Mukhopadhyay, p. xiv). See also Bhattacharya, 1988, pp.27-28).
97. After some initial hesitations and even strong objections, Indian Catholics have now decided that in spite of everything Upadhyay was no apostate, thanks to Animananda, Fr. P. Fallon, s.j. and others. Anil Mitra's dissertation also points to the same conclusion. The Hindus, on the other hand, have unaniously held that Upadhyay became a Hindu by *religion*, not merely by his return to *Samaja-dharma*, but also *Sadhana-dharma* (see Simha, p.99). Unfortunately they fail to appreciate the deep spiritual crisis that Upadhyay underwent during the last month of his life. Guha (p.81), I think, is nearer the truth.
98. See Lipner, pp. 261-62.
99. Letter to Fr. Dandoy dt. 13.2.23. *Varia* 2, p.193.
100. *The Blade*, Appendix I, p.iii. Upadhyay's earlier insistence on the proposed itinerant missionaries beings "thoroughly Hindu in their mode of life" (*Sophia*, October 1894) must have originated from this aversion to the use of foreign dress and manners by the Christian missionaries (both European and native) in India. He wrote : "In India a Sannyasi preacher commands the greatest respect. The central mission should, in short, adopt the policy of the glorious old Fathers of the South" (*The Blade*), p.59, alluding to Frs. Roberto de Nobili (1577-1656), and Constanzo Giuseppe Beschi (1680-1747), who came from Italy, and adopted the life and manners of South Indian *Sannyasis*. For details of their life and works, see the *New Catholic Encyclopedia*, vols. 2 and 10, pp. 340 and 407-08 respectively (summarized in Appendix B below).
101. For the etymology and various semantic implications of this word, see Appendix A. Upadhyay employed this word to abuse British imperialists and their lackeys. He used to say, "I am more afraid of the black Phiringi-s enchanted by the Phiringi manners (*phiringiyana*) than the Phiringi race (*jat*)". Quoted From "Upadhyay Katha" (About Upadhyay), *Sandhya*, 13.10.1907, Paper cutting in *Varia* 4, p.267.
102. Dubois, pp. xxv-xxvi. Henry K. Beauchamp, the translator and editor of Dubois's work, says : "The remark accordingly made by the Roman Catholic Bishop of Arga to Jacquemont is as applicable now (1897) as it was when it was uttered in 1828 : "La caldaja e molto grande, ma la carne e molto poca" [The cauldron is very large but the meat is very little]. Ibid, p.xxviii
103. See Day, p.211.
104. Quoted in Ray, p.96. Cf. Upadhyay's declaration in *Sophia*, July 1898 : "By birth we are Hindus and shall remain *Hindu* till death. But as *dvija* (twice born) by virtue of our sacramental rebirth we are *Catholic*, we are members of an indefectible communion embracing all ages and climes. (...) In short we are Hindus so far as our physical and mental constitution is concerned, but in regard to our immortal souls we are Catholics. We are Hindu Catholics" ("Are we Hindus?", quoted in *The Blade*, pp.71-73.). Upadhyay's idea was enthusiastically supported by some Catholics in Sri Lanka (then Ceylon) and by M.M. Suell, editor of *The Church Progress*. *The Blade*, pp.75-77.
105. See *Sandhya*, 29.10.1907 and the Editorial in *Sandhya* "two months after Upadhyay's death." Extracted in Animananda, *Swami*, etc., Part ii, pp. (26), (32).
106. *The Blade*, Appendix I, p. (iii). The original Hindi proverb is *dhobi ka kutta na gharka na ghatka*. The Sanskrit equivalent is more respectable : *na devaya na dharmaya*, "(fit) neither for the (Brahminical) god nor for the (Buddhist) dharma".

107. Ray, p.198.
108. The only other Bengali Catholic worth mentioning in this context is Athenasius Apurba Kumar Ghosh. In *Bande Mataram* (3.9.1906) Aurobindo Ghosh (later Sri Aurobindo) gratefully acknowledged his contributions to the working-class movement as well as the Swadeshi (p.48, also p.151). A. A. K. Ghosh was also a socialist by conviction. See Datta, 1949 (1983 reprint), pp.147-48. Very little is known about Ghosh's life and works. Radharaman Mitra regrets that A. A. K. Ghosh has been altogether forgotten by his people (p.141). In spite of my best efforts I could find precious little about Ghosh. Any information in this regard will be gratefully appreciated.
109. Quoted in Ray, p.126.
110. Upadhyay's comment on the European Jesuit Fathers is equally significant : "Every reasonable man must admit that they are doing admirable work in that line [sc. education] but it cannot be denied that though beneficial in many ways, the education given to our boys by the Jesuit Fathers *does not tend to national development*" (*Sophia* 17.10.1900. Quoted in *The Blade*, p.98. Emphasis added).
111. *The Blade*, p.99.
112. Surendranath Banerjee used to call the subjugation of India by British imperialism 'dispensation of God' (Dutta, 1390 BS, Appendix 6, p.61).
113. Pal, pp. 444-45. Kali Charan Banurji too is a forgotten name in Bengal, not to speak of the rest of India. But this is how M. K. Gandhi (1925) describes his eminence in the early years of the twentieth century:
 In answer to promises made to one of these Christian friends of mine [in South Africa] I thought it my duty to see *one of the biggest of Indian Christians, as I was told he was* – the late Kali Charan Banerjee ... His simplicity, his humility, his courage, his truthfulness, all these things I have all along admired (pp.29-30. Emphasis added).
 Gandhi met Kali Charan in 1901 (p.68). He remembers twenty-four years later : "I met the late Kali Charan Banerjee. Had I not known before I went there (sc. Kolkata) that he was a Christian, I should certainly not have noticed from the outward appearance of his home that he was one. It was no different from an ordinary modern Hindu home, – simple and meagre in furniture. The great man was dressed like an ordinary un-Europeanized Hindu-Bengali" (p.68).
114. The Brahmos were indignant at Upadhyay even earlier for the letters from abroad published in *Bangabasi* in 1903 (see *Rachanasamgraha*, p.187).
115. Upadhyay, however, used to draw a line between the *varnasrama-dharma* and the caste system as prevalent in his time. See "Tin Satru" (1900), *Rachanasamgraha*, p.19. See also Lipner, pp.228 ff.
116. A. K. Ramanujan is said to have coined this phrase. Richard Cronin describes both Nissim Ezekiel and Ramanujan as 'Children of [British] Raj, "Macaulay's children" ... rather than "midnight's".' (quoted in Sreenivasan, p.100).
 Kali Charan once taunted Macaulay, referring to his infamous minute (1835) : "Shade of Macaulay, how shall you meet the curt retort to your accusation of the Bengalis? Here is a whole land of promises with not an acre of performances" (quoted in Ray, p.191).
117. "For Christian Indians", *Young India*, 20.08.1925, in Gandhi, p.68.
118. "Interesting Questions", *Harijan*, 11.05.1935, in Gandhi, p.104.
119. Ibid.
120. Ibid, p.34.

Appendix A

A note on the word *Phiringi*

The word *phiringi* is spelt variously in modern European and Indian languages. This is how it has been explained by a Catholic scholar :

The Hindus had borrowed from their Mahomedan rulers or neighbours a contemptuous term to designate those 'denationalised' : the form *prangui*. Prangui (in Sanskrit *phirangin*, from the Persian *frangui*), was the name given by the Muslims, first to the European race which they had known best, but known as their toughest opponents on the battlefield : the Franks (Remember Charles Martel and Poitiers, and also the crusades). The Muslim had then applied the name to Europeans in general. (...)

Prangui summed in two syllables all the contempt which a people, that deems itself civilised, feels for those who do not share in its civilisation and fail to observe its 'good manners'.

In a footnote the author adds : 'In their ignorance of Sanskrit and of the meaning which the people attached to the name *prangui*, the missionaries had translated the question "Wilt thou embrace Christianity?" by "Wilt thou join the *prangui-kuiam* (or the *pranguimargam*)?"'

("A Sannyasi from the West", *The Light of The East*, 2:11, August 1924, p.5)

The word also appears in a sixteenth-century medical work in Sanskrit, *Bhavaprakasa* by Bhavamisra, as *phirangaamaya*, to mean "the disease of the Franks i.e. syphilis" (Monier- Williams' dictionary), for the disease was brought to India by the Portuguese (Winternitz, vol.3, p.675). In Bengali the word is found in the *Chandimangal* of Mukunda Chakrabarti (sixteenth century) and the *Annadamangal* of Bharatchandra Ray (eighteenth century) (see Haricharan Bandyopadhyay, s.v.). The name was originally quite innocuous, suggesting not only the Portuguese and other Europeans but also the hybrid Eurasians, and later the Anglo-Indians. It was synonymous with *Saheb*. But, in the hands of Upadhyay *phiringi* became a derogatory term, meaning exclusively the Britishers and their Indian minions. Upadhyay provided a fanciful etymology, totally satirical in intent (see *Rachanasamgraha*, pp.97-98; extracts translated in Lipner, pp.360-61). Upadhyay, however, told his associates, "... we do not hate the *phiringi* - but hate *phiringi* manners (*phiringiyana*), for that is inconducive to the ambience of our country - does not fit in the customs of our illimitable past" (*Sandhya*, 31.10.1907, paper cutting in *Varia* 4, p.267).

For further sidelights on *phiringi*, see Yule and Burnell ("Firinghee") and Das (s.v.).

Appendix B

Biographical Notes**Costanzo Giuseppe Beschi**

Costanzo Giuseppe Beschi was an Italian Jesuit missionary in South India and the foremost Christian poet in the Tamil language. He was born in Castiglione, Italy on 8 November, 1680 and died in Manapar, India on 4 February, 1747. He knew Greek, Latin, French and Portuguese. He joined Society of Jesus in 1698, left for India, reached Goa and then landed at Tirunelveli in extreme south in 1711. He then proceeded to Madura in 1716. He became an expert in Tamil under the scholarly guidance of Supradipa Kavirayar, and learned Sanskrit, Telegu and other South Indian languages as well as Persian and Urdu. He composed poems, dictionaries, grammars and manuals on religion, didactic and medical themes and wrote Tamil grammars in Latin. He also translated *Kural* into Latin verse. He adopted the Tamil form of life in dress, food and so on. Beschi is more popularly known in southern India as Viramanunivar (The Heroic Sage) and Dhairyanathar (Lord of Courage). As the author of the first dictionary, *Chaturaharathi*, he is called the father of Tamil lexicography; as the author of the Tamil grammar, *Tonnul Vilakkam*, he seems to have advocated certain innovations in Tamil orthography. His prose writings are said to have laid the foundation for modern Tamil prose. His poems, the hagiological *Kitteriannal Charitram* (*On the Martyr St. Quiterea*) and *Tembavani* (1726. *Unfading Garland*), form his magnum opus. This epic is divided into three parts - 36 cantos and 3615 stanzas.

Jean-Antoine Dubois

Jean-Antoine Dubois was a French educator, abbot and priest. He was born in Saint Remeze in 1765 and died in Paris on February 17, 1848. He was sent to South India and stayed for a long time (1792?-1823), mostly at Pondicherry. Ultimately he got convinced that the conversion of the Hindus was impossible. He went back to France and worked as Director of the *Missions Etrangeres* (Foreign Mission). Like Roberto de Nobili and Beschi he too learnt Sanskrit and Tamil, and translated the *Panchatantra* into French (1826). His magnum opus is the *Moeurs, institutions et ceremonies des peuples de l'Inde* (1825) which, however, first appeared in English as *Description of the Character, Manners, and Customs of the People of India and of their Institutions, Religious and Civil* (1817). Following his predecessors, he "adopted the garb, the manners", and, as he says, "even the prejudices of the people among whom his lot was cast" (Srinivasa Iyengar) but could not reap the same kind of profit due to the changed circumstances caused by the advent of British power in India. Rammohun Roy quoted a long extract from Dubois's *Letters on the State of Christianity in India*, in his reply (dt. 2.2.1824) to certain queries made by the Rev. Henry Ware of Cambridge, Mass. (USA). See his "A letter on the Prospects of Christianity and the means of promoting its reception in India", *Works*, Part 4, pp. 45-47. Incidentally Dubois found fault with the Bengali translation of the Bible published by the Baptist Missionaries at Serampore (ibid, p.47). Strangely enough, Halfass does not pay much attention to Dubois. *The New Catholic Encyclopedia*, too, has no entry on this French Abbe.

Roberto de Nobili

Roberto de Nobili was a missionary in South India and pioneer in the method of missionary adaptation. He was born in Rome in September 1577. He died in Mylapore, India on 16 January, 1656. In April 1604, Nobili left for India. He arrived in Goa on 20 May 1605. He learned Tamil among the Paravas of the Fishery Coast. Nobili's method of conversion was as follows: he adopted the saffron dress, wooden clogs and vegetarian diet of a *sannyasi*. He marked his brow with a rectangular shape of paste to signify that he was a teacher. When the people of Madura learned that he was the son of a count, they identified him with the caste of rulers, or *Rajas*. As a *Raja sannyasi* Nobili was now free to associate with Indians of the higher castes without defiling them. In the first eighteen months he converted 50 people. He became friends with Sivadarma, a Brahmin Sanskrit scholar and got knowledge of Sanskrit, the Vedas and Vedanta. In 1609 Nobili converted Sivadarma. He allowed the Brahmins to retain their thread and *kudumi* (single plait of hair). Though protest came from many corners, it was approved by both the grand inquisitor of Portugal and the new Pope, Gregory XV in 1623. During the controversial years (1610-23), he was forbidden to baptize and therefore wrote a lot. *Ganaopadesam* (Spiritual Teaching) is virtually a *Summa theologiae*. From 1623 he baptized and travelled in South India. In 1654 his eyesight failing he retired to Madura. When he left for Mylapore, the Christians numbered from 0 (zero) to 4183.

Matteo Ricci

Italian Jesuit, eminent missionary scientist, founder of the modern Chinese Church, and pioneer of cultural relations between Europe and China, Matteo Ricci was born in Macerata, March of Ancom, on 6 October 1552, and died at Beijing, China on 11 May 1610. When 16, he was sent to Rome for higher studies, but discarding the legal profession he entered Saint Andrea novitiate on 15 August 1571. One year later he began his university courses at the Roman College, where his professor of mathematics was the celebrated Christopher Clavius. Having his mind long set on the Asian missions, he set out for Portugal on 18 May 1577, and the following spring sailed from Lisbon to the East Indies, reaching Goa on 13 September 1578. There he applied himself to theology until the early months of 1582 and was ordained at midpoint of his studies at Chochin on 25 July 1580. His conquest through learning is as follows. Ricci's fellow Jesuit in Rome and Goa, Pompilio (Michele) Ruggieri, was summoned to Macao in 1579. Ruggieri wanted to break through China's isolation by engaging the Chinese intelligentsia on its level of language, social customs and superior talent. No sooner had Ricci completed his study of theology than he too was ordered to Macao to help Ruggieri. He reached the Portuguese colonial outpost on 7 August 1582 and on 10 September 1583 they settled at Chaoking (Chao-ching). They adopted the garb of Buddhist monks. In May 1585, they dedicated a small church and residence. As an honoured scientist Ricci instantly made his reputation as a scientist of astonishing versatility. Of his many works, the treatise *Tien-chu Shih-i* stands out as

his magnum opus. Later he wrote "Doctor from the Great West Ocean". He then wore the ceremonial square bonnet and silk robes of the Confucian scholar. On 4 August, 1597 he was accorded great superiority and power as he became the director of Jesuit personnel and works in China. On 7 September 1598 Ricci reached Beijing but had to leave it. Later he came to Beijing on 24 January 1601. He was known throughout the realm as *Li Menton*, the missionary scholar from the West, and remained one of the most respected foreign figures in Chinese history. Joseph Needham describes Ricci as "one of the most remarkable and brilliant men in history" (Vol. 1, p. 148).

Compiled by Saubhik Datta and Malayendu Dinda.

Works cited :

- Animananda, B. *The Blade*. Calcutta : Roy & Son, n.d.
- . *Swami Upadhyay Brahmabandhav*. Calcutta : [The Author?], Parts I & II, 1908.
- . *Varia*. Vols 1-4 (Assortment of paper cuttings, Interviews, Stray notes and comments, etc.)
- Bhattacharya, Ramkrishna. "Brahmabandhab Upadhyay". in *Banlar Manisha*. Ed. Sudhir Kumar Gangopadhyay et al. Calcutta : Sarat Publishing House, Vol 2, 1987.
- . "Brahmabandhav Upadhyayer Gadya", *Sahitya Parishat Patrika*. 110:3, 1410 BS.
- . "Brahmabandhab Prayaschitta", *Parichay*. Autumn No. 1395 B.S. (1988).
- Cronin, Richard, "India" in *The Oxford Guide to Contemporary World Literature*. Ed. John Sturrock. Oxford : Oxford University Press, 1996.
- Datta, Dr. Bhupendranath. *Bharater Dwitiya Swadhinatar Samgram*, Kolkata : Nababharat Publishers, 1983.
- . *Aprakasita Rajnitik Itihas*. Kalikata : Nababharat Publishers, 1390 BS.
- Debsarmma, Balal. *Brahmabandhab Upadhyay*. Kolkata : Probartak Publishers, 1368 BS.
- Dubois, Abbe J-A. *Hindu Manners, Customs and Ceremonies*. Oxford : Clarendon Press, 1972.
- Dutta, Krishna and Andrew Robinson. *Rabindranath Tagore. The myriad-minded man*. Calcutta: Rupa & Co., 2000.
- Fallon, Fr. Pierre. "Brahmabandhav Upadhyay 1861-1907", *Visva-bharati Patrika*. Kartik-Paus 1968.
- . "Unpublished Notes on Upadhyay's Theism and Image Worship" in *Varia* 2, pp. 39-56
- Gandhi, M.K. *Christian Missions. Their Place in India*. Ed. Bharatam Kamarappa. Ahmedabad: Navajivan Publishing House, 1957.
- Gangopadhyay, Manomohan. *Sruti-Smriti*. Kalikata : Abanimohan Gangopadhyay, 1334 BS.
- Halbfass, Wilhelm. *India and Europe*. New York : State University of New York Press, 1988.
- Lipner, Julius. J. *Brahmabandhab Upadhyay. The Life and Thought of a Revolutionary*. Delhi : Oxford University Press, 1999.
- Mitra, Anil s.j. *Religious Views of Swami Brahmabandhav Upadhyaya, the First Indian Christian Theologian*. Unpublished Dissertation for the Licentiate in Theology, St Mary's College, Kurseong, Darjeeling, January 1970.
- Mitra, Radharaman. *Kalikata Darpan*. Part I. Kolkata : Subarnarekha, 1980.
- Mukhopadhyaya, Haridas and Uma Mukhopadhyaya. *Upadhyay Brahmabandhab O Bharatiya Jatiyatabad*. Kalikata : Firma K. L. Mukhopadhyay, 1961.
- Needham, Joseph. *Science and Civilization in China*. Vol 1. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1961.
- New Catholic Encyclopaedia*. Detroit and New York : Thomson & Gale, 2003.
- Pal, Bipin Chandra. *Memories of My Life and Times*. Calcutta : Bipinchandra Pal Institute, 1973.
- Pal, Prasantakumar. *Rabijibani*. Vol. 5, Kolkata : Ananda Publishers, 1990.
- Ray, Alok, *Unis Satak*. Kolkata : Prama, 2002.
- Roy, Raja Rammohun. *The English Works*. Ed. Kalidas Nag and Debajyoti Burman. Part iv, Calcutta : Sadharan Brahma Samaj, 1947.
- Simha, Prabodh Chandra. *Upadhyay Brahmabandhab*. Uttarpara : Amarendranath Chattopadhyay. n.d.
- Sreenivasan, S. "The Politics of Culture : Evaluating the Poetry of Latin America, Africa and India", *Journal of Literature & Aesthetics*, Vol 2 No. 1, January-June 2002, pp.96-101
- Tagore, Rathindranath. *On the Edges of Time*. Calcutta : Visva Bharati Publishing Deptt, 1981 (first pub. 1958).
- Thakur, Rathindranath. *Pitrismriti*. Kalikata : Jijnasa, 1373 BS (1966).
- Thakur, Rabindranath. *Rabindra-Rachanabali*, Vol. 8. Kalikata : Paschimanga Sarkar, 1986.
- Turmes, P. s. j. *A Teacher of Genius. B. Animananda*. Calcutta : Xavier Publication, 1963.
- Upadhyay, Brahmabandhab. *Rachanasamgraha*. Ed. Baridbaran Ghosh. Kalikata : College Street Publications. 1987.
- Yati-dharmma-nirnayah*. Uttarabgah. Ed. Priyanatha Tattvaratna. Kasi: 1964 Samvat. P A S

DEATH IN JUDICIAL CUSTODY (1995-1998) IN WEST BENGAL

[*The West Bengal Human Rights Commission in its Annual Reports 1997-98 had found that the number of custodial deaths while in Judicial Custody is quite large and that in a number of cases such death is attributable to medical negligence or delay in providing medical facilities, there is also lack of medical support. This has been considered by the Department of Jails and has proposed taking immediate action on the recommendations of the commission.*

The Department has constituted a committee to study the cases of custodial deaths with three members comprising two medical specialists and one a seniormost jail official. The Committee has studied the cases of custodial deaths in Jails for the last three years with the following terms of reference.

- 1. Whether the cases of custodial deaths are attributable to medical negligence or delay in securing access to medical facilities.*
 - 2. Whether there was any lack of medical support in jails needed for maintaining health of the inmates or, rendering proper medical treatment to them.*
 - 3. The Committee should also submit their detailed suggestions on remedial measures with the financial involvement to put into effect the recommendations of the Committee.*
- The Committee has submitted a report in January, 2000. This is an excerpt of that report. Ed. PAS.]*

WHY THIS INQUIRY

This type of Inquiry is essential for any agency of a country to protect the basic human rights of its people, even for those who are in the marginal status. So this inquiry has therefore been done following the terms of reference of the G.O. But apart from these the Committee has something more to say regarding the introductory part of this inquiry.

Man is destined to die either naturally or unnaturally. And it is the rule of law to call each and every death either in police custody or in judicial custody as an unnatural death. So it is the duty of the custodian to prove whether the death is natural or not. Now it is a routine affair for us to make a thorough investigation and after compilation of all the relevant documents we make a reconstruction of the whole incidence as much as possible true to the facts. From this reconstruction we can make an inference whether there is any sort of negligence or cruelty on the part of the jail administration.

In social history, jail is a very sensitive part of the society and no description of a social system is complete without the discussion of the jails. Person who is suspected or is judged as not fit to stay in the mainstream is confined in the judicial custody. Still in the people's psyche the jail is synonymous with torture, agony, pain in captivity, filthy living conditions, worst quality of food and quality of life.

The police department has to face such a situation in any lock-up death. They have to tackle with some immediate measures to save the life and property of the citizen. It is also a very sensitive phenomenon of society. People are very much critical regarding police

inaction or excess, eitherway. They are now also vulnerable as any measures they take are judged in the context of violating Human Rights requirements. But their problems are a bit different from jails. Because the jail is an area where inmates reside for short and long terms even upto twenty five years. The judicial custodian has to look after all the physical and welfare side of this marginal part of society. So there is every possibility for a commission or an omission in the day to day life. For this reason it is mandatory on the part of the custodian to carry out reviews at regular intervals. This is the first time that the Dept. of Jail, Govt. of West Bengal is carrying out this inquiry with a body of experts just to make a rational assessment of the most sensitive part of its day to day performances—the health status of the prisoners.

It is needless to say that the custodial deaths are directly related to prevailing health care delivery system and it is a fact that the infrastructure existing in jails for providing medical aid to the inmates is grossly inadequate. But considering the outside State Hospitals run by the Health Dept., it can be said that these jail hospitals are not as bad as a place in hell. On the contrary it is astonishing to consider that crores of rupees are being spent to maintain good physical and mental health of the prisoners ! Yet death occurs as a part of life and there is a strong suspicion whether it is caused by any omission or commission on the part of jail administration or whether the administration has taken all possible measures to save the life of the prisoners.

In this term of reference the Medical Committee has been entitled to investigate the following point ---

1. To study the nature of each and every death during the period of inquiry.
2. Whether there was any negligence on the part of the jail administration to save the life of the prisoner, specially to ascertain what the health care facility has been provided and whether it has been provided with timely intervention.
3. Whether the existing medical service systems are adequate to face an emergency or day to day requirement of the inmates.
4. Whether medical and paramedical staff are adequate and that they attend their duties properly covering round the clock services.
5. Whether regular physical and mental health check-up is done for the inmates specially on first admission.
6. Whether the existing infrastructure is sufficient or requires further upgradation/modernisation/help or guidance.
7. Whether there is need for any special type of hospital to meet the existing medical problems of the inmates.

Methodology taken for this inquiry

The time period for this inquiry of custodial deaths was to cover the last three years. The Committee has accordingly spread it from April 1995 to March 1998. During these three years there are 155 cases of incidences of custodial deaths in West Bengal jails. The Committee then separated the death cases that occurred in the jail although there was sufficient time to shift the patient to outside State Hospitals. The Committee asked the Jail Directorate and the concerned jails to send all the relevant papers related to the death cases so that the experts can do a homework beforehand before examining the cases. The Committee had identified

the cases where death occurred inside the jail and decided to visit those jails personally to investigate those cases thoroughly throughout the State. It can be said that the Committee has investigated all these cases exhaustively. Here their point of inquiry was with the following parameters – (a) whether the inmate had been identified in any way for his illness beforehand, (b) whether after identification of his illness he had been given sufficient attention to relieve his ailments, (c) whether there was negligence by any person of the administration to provoke him into an utter helpless condition of no return, and (d) whether the life of the inmate could be saved by intervention in appropriate time.

The Committee has examined the original records of the concerned jail and interrogated the concerned staff present or related with that death. Even the members have verified physically the area and the circumstances to make a reconstruction in imagination of the incidence. In many cases the Committee could talk with the eye-witnesses specially with the long term fellow inmates who could vividly describe the cases. But many time it could not be possible to get anybody who could describe the incidence specially in the case of sub-jails where documents were the only source of evidence. Though after careful study of these documents it can be safely said that these documents are not full proof. In many areas even the post-mortem reports are weak and faulty. It was difficult to corroborate the recorded clinical findings and the circumstances as it occurred. These are the most neglected areas of the jail administration where many of the documents are either doctored or fabricated to protect the local administration. The Committee is sorry to say that record-keeping regarding medical matters of jail inmates is very very poor. So much so that in many places many of the important documents could not be found creating difficulties to complete the investigations. In many cases the Committee could not read the whole body text of the post-mortem report or the inquest report or many other relevant papers due to illegible photocopies.

Every death case is unique and different from others though the Committee has tried to filter out some of the important common features to better understand the intricate problems. There is a large number of undertrial prison population who have suffered custodial death. The jail administration has faced a unique difficulty with this population. Generally when they get admitted to the jail their problems are unnoticed if they do not have any major injury. In case of severe injury they get the attention of the authority though usually without any previous records of ailments. But in the absence of injury, an apparently healthy but potentially serious patient becomes victim of negligence. Either they become scared or are confused on entering the jail-gate. Moreover it is a common feeling of our administration that in all cases of showing any ailment they are malingering for, some primary gain. This is because they do not have any previous record when picked up by the police.

Lastly the Committee has examined physically the infrastructure and facilities available in the health unit of the concerned jail. In many places there is lack of minimum medical facility specially in all the sub-jails, some of the district jails even in some central jails where lack of co-ordination or supervision is the main factor in spite of wastage of resources. However it is very difficult to make a 24 hour coverage with medical care of any jail in any time. So the Committee has to consider the situation in every case how much time it has taken for the doctor or any paramedical staff to attend the patient after noticing his ailment. Even in the case where doctor resides on the jail premises, it takes at least half an hour to reach to the patient. In majority of the cases the doctor formally attended to declare the

patient dead.

In case of the deaths which occurred outside in State Hospitals the jail administrations are in a safer position but they cannot shake off their responsibility because they have to consider how much valuable time they have wasted to shift the patient to the outside hospital for better intensive care. But in many cases the Committee cannot find the full records of shifting the patients and it is difficult for them to judge and fix responsibility on jail administration. So the Committee has to depend on some amount of approximation and estimation for this reconstruction.

Throughout this inquiry the Committee has got full co-operation from all categories of staff. In many cases it has found that the staff are so innocent or careless as not understand or realise the gravity or seriousness of this inquiry. Sometimes it has become very difficult to convince them regarding the method of inquiry specially the collection of detailed information, since they are not familiar with this kind of inquiry.

JUDICIAL CUSTODY DEATHS IN WEST BENGAL (From 1-4-95 to 16-11-98).

Sl.Type	Name & Jail	Date & Place	Clinical Cause of death (as per records available)
1. Convict	Baikuntha Nag Suri Dist. Jail	7.4.95 at Suri Dist. Jail	By falling from the upper branch of a tree.
2. U.T.P.	Gokul Murmu Hooghly Dist. Jail	13.4.95 at Imambara Sadar Hospital	Cardio-respiratory failure due to acute PVO.
3. U.T.P.	Tapas Saha Midnapore Cl. Jail	30.4.95 at Midnapore Sadar Hospital	Suffering from lump abdomen & retroperitoneal growth.
4. Stray Girl	Kalpana Das Presidency Jail	3.5.95 at S. N.P. Hospital	-
5. N. C. L.	Sadhan Prasad Chowdhury, Alipore Special Jail	19.5.95 at M.R. Bangur Hospital	Cardio-respiratory failure in a case of mental illness.
6. U.T.P.	Shyamal Paul Ranaghat Sub Jail	13.5.95 at Saktinagar Hospital, Krishnagar	Due to shock and haemorrhage as a result of antemortem injuries which is homicidal in nature.
7. U.T.P.	Md. Alam, Presidency Jail	10.4.95 at Presidency Jail Hospital	Cardio-respiratory failure in a case of lacerated injuries on both the buttocks.
8. U.T.P.	Dedha Barman Raiganj Sub Jail	24.4.95. at Raiganj Jail Hospital	Due to sudden Heart failure.
9. U.T.P.	Jamat Ali Mondal Dum Dum Cl. Jail	20.5.95 at R. G. Kar Hospital	Cardio-respiratory failure in a case of severe haematemesis and malaena.

10. U.T.P.	Swami Swarupananda Abadhut, Ranaghat Sub Jail.	6.6.95 at Krishnanagar State Hospital	-
11. U.T.P.	Name not known Malda Dist. Jail	17.6.95 at Berham-pore Mental Hospital	Cardio-respiratory failure due to anaemia.
12. U.T.P.	Bapi Chowdhury Dum Dum Cl. Jail	31.5.95 at N.R.S. Medical College & Hospital	Cardio-respiratory failure in a case of space occupying lesion.
13. U.T.P.	Shibnath show Alipore Cl. Jail	4.7.95 at Alipore Cl. Jail	Cardio-respiratory failure in a case of brain cancer.
14. U.T.P.	Mahadeb Moulick Dum Dum Cl. Jail	7.6.95 at R.G. Kar Hospital	Cardio-respiratory failure in a case of malnutrition with gum bleeding.
15. U.T.P.	Sunil Ch. Sarkar Presidency Jail	24.7.95 at Presidency Jail Hospital	Cardio-respiratory failure due to myocardial infarction.
16. Convict	Pradip Ghosh Alipore Cl. Jail	7.8.95 at S. N. Pandit Hospital	Cardio-respiratory failure in a case of lymphoproliferative disease.
17. Convict	Mohan Karmakar Malda Dist. Jail	14.8.95 at Malda Sadar Hospital	Cardio-respiratory failure in pulmonary TB. low g.c.
18. U.T.P.	Sabdu Sahajamal Berhampore Cl. Jail	28.8.95 at Berhampore Sadar Hospital	He was suffering from chronic illness with bleeding from mouth & nose.
19. U.T.P.	Gostha Ghosh Dinhata Sub Jail	8.9.95 at Cooch-behar Sadar Hospital	Cardio-respiratory failure due to CVA.
20. Safe Custody	Balai Soren Alipore Cl. Jail	5.10.95 at Alipore Cl. Jail Hospital	Cardio respiratory failure in a case of Tuberculosis.
21. Male chil of U.T.P.	Sukhibalal Ghorami Midnapore Cl. Jail	8.9.95 at Midnapore Sadar Hospital	Cardio-respiratory failure in a case of Acute Bronchitis.
22. U.T.P.	Wajed Ali Golder Alipore Cl. Jail	16.10.95 at Alipore Cl. Jail Hospital	Cardio-respiratory failure in a case of massive myocardial infarction.
23. U.T.P.	Sambhu Thapa Durgapur Sub Jail	18.10.95 at Durgapur State Hospital	Natural death.
24. U.T.P.	Bilas Naskar Alipore Spl. Jail	13.10.95 at Alipore Spl. Jail	Cardio-respiratory failure due to chronic schizophrenia.

25. N.C.L.	Shantipada Mukherjee Alipore Spl. Jail	10.10.95 at Alipore Spl. Jail Hospital	Cardio-respiratory failure in a case of carcinoma of laryngopharynx metastasis of cervical lymphnode (right-side) with severe anaemia. Suffering from T.B.
26. U.T.P.	Sankar Rao Midnapore Cl. Jail	2.11.95 at Midnapore Sadar Hospital	
27. U.T.P.	Enshan Mallick Hooghly Dist. Jail	12.11.95 at Imambara Sadar Hospital	Complication of malnourishment and pericardial effusion present.
28. N.C.L.	Sachin Das Gupta Dum Dum Cl. Jail	10.11.95 at Chittaranjan National Cancer Institute	Cardio-respiratory failure in a case of carcinoma of anal canal.
29. U.T.P.	Raju Sk. Lalgola open Air Jail	17.11.95 at Open Air Jail	Suffering from T.B. Natural death.
30. U.T.P.	Saktipada Lohar Bisnupur Sub Jail	12.11.95 at Calcutta Medical College & Hospital	Cardio-respiratory failure in a case of left ventricular failure.
31. U.T.P.	Raju Das Alipore Cl. Jail	12.10.95	Road Traffic Accident.
32. Convict	Guru Pada Pathak Purulia Dist. Jail	22.11.95 at Purulia Sadar Hospital	Natural death.
33. Female baby of victim girl	Kalpna Garai Bankura Dist. Jail	27.11.95 at Bankura Sammilani Medical College & Hospital	Due to breathing distress.
34. U.T.P.	Rupchand Sk. Katwa Sub Jail	27.11.95 at Katwa Sadar Hospital	In a case of encephalitis.
35. U.T.P.	Sk. Lal Presidency Jail	14.12.95 at Presidency Jail Hospital	Cardio-respiratory failure in a case of severe haemetemesis with bleeding piles.
36. U.T.P.	Atwar Mia Dinhata Sub Jail	9.1.96 at M.J.N. Hospital, Cooch-Bihar	Suffering from several diseases.
37. U.T.P.	Dipak Das Presidency Jail	13.1.96 at S.S.K.M Hospital	Cardio-respiratory failure in a case of septicemia.
38. N.C.L.	Sitanath Chakraborty Alipore Spl. Jail	5.1.96 at S.N. Pandit Hospital	Cardio-respiratory failure in a case of chest infection with depressive psychosis.

39. U.T.P.	Noushad Sk. Bolpur Sub Jail	12.1.96 at Bolpur Sub Divisional Hospital	-
40. Convict	Sitaram Passi Alipore Cl. Jail	23.1.96 at Alipore Cl. Jail Hospital	Cardio-respiratory failure due to massive myocardial infarction.
41. U.T.P.	Safiuddin Molla Alipore Central Jail	16.2.96 at Alipore Cl. Jail Hospital	Cardio-respiratory failure due to myocardial infarction.
42. U.T.P.	Sutroo Nagisia Siliguri Spl. Jail	23.2.96 at N.B.M.C. & Hospital, Siliguri	with a history of pulmonary T.B.
43. Convict	Darastulla Malda Dist. Jail	20.2.96 at Malda Sadar Hospital	Senile degeneration of brain & liver diseases.
44. U.T.P.	Hamid Mian Islampore Sub Jail	29.2.96 at N.B.M. College & Hospital	Due to effects of generalised disability & ill-health associated with extensive bilateral pulmonary Tuberculosis.
45. Released Convict	Baburam Das Dum Dum Cl. Jail	10.3.96 at Dum Dum Cl. Jail Hospital	Cardio-respiratory failure in a case of Bronchial Asthma.
46. U.T.P.	Poulin Manik Uluberia Sub Jail	24.3.96 at Uluberia Sadar Hospital	Cardio-respiratory failure in a case of obstructive lung disease with bad general condition.
47. U.T.P.	Amit Swar Krishnanagar Dist. Jail	1.4.96 at Krishnanagar Dist. Jail	Committed suicide by hanging from tree inside the Jail.
48. U.T.P.	Sahajada Khan Alipore Cl. Jail	5.4.96 at Alipore Central Jail	He felt severe left side chest pain and suddenly collapsed in presence of the Medical officer.
49. Convict	Sattar Sk. Berhampore Cl. Jail	8.4.96 at Berhampore Sadar Hospital	He had been receiving treatment for oedema in Jail Hospital.
50. U.T.P.	Mir Bahadur Tamang Alipore Cl. Jail	17.4.96 at M.R. Bangur Hospital	Cardio-respiratory failure in a case of plural effusion with malnutrition.
51. U.T.P.	Barun Banset Burdwan Dist. Jail	11.5.96 at Burdwan Medical College & Hospital	Cardio-respiratory failure in a case of head injury.
52. U.T.P.	Murad Rao D.D. Cl. Jail	29.4.96 at Beleghata I.D. Hospital	Tetanus

53. U.T.P.	Satya Narayan Passi Barrackpore Sub Jail	3.5.96 at Dr. B.N. Bose Hospital	-		70. Convict	Lakshmi Gorain Midnapore Cl. Jail	7.10.96 at Midnapore Cl. Jail	Due to general haemorrhage.
54. Convict	Barka Hansda Berhampore Cl. Jail	10.5.96 at Berhampore Dist. Hospital	Suffering from Cancer		71. Convict	Golam Sarwar Alipore Cl. Jail	30.9.96 at Calcutta Medical College & Hospital	C.R.F. in a case of Hepatic encephalopathy.
55. U.T.P.	Gobind Bhumij Alipore C/Jail	18.5.96 at Alipore Cl. Jail Hospital	Due to pathological condition of the lungs with complication of immobilisation due to extensive injuries.		72. U.T.P.	Bapi Halder Alipore Cl. Jail	16.9.96 at M.R. Bangur Hospital	C.R.F. in a case of Pulmonary tuberculosis complicated with haemoptysis.
56. U.T.P.	Shankar Das Midnapore Cl. Jail	23.5.96 at Midnapore Sadar Hospital	-		73. Convict	Radheshyam Agarwal, Presidency Jail	15.11.96 at S.S. K.M. Hospital	-
57. U.T.P.	Ashis Ghosh Presidency Jail	16.5.96 at S.N. Pandit Hospital	-		74. U.T.P.	Snehalata Bag Presidency Jail	14.11.96 at Presidency Jail Hospital	Due to effects of the diseased condition of the heart due to natural cause.
58. U.T.P.	Shankar Tanti Durgapore Sub Jail	21.5.96 at B.M.C. and Hospital	Tubercular lymphadenitis & malnutrition.		75. U.T.P.	Banghidhar Dutta Purulia Dist. Jail	25.11.96 at Purulia Sadar Hospital	-
59. U.T.P.	Baburam Tamang Berhampore Cl. Jail	13.6.96. at Berhampore Sadar Hosp.	Bilateral pulmonary Koch's infection.		76. U.T.P.	Kalpataru Pal Berhampore Cl. Jail	30.11.96 to B. Cl. Jail	Due to asphyxia caused by obstruction of food which was antemortem and incidental.
60. U.T.P.	Nirmal Batul Mondal Lalbagh Sub Jail	11.7.96 at Lalbagh Sub Jail	Committed suicide by hanging himself with a napkin.		77. U.T.P.	Gurudas Ganguly A. Cl. Jail	27.11.96 at A. Cl. Jail.	Cirrhosis Liver
61. Convict	Debendra Nath Bolpur sub Jail	27.7.96 at Suri District Hosp.	He had been suffering from Tuberculosis.		78. N.C.L.	Pradip Dutta Alipore Spl. Jail	30.11.96 in Jail Hospital	C.R.F. in a case of myocardial infarction, suffering from Chronic Schizophrenia.
62. Convict	Abhiram Mahali Mardi, Berhampore Central Jail	29.7.96 at Berhampore Sadar Hosp.	-		79. U.T.P.	Laxmi Narayan Malik, Uluberia Sub Jail.	10.12.96 at Uluberia S. D. Hospital.	-
63. U.T.P.	Mohan Baskey Malda Dist. Jail	28.6.96 at Malda Sadar Hospital	Due to affects of pulmonary infarction antemortem in nature.		80. U.T.P.	Hossain Ali Tarafder Molla, D.D. Cl. Jail.	11.12.96 at D.D. Cl. Jail Hospital.	Due to the effects of Injuries.
64. Convict	Premba Lama Asansol special Jail	7.7.96 at K.S. Roy T.B. Hospital	Drug-resistant Tuberculosis		81. Convict	Altap Khan	10.12.96	-
65. Male baby of victim girl	Manodi Hembram Asansol special Jail	27.8.96 at Asansol Sub-divisional Hospital	-		82. U.T.P.	Pradip Das, Krishnagar Dist. Jail	20.1.97 at Saktinagar Hospital Nadia.	C.R.F. in a case of gastrointestinal haemorrhage & Low g.c.
66. U.T.P.	Goutam Pramanik Asansol special Jail	2.9.96 S.N. Pandit Hospital	C.R.F. in a case of hepatic coma.		83. U.T.P.	Sunil Show Serampore Sub Jail	11.1.97 at Imambara Hospital Hooghly.	-
67. U.T.P.	Haider Ali Presidency Jail	27.8.96 at I.D. Hospital	Due to Rabies.		84. U.T.P.	Swapan Kr. Dey Presidency Jail	21.1.97 at M.R. Bangur Hospital.	C.R.F. in a case of bilateral extensive pulmonary kochs.
68. U.T.P.	Laxmikant Hembram Bankura Dist. Jail	19.9.96 at Bankura Sammilani Medical College & Hospital	C.R.F. in a case of bilateral pulmonary T. B. associated with depressive fuge & low g.c.		85. U.T.P.	Srinibash Modak B. Cl. Jail	28.1.97 at Sadar Hospital, Berhampore.	-
69. U.T.P.	Bikas Sarkar Burdwan Dist. Jail	17.9.96 at Burdwan Dist. Jail	Committed suicide hanging from a mango tree inside the Jail.		86. Released con.	Panchanan Saha, Dum Dum Cl. Jail	9.2.97 at Dum Dum Central Jail Hospital	C.R.F. in a case of asphyxia in a case of epilepsy with psychosis.
					87. Convict	Dinesh Dolui Berhampore Cl. Jail	12.2.97. at B.Cl. Jail	Due to shock as a result of massive myocardial infarction.

88. U.T.P.	Kalua Paswan Hooghly Dist. Jail	12.3.97 at Alipore Central Jail Hospital.	Committed Suicide.
89. U.T.P.	Bhuban Mondal Hooghly Dist. Jail	23.3.97 at Hooghly Dist. Jail	-
90. Life Convict	Rejaul Mondal Open Air Jail Lalgola.	2.4.97 18.15. hrs outside Jail	Primarily death seems to be due to cerebro-vascular accident
91. U.T.P.	Sunil Sarkar Alipore Cl. Jail	21.4.97, 22.00 hrs M.R. Bangur Hospital	C.R.F. in a post-operative case of exploration with repair of peptic perforation with poor general condition.
92. Convict	Naru Mehara Alipore Cl. Jail	15.4.97 5.15 hrs. Chittaranjan Cancer Institute.	Complication of non Hodgkin lymphoma
93. -	Sitaram Das Durgapur Sub. Jail	-	-
94. U.T.P.	Nitai Mandal Maldah Dist. Jail	17/18.5.97 at night Inside Jail	Committed suicide.
95. U.T.P.	Kusai Soren Purulia Dist Jail	24.6.97, 18.00 hrs Purulia Sadar Hospital	-
96. U.T.P.	Paresh Ch.Dutta Balurghat Dist. Jail	23.6.97, 6.05 hrs. Balurghat Dist.Hospital	Due to shock and haemorrhage as a result of antemortem rupture of spleen
97. U.T.P.	Sushil Kr. Santra Contai Sub Jail	5.6.97, 10.45 hrs Sub. div. Hospital, Contai	Cardio-respiratory failure.
98. U.T.P.	Amzad Mandal Krishnanagar Dist. Jail	6.7.97, 20.45 hrs Saktinagar, Nadia Dist. Hospital	Due to shock
99. U.T.P.	Rosena Bibi Hooghly Dist. Jail	11.7.97, 11.00 hrs Imambara Sadar Hospital	-
100. N C L Deaf & Dum	Bijoy Kumar Dum Dum Cl. Jail	18.7.97, 18.27 hrs Dum Dum Cl. Jail Hospital	Cardio-respiratory failure due to trauma in the head.
101. U.T.P.	Budheswar Bauri Purulia Dist. Jail	25.7.97, 20.30 hrs Purulia Sadar Hospital	-
102 U.T.P.	Dulal Jamadar Dum Dum Cl. Jail	7.8.97, 5.12 hrs. Dum Dum Cl. Jail Hospital	-
103. U.T.P.	Mrigen Nayek Alipore Cl. Jail	19.7.97 M.R. Bangur Hospital	Myocardial Infarction

104. U.T.P.	Jaya Mehara Alipore Cl.Jail	24.8.97, 13.15 hrs. M.R. Bangur Hospital	Drug-resistant Tuberculosis
105. U.T.P.	Netai Roy Barrackpore Sub. Jail	14.8.97 Inside Jail	-
106. U.T.P.	Bhasan Sardar Basirhat Sub. Jail	19.9.97 Inside Jail	Brutally assaulted by accused Gobinda Mali & died.
107. N C L	Nirmal Mandal Alipore Spl. Jail	21.9.97, 6.00 hrs NRS Medical College & Hospital	Myocardial Infarction
108. Convict	Kangsari Bhattacharyya Burdwan Dist Jail	25.9.97,17.00 hrs in Ward No. 4	Due to effects of Asphyxia as a result of drowning, ante- mortem in nature.
109.Convict	Loharh Etowa Etowa Oraon Dum Dum Cl. Jail	4.10.97,7.35 hrs. Inside Jail	Suicide by hanging
110. U.T.P.	Tarapada Dalai Uluberia Sub. Jail	9.10.97, 22.30 hrs Uluberia Sub-div. Hospital	C.R.F. in a case of lung abscess & Emphysema thoracic right side
111. U.T.P.	Haradhan Hembram Jhargram Sub. Jail	9.10.97, 22.30 hrs Inside Jail	Indication towards a post- traumatic cause of death i.e. trauma seems to be caused antemortem.
112. U.T.P.	Balmukunda Singh Durgapur Sub. Jail	25.10.97,18.40 hrs Burdwan Medical College & Hospital	Suffered from Epistaxis
113. N C L	Kausar Ali, Khusal Ali, Presidency Jail	20.10.97 K.S. Roy T. B. Hosp.	Drug-resistant Tuberculosis
114. Lunatic Prisoner	Ranjan Sengupta Ranjan Amalak	9.11.97, 6.30 hrs K.S. Roy T.B. Hospital	Drug-resistant Tuberculosis
115. N C L	Provash Singha Roy Alipore Spl. Jail	28.11.97, 11.55 hrs Alipore Spl. Jail Hospital	-
116.Convict	Sk. Munna Presidency Jail	9.12.97,22.30-23hrs Presidency Jail	Cardio-respiratory failure.
117. U.T.P.	Dong (Thai National) Tamluk Sub Jail	15.12.97, 17.40 hrs Tamluk Sadar Hospital	-
118.Released Convict	Abul Hossain (Bangladeshi National)	10.12.97, 19.30 hrs North Bengal Medical College Hospital	-
119. U.T.P.	Hasan Ali Alipore Cl. Jail	22.12.97, 19.55 hrs S.S.K.M. Hospital	-
120. U.T.P.	Sultan Biswas Presidency Jail	29.12.97, 10.00 hrs S.N.P. Hospital	Cardio-respiratory failure in a case of acute hepatic failure
121. U.T.P.	Hasen Ali Sardar Alipore Cl. Jail	22.12.97, 19.55 hrs S.S.K.M. Hospital	-

122. U.T.P.	Mukul Sk Berhampore Cl. Jail	11.98, 12.10 hrs Sadar Hospital Murshidabad.	-
123. U.T.P.	Sitaram Parikh Asansol Spl. Jail	11.1.98 evening S.D. Hospital, Aansol	-
124. U.T.P.	Amir Hossain Dinhata Sub. Jail	10.1.98	-
125. Victim girl	Tapasi Mandal Presidency Jail	9.1.98, 10.45 hrs S.N.P. Hospital	-
126. -	Sailen Chakraborty Raiganj Sub Jail	22.1.98, 20.15 hrs Sadar Hospital, Raiganj,	-
127. U.T.P.	Bhola Rahaman Jalpaiguri Dist Jail	22.1.98, 15.25. hrs	Haemorrhage & shock from duodenal ulcer.
128. U.T.P.	Safique Ahmed Presidency Jail	29.1.98, 9.10 hrs NRS Medical College & Hospital	C.R.F. in a post operative case of amputation of gangrenous limb(Lt.) due Burgers disease.
129. Convict	Arjun Mandi Midnapore Cl. Jail	1.2.98, 20.20 hrs Midnapore Sadar Hospital	-
130. U.T.P.	Budhon Sarbar Purulia Dist. Jail	17.2.98, 16.15 hrs in Jail custody	'Suicide'- hanging by a 'Gamchha'.
131. N.C.L.	Amal Kr. Roy Alipore Spl. Jail	21.1.98 Alipore Spl. Jail	-
132. N.C.I	Saroj Bagchi M.R. Bangur Hospital	16.2.98, 23.45 hrs M.R. Bangur Hospital	-
33. U.T.P.	Tarapada Dhara Jhargram Sub Jail	16.3.98, 17.20 hrs Sadar Hospital, Jhargram	-
134. Conde- mned Prisoner	Ashok Kr. Ghosh/ Das, Alipore Central Jail	19.3.98 night	suicide by hanging
135. U.T.P.	Bishnupada Biswas Krishnanagar Dist. Jail	10.4.98, 20.25 hrs Krishnanagar Dist. Jail	-
136. Convict	Sardar Alam Mallick Midnapore Cl. Jail	18.4.98, 3.00 hrs Sadar Hospital, Midnapore	-
137. N.C.L.	Man Bahadur Alipore Spl. Jail	3.6.98, Alipore Spl. Jail	-
138. Life Convict	Rajjak Sk. Berhampore Cl. Jail	11.6.98, Berhampore Sadar Hospital	-
139. U.T.P.	Male baby, son Pres. Jail	26.5.98.00.05 hrs S.S.K.M. Hospital	-
140. U.T.P.	Subash Ch. Das Raigonj Dist. Jail	23.6.98, 18.35 hrs Raiganj Dist. Hospital	-
141. Convict	Rameswar Hembram Midnapore Cl. Jail	19.6.98	Suicide by hanging himself by a rope to the Jail wall

142. Convict	Moresalim Molla Alipore Cl. Jail Hospital	12.7.98, Alipore Cl. Jail Hospital	Massive myocardial infarction
143. U.T.P.	Forman Ali Berhampore Central Jail	30.7.98, Berham- pore Jail Hospital	-
144. U.T.P.	Sudha Mal Suri Dist. Jail	9.8.98, 5.40 hrs Suri Sadar Hospital	-
145. Convict	Joyhind Nandy Presidency Jail	31.5.98, M.R. Bangur Hospital	Cirrhosis liver
146. U.T.P.	Rasidul Islam Coochbehar Dist Jail	23.3.98, 10.00 hrs. M.J.N. Hospital	-
147. U.T.P.	Khokon Mia (Bangl- adeshi National) Siliguri Special Jail	21.8.98, 23.25 hrs, North Bengal Medical College & Hospital	-
148. Life Convict	Dipak Decuruse Alipore Cl. Jail	29.8.98 N.R.S. Hospital	Chronic Renal Failure
149. U.T.P.	Raju Laishraon Howrah Dist Jail	12.9.98, 21.45 hrs Howrah Dist Jail	-
150. Convict	Ram Mandi Alipore Central Jail	21.9.98, M.R. Bangur Hospital	Cerebro-vascular accident
151. U.T.P.	Kanu Sardar Jalpaiguri Dist. Jail	2.10.98, 11.40 hrs Sadar Hospital, Jalpaiguri	-
152. U.T.P.	Sk. Salim	12.10.98, night	Suicide
153. U.T.P.	Biru Turi Burdwan Dist. Jail	15.10.98, 20.40 hrs Burdwan Medical College & Hospital	-
154. U.T.P.	Sk. Mainur Jhargram Sub Jail	30.10.98, 15.30 hrs Jhargram Sadar Hospital	-
155. U.T.P.	Sk. Shabir Bankura Dist. Jail	16.11.98, B.S.M.C. & Hospital	-

Death in Custody (according to WBHRC records)

Year	Judicial Custody Death	Police custody Death	Total
1994-95	14	1(?)	15
1995-96	14	37	51
1996-97	47	16	63
1997-98	46	17	63
1998-99	36	15	51
1999-2000	47	37	84

Overview of Judicial Custody Deaths

It is a fact that jail is not a hospital — it is a security house. The persons lodged here are badly maladjusted in the mainstream of society and have been thrown into this destitute situation. Mostly they are derailed and under a variety of pressures. So much so that they are poor and down and out, neglected as far as quality of life is concerned. Mostly they are suffering from some kind of psychological problem. In West Bengal jails there are a considerable number of inmates from agricultural population, many of whom are innocent victims of the system of social intricacy. They suffer, their families suffer and when a custodial death occurs, the whole system suffers. However we can identify some of the main points related to these custodial deaths.

Abuses and manhandling by masses : When a suspected person falls under the mercy of a group of angry brutal people sometimes he dies, sometimes he is about to die. In this precarious health condition he may be shifted to a local hospital and his injuries are ignored. In this deteriorating health condition he is sent to jail custody. Totally undiagnosed of his hidden bad injured health condition he started to face the music. Over and above he may have suffered from some previous serious illness that is also unnoticed and in a complicated condition he has been admitted to jail. Further it can be safely concluded that 'third degree methods' of police personnel is an added factor and as a rejoinder to the maladies of the poor inmate. So if there is some system of thorough medical examination at an out side State Hospital before admitting to jail some unfortunate incidences of custodial death may be averted.

Inappropriate reception at the jail: In most cases, a police van transports the prisoners without any information on their previous illnesses and make a dumps them at the jail gate where they are received by disciplinary officers and warders who are busy with an exhaustive schedule of their duties. Often there is no scope of full examination of the prisoners, only the security points are kept in mind while thrashing him in the name of searching, keeping aside, there welfare from their minds. From here the prisoners are thrown into the *Amdani ward*, where he is under the mercy of one or two convict mates who are better experienced to make them docile and nothing else. They do not have any training or experience to understand an ill prisoner and it is also not possible posting new experienced prisoners in this job at six month intervals (which is the labour period). Automatically the problem of the ill prisoners has gone unnoticed and if no untoward incident happens the inmate comes contact with responsible officers by 9 to 10 a.m. on the next day at the case table.

Meanwhile there is scope of maltreatment of the newcomer in the 'Amdani Ward' overnight for any purpose. However if the officer of the case table is convinced that the person is not a malingerer & has some genuine medical problem, he sends him to hospital if there is at all any infrastructure inside the jail or so called dispensary or hospital. Otherwise in the case of Sub Jails and District Jails serious cases may be sent to out side State Hospitals for a check up. However in the out side State Hospitals in almost all cases the prisoners do not get appropriate attention. And he is sent back to jail with a simple prescription. If the out side doctors are kind enough they recommend admission of the inmate but the escorting guards in most cases refuse to get him admitted there due to problem of duty hand over. So the jail custodians save their skin by sending him at least once to the outside State Hospital. Here it is also to be kept in mind that to send the poor prisoner with jail guards to the out

side State Hospital is not an easy task. There is lack of motivation and seriousness of prison administration on this matter. There is also the chance of the prisoner escaping from jail.

If there is any hospital infrastructure inside the jail it is totally ill-equipped and in many cases the attending doctors are not available. If the doctors are available he makes some lame excuse of not treating the inmate for lack of medical facilities and he makes a paper statement always to send the inmates to out side hospital for better treatment. M.O.'s are least acquainted in providing this sort of medical service in their full course curriculum of the 'medical education' so it takes time for the juniors to prepare themselves for this kind of service. Meanwhile overall environment inside jails is not congenial for providing better medical service and he becomes inhibited with his preoccupied education, training, glamour, academic flavour of his Medical College environment. Here some sort of orientation training for the junior medical officers by the senior medical officers should be mandatory. However we have to keep in mind that there is a system of getting free treatment from the jail hospital by all the staff members of the jail. It has been seen in many cases that MO's are busy to satisfying the so called powerful and influential staff members or officers and he realises that it is more important and easier to satisfy the key persons in the key positions of the jail administration. This also ensures their job security. The prisoners are not a factor to bother them. The prisoner therefore does not get the professional supervision of the M.O.'s.

In the area of general health administration there is a hierarchy of M.O.'s and other para-medical staff. In the jail M.O.'s have to do all the requirements themselves; the middle or ground level service-providers are absent and to make any meaningful health care delivery constantly the M.O.'s have to train and keep a close supervision on some illiterate inmates who are incharge of hospital wards. In many cases they fail to identify the problems of the seriously ill prisoners and even if they identify the problem and inform it to the M.O.'s repeatedly, the M.O.'s may not pay heed, as the inmates are ill-equipped to the M.O.'s mind so the prisoner suffers.

Considering all these facts it is seen that in many cases of custodial death prisoners generally get attention only at the eleventh hour of their medical problem whether inside or outside jail. Moreover if there is any emergency call in dead of night it takes at least one hour to arrange a meaningful situation where a M.O. can examine and treat a patient even just for a primary care. This is due to the system of jail security arrangement, which should be reviewed for the sake of the life of the prisoners. In the terminal care condition they suffer from the captivity of life along with the pain of the illness. It is almost impossible to get a free bed for admission at the out side State Hospitals and also the, tedious laboratory investigations in out side state hospital to confirm the diagnosis. In many cases there is lack of necessary escort to shift the patient to an out side State Hospital as an emergency life saving measure.

No death is so sensational like a death in prison. This is probably because there is a general misconception that all prison deaths occur due to torture and negligence on the part of the custodian. But this is only one of the reasons that lead to death while imprisoned.

The type of deaths which occur in prisons are

1. Natural death (from physical illness)
2. Death due to negligence in the treatment of prisoners
3. Suicidal death
4. Death occurring from violence among prisoners.

5 Death because of mental illness.

There are about 10,000 prisoners in the various prisons of this State, among whom 85% are undertrial. On an average a death occurs in every week in prison.

It is found that most of the death cases happen among undertrial prisoners. Prisoners generally come from economically backward families. Their standard of living is so low that most of them suffer from malnutrition. Again they cannot avail medical treatment in time because of their underground activities. Majority among them have either the habit of drinking or addiction for drug. Some of them are regular blood donors. As a result most of them have suffered from Tuberculosis or other diseases and come to prison with irregular treatment. In prison undertrial prisoners stay for a very short time during which complete course of treatment cannot be done. One of WHO's researches has shown that for this discontinuous nature of treatment prisoners become permanent source of Tuberculosis and Malaria.

Prison is not a hospital to treat prisoners. The main problem in prison is that treatment of a prisoner cannot be done in time. Because of financial problems it is not possible to have this infrastructural facility for treatment in every prison of this State. For arrangement of timely treatment of prisoners a group of doctors and para-medical staff are needed to be always ready in jail hospital. In some jails there is no doctor at all. In these jails outside doctors are called during emergency. This is only a stopgap measure. If facility for intensive therapy is available in a nodal hospital in the core area then prisoner - patients can be transferred quickly from peripheral prisons to this hospital. Again the doctors who come to serve in prison hospitals are ignorant about the psychology of the prisoners. Medical treatment in prison is a special kind, thus it needs special training for doctors.

For high security prisoners there are individual cells in prisons. Their treatment is done in their cells and not in prison hospital for security reasons. In those cells, patients are looked after by co-prisoners who are sympathetic but not sufficiently trained to nurse the patients. They cannot realise the actual condition of patients and in most cases when they call the doctor the patient's condition is so severe that death is inevitable.

In jails there are some mentally disbalanced persons who are usually collected by police and kept in prison for good. In our State there are a considerable number of such prisoners though recently Hon'ble Supreme Court has ordered that no mentally ill person can be kept in prison. There is no arrangement for treatment of these mentally ill prisoners. Among prison death their number is no less important.

Suicidal death among prisoners is also common. Such deaths are found among drug addicts and mentally ill prisoners. Torture in prison intensifies such death. If such prisoners are kept under close observation, suicidal death can be much reduced.

Sometimes prisoners are brought to the prison after police or public beating for which there may not be any external injury and when they die, reason for their death remains undetected.

Negligence on the part of jail staff is also one of the reasons for prison death. Prisoners are kept in low profile by them.

Death is the end of life, so all of us have to be prepared for death. But we should be responsible for unnatural deaths. In prison also deaths can be avoided if we give due regard to the prisoners. Since they are marginal people.

Measures to be taken to avoid death in Judicial Custody

We have to change our negative attitude towards prison inmates. They must get the basic

human rights and facilities during their custody life.

In Jails we need pure consumables, sufficient drinking water, sewerage system maintaining basic health & hygiene, adequate airway, spacious accommodation, adequate nutritious food and adequate medical assistance in illness.

All medical facilities should be given as an emergency measure with a centrally controlled monitoring, supervising system so that the peripheral centres can communicate with the nodal centre in this helpless situation.

Regular, periodical, orientation training should be provided to the medical officers, para-medical staff, trained convict assistants and others to any emergency health situation in prison set-up.

On admission to jail thorough medical checkup should be mandatory.

RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE COMMITTEE

After a careful scrutiny and examination of the 155 deaths included in the per-view its study and taking into consideration the overall situation the Committee has the following observations and recommendations to meet the urgent needs of the health infrastructure of jails.

1. There is dearth of Medical and Paramedical staff in West Bengal jails. To tackle this problem a board should be constituted with the senior members of the Medical Officers of this department with some amount of autonomy to select and supervise the M.O.'s and paramedical staff to meet the emergency requirement. Recently the National Human Rights Commission in their D.O. No. 4/3/99-PRP & P dt. Feb 1999 recommended a thorough health check up every month with their prescribed proforma of all the prisoners lodged in West Bengal jails. This is a major task and to meet this demand some sort of permanent infrastructure has to be developed of jail health services, as otherwise it is not possible to perform this job regularly.

In the sub-jails there are no medical facilities rendered to the prisoner. There is provision in the jail code that the subdivisional medical officer will look after the health condition of the prisoners there. But the SDMO is such a busy person in the subdivision and he gets hardly any time to look after the matter. In this situation it is better to appoint a contract service doctor in all the sub-jails who would attend the jail for at least thrice a week and whose service would be available in any emergency situation so his residence should not therefore be far away from the jail. This method can be applied in all jails as required.

A Health card system for all prison inmates covering nearly 10,000 people throughout West Bengal jails is a herculean task, yet it must be done. It is better to start with the Central Jails & then extend it to the periphery. It would take at least one year to complete till the adequate infrastructure is developed. In any case we can ask the services of the outside doctors to complete the health check up of the prisoners periodically.

2. Medical equipment and necessary accessories are of an immediate need. So the department should start procuring essential items for all West Bengal jails so that the medical staff to provide services are properly equipped. Attention should be given for early and proper delivery of the materials with after sale services supervised by a committee of senior doctors in all West Bengal Jails.

3. Some of the hospitals or dispensary buildings of the jails are in a very bad condition which makes it nearly impossible to render smooth hospital services for the ailing prisoners. Repair and renovation of those hospital premises is therefore an immediate necessity. In the absence of health units in most sub-jails we want to start a health unit there. For this first

of all we have to make sure that there is a proper room to arrange dispensary services in sub jails. To meet the emergency demand there should be some emergency cell services of P.W.D. (Electricals and Building).

4. We need a moderately sophisticated hospital for both staff and prisoners. Often we send our complicated cases to out side hospital but they are sent back to us creating much harrassment, anxiety and tension, some even leading to a suicidal situations. Alipore Special Jail could be the place for that hospital as we can shift all the NCLs to other Voluntary Organisations or to Purulia Mental hospital which has been built with the funds of Jail Department. Here it is important to remember that Hon'ble Supreme Court has directed that all psychiatry patients not accused of any crime are to be freed from jails.

5. The emoluments of the contractual doctors engaged in jail medical services should be enhanced immediately to at least Rs. 10,000/- (Rupees Ten Thousand) only as a consolidated pay to support and encourage their motivation and smooth functioning. If they render their service sincerely for an extended period of say 3 years then they can be absorbed gradually in the jail medical services in future.

6. As long as the recommended specialised hospital is not and made operational the hospital of Alipore Central Jail should be treated as a referral hospital of West Bengal Jails. For this some sort of autonomy should be given to this hospital similar to the jail press to meet the immediate emergency requirements of the patients.

7. Admission of the inmates in jails is in bad shape so far as their medical check up is concerned. Often the Police bring the patient in a bad condition and we receive them without any document. This should be stopped. At least one medical or paramedical staff must be present there to receive such patients and in any case where the health condition is bad it should be documented and signed by police or they should take the responsibility to shift the patient to an out side state Hospital to avoid another case of custodial death.

8. Immediate revision of the general diet should be done to provide morning and evening tea and revise the quality of the food items to meet the physical and psychological health of the prisoners.

9. All attempts should be made to ensure building an image that the jail authority is sincere enough in starting an Institutional hospital with quasi-modern facilities like Ultrasonography, Endoscopy etc. to cater to the need of all staff and prison inmates.

10. As it is not possible to transform a jail into a hospital there should be extra supervision on the part of the supervisors and guarding staff to avoid any unnecessary delay to shift patients to a hospital in any emergency situation and for that some training programme should be held throughout the year.

11. The young M.O.'s are not well versed in the special type of hospital situation in jails. For this some orientation training programme can be started with the help of the experienced senior doctors and an academic environment should be created inside the Jail Hospital with library facilities of medical books and journals, seminars-symposium, workshop, research programmes etc. to boost the morale of the doctors.

12. A separate escort system should be provided to shift the prisoners to outside State Hospitals in emergency condition. Presently we have to depend on police escort and in many emergency situation we feel quite helpless with the moribund patients.

13. It has been seen that doctors are not considered for periodical meetings of jail

department officers. However senior directorate officials should have regular meetings with the doctors to be aware of their problems, the doctors will also get the opportunity to address their problems and difficulties.

14. The attendance, working conditions and performance of the visiting specialists of all categories should be reviewed periodically. Often it has been seen that in spite of all our resources we can not give specialist help to the inmates for flimsy reasons. As it is increasingly difficult to give specialist help in out side State Hospitals. Our visiting specialists should be utilised to the fullest extent possible.

15. To run a full fledged hospital smoothly we have to depend considerably on the trained educated convict. So some incentive should be given to them in the form of wages or release so that they devote themselves in the welfare service of their fellow inmates.

16. A network of communication system based at Alipore Central Jail hospital should be maintained so that preparations can be made and necessary guidance given to health units of the other jails on their emergency conditions.

17. Some arrangement should be present for periodical training for upgradation of the doctors of this department so that they would not suffer any inferiority complex of being posted in Jail Hospitals.

18. There is a considerable amount of wastage of medicines all over West Bengal Jails. A Medical Audit system should be instituted for periodical checks and balances.

19. Often it has been seen that the post-mortem reports done by the M.O.s of Health Service are not satisfactory. In one case (report of lifer convict Dipak Decruse) an expert has given an opinion that the patient died at N.R.S. Hospital of homicidal injuries inflicted upon him at Jail Hospital almost one month earlier. This is deeply regrettable. Apart from that there are p.m. reports which are full of discrepancies and mistakes. This should be addressed properly.

20. In this list of custodial deaths there are a considerable number of suicide cases. To avoid this unfortunate situation part time, visiting psychiatrists and psychologists should be appointed at least at the Central Jails for periodic check-up and counselling of the potentially suicide-prone cases.

21. Record keeping specially the medical matters of the jail inmates are in very bad shape. Something must be done immediately to prepare a data bank of medical matters covering all West Bengal Jails for a ready reference.

Report on Tuberculosis in West Bengal Jails

The committee admits that the presently infrastructure of West Bengal Jails is not adequate to assess the overall epidemiological pattern of pulmonary tuberculosis. This is because the prisoners are still marginal community and they are not in a position to offer themselves inside or outside jail in the documentation or health statistics process. However most recently the M.O.'s of Alipore Central Jail visited almost all W.B. Jails and have submitted a report on their findings. It may not corroborate with the exact statistics and specially it is a matter of regret that it is not possible to get the post-mortem examination reports on each and every case of custodial death. Consequently the committee have not been able to come to a definite conclusion in this matter.

However this is the text of that first hand report in the following subtitle

1. General Epidemiology
2. Incidence of pulmonary tuberculosis in jails.
3. Reception on suspected TB patients in jails.
4. Cause of custodial deaths in reference to tuberculosis.
5. Problems of treating TB patients in jails.
6. Problem in treatment guideline.
7. Special problems with psychiatric and drug addict patient's treatment.
8. Highrisk groups among prison inmates.
9. Control of tuberculosis in prison.

1. General Epidemiology.

1.2. Tuberculosis usually affects the lungs, although in up to one-third of cases other organs may also be involved. If properly treated tuberculosis caused by drug-susceptible strains is curable in virtually all cases. If untreated the disease may be fatal within 5 years in more than half of the cases. Transmission usually takes place through the airborne spread of droplet nuclei produced by patients with infectious pulmonary tuberculosis. However, because of a low level of case detection and reporting in many national programs, reported cases represent only a fraction of the total population affected.

1.2. Tuberculosis patients whose sputum contains AFB visible by microscopy play the greatest role in the spread of infection. Crowding in poorly ventilated rooms is one of the most important factors in the transmission of the disease. The risk of acquiring the infection is determined mainly by exogenous factors. Because of delays in seeking care and in diagnosis, an estimated two or three contacts will usually be infected by each AFB positive case before detection.

1.3. The risk of developing the disease after being infected depends largely on endogenous factors, such as the individual's innate susceptibility to disease (here soil is more important than seed). About 10% of infected persons will eventually develop active tuberculosis. Reinfection of a previously infected individual, which is probably common in areas with high rates of tuberculosis transmission, may also favor the development of the disease. It has been suggested that up to one third of cases of active tuberculosis are due to recent transmission.

1.4. The incidence of tuberculosis is highest during adolescence and early adulthood; the reasons are unclear and it has been clearly showed that untreated tuberculosis is often fatal. About one-third of patients die within 1 year after diagnosis and one half within 5 years. Five year mortality among sputum smear-positive cases was 65%. Of the survivors at 5 years, about 60% had undergone spontaneous remission. While the remainder were still excreting tubercle bacilli. With proper treatment, these patients have a good chance of being cured. However, improper use of antitubercular drugs, while reducing mortality, may also result in large numbers of chronic infectious cases, often with drug-resistant bacilli.

2. Incidence of pulmonary tuberculosis in W. B. jails.

2.1. Exact data on incidences is not available as there is no system of maintaining the health statistics in jails. In jails there are two types of prisoners. One group is UTP who come to these jails for an uncertain period and hence definite record maintenance for these prisoners

is nearly impossible. The other group is convict prisoners. The problem with them is that they are often referred to Central Jails specially Alipore Central Jail on treatment grounds and are subsequently treated through references to out side State Hospitals. After completion of treatment they are sent back to their original jails (after a moderate recovery) and they are advised to continue the same treatment for the stipulated period. But there is no system of follow up of these patients on the continuation of treatment.

2.2. However it is seen that Alipore Central Jail being a referral center, has the highest number of tuberculosis patients, averaging around 30 patients per day through the year. Other Central Jails treat 10 patients a day and the district jails 1-2 patient in a day on an average.

It is a fact that there are a modest number of prisoners suspected to be suffering from the disease but it is not possible with the present infrastructural facilities to make periodical regular screening with sputum examination, blood examination, chest X-rays etc..

3. Reception of suspected TB patients in jails.

3.1. Prisoners come to jails without any treatment records. Often they have respiratory tract infections and get conservative treatment. If they do not show any improvement they are referred to a nearby State Hospital for further management and afterwards treated following their advice. Often they come to the jails mostly as referral cases at a late stage when their general condition has been grossly compromised to make some observation and conservative management.

3.2. It is a fact that theoretically there is no dearth of medicines in jails but there are various problems for it to reach to the patients. Inmates in jail hospitals are present for an uncertain, unpredictable period. So by a modest estimation we can say that about 70% of the UTPs do not complete their full course of treatment. This is also the case for the referral convicts who have been referred from district and sub-jails.

4. Cause of custodial deaths in reference to TB.

4.1 It is a fact that TB is major cause of custodial deaths in W.B. jails. Recently the Committee got the opportunity to study the post-mortem reports of the last three years of custodial deaths in W.B. jails and they found that about 10% of all deaths was due to TB.

4.2. Recently there has been a general rise in deaths due to TB but that is due to compromised immunity of the HIV (AIDS) infected patients. However due to drug abuse, with the chronic ill health (i.e. psychiatric illness etc.) prevailing in prison environment, it is natural that they may be considered as high risk groups with poor immunity.

4.3. It is a fact that pneumoconiosis (silicosis, asbestosis etc.) mimic the florid picture of pulmonary TB. According to a revised estimation of WHO 30% of such patients unnecessarily get the TB treatment. So WHO has advised to diagnose TB by sputum-smear positivity.

5. Problems of treating TB patients in Jails.

5.1. TB causes chronic ill health and it is subject to long continued treatment for at least 8-9 months; there can therefore be a wide variety of problems.

5.2. Inmates do not stay at a particular jail for a long time specially the UTP and the referral convicts. So almost in all cases they fail to complete the treatment. Again patients who have been getting TB treatment from outside do not come with any previous records and therefore it is not possible to start their treatment.

5.3. Due to improper, inadequate and irregular drug therapy, most of the patients fail to respond and this is one of the most important causes of failure of treatment. These patients naturally then become dangerous type of 'resistant bacilli' carrier and transmitter.

6. Problems in treatment guidelines.

6.1. There are at least four case detection and treatment guidelines in TB case management. These are National Tuberculosis Commission, W.H.O, Medical Text Book, Teaching Institution.

6.2. Teaching Institutions recommend duration and treatment profiles depending upon intensity and other criteria with their academic flavour. Their case detection procedures are also exhaustive and elaborate. Sometimes the patients have to suffer a lot of time to confirm the diagnosis and meanwhile there is much deterioration of their condition.

6.3. Medical College, Calcutta – the highest body in the State to control TB advise to follow the directive of National Tuberculosis Commission and their case detection is based on only positive AFB in the sputum smear. They strongly discourage starting treatment only on a clinical basis as there are reports that 30% of patients suffering from pneumoconiosis unnecessarily get TB treatment.

7. Special problems with psychiatric and drug addict patients.

7.1. Psychiatric patients are often non-verbal and can not present their complaints properly. As a result they suffer in silence into a very serious, chronic, debilitating condition.

7.2. There is a special risk of drug addict patient to be suffering from undiagnosed HIV infection and other diseases that can be transmitted through sharing needles for I.V. drug users which can severely complicate the presentation of TB.

8. Highrisk groups among prison inmates for potential TB cases.

8.1. Long term UTPs who are virtually abandoned by their family members and find no way to help them are the high risk group.

8.2. Among infected persons, the incidence of tuberculosis is highest during late adolescence and early adulthood, the reasons for this are unclear.

9. Control of TB in prison.

9.1. The highest priority in any TB control program is the prompt detection of cases and the provision of directly observed short-course chemotherapy to all tuberculosis patients, with emphasis on the cure of sputum smear-positive cases. In any Institutional set up such as prisons, transmission of TB has got special importance.

9.2. In high-prevalence areas, TB control programs should be based on the following key elements other than case detection and treatment.

(a) Establishment and maintenance of a system of regular drug supply.

(b) Establishment and maintenance of an effective system for patient evaluation and program management. This system should allow an analysis of treatment outcomes (e.g. cure, completion of treatment without proof of cure, death, treatment failure and default) in all cases registered.

STORY OF LIFER CONVICT ANANTA BAG LODGED IN ALIPORE CENTRAL JAIL

1. First acquaintance :

1.1. Apparently healthy lifer convict Ananta Bag first noticed and complained of fever, sore throat, headache, bodyache, difficulty of speech and insomnia on 02.01.99 to the M.O. at the Jail hospital OPD. He had been prescribed some preliminary medicines and advised bed rest but his problem continued. So he had been advised routine blood examination and chest x-ray and referred to visiting E.N.T. Surgeon.

1.2. On 09.01.99 E.N.T. surgeon examined him and advised laryngoscope. Laryngoscope

was performed at the OT under general anaesthesia. Laryngoscope examination revealed fixed left vocal cord but no growth at laryngings. E.N.T. specialist advised further blood examination and chest x-ray and advised some medicines. But the patient did not get any result.

1.3. M.O.s referred him to M.R. Bangur Hospital, Kolkata on 16.01.99. and he was sent to the chest department. They advised some medicines comprising vitamins, antibiotics and again advised some investigations related to pulmonary tuberculosis. But the patient did not get any result.

1.4. Meanwhile the investigation was completed and again he was referred to M.R. Bangur Hospital. The attending doctors of that hospital after considering all the reports referred him to the chest department of S.S.K.M. Hospital. But his condition deteriorated steadily, specially regarding the difficulties of speech and swallowing of food. He gradually suffered from malnutrition.

2. At S.S.K.M. Hospital:

2.1. The specialists of S.S.K.M. Hospital advised to repeat all the previous investigations and FNAC of an enlarged cervical lymph node and prescribed some medicines.

2.2. For FNAC he had to wait for a few weeks and after tremendous effort for the FNAC report was again referred to S.S.K.M. Hospital, ENT department on 22.02.99. However the doctors of S.S.K.M. Hospital were not satisfied and advised repeat FNAC to be performed at a private hospital.

2.3. Meanwhile the patient started coughing and vomiting blood. He was repeatedly transferred to the emergency department of S.S.K.M. Hospital but without any result. However after marginal improvement of his ailments he was sent to a private laboratory on 03.03.99 for FNAC.

2.4. The FNAC report of 10.03.99 suggested a metastatic poorly differentiated cancer. After receiving the report the M.O.s managed to send him to S.S.K.M. Hospital on 15.03.99. There specialists referred him to Radiotherapy OPD for admission. But it was not possible to send him to Radiotherapy Department on that day for want of necessary police escort.

3. Acquaintance with Chittaranjan Cancer Hospital:

3.1. After some personal initiative of the M.O. he was sent to Chittaranjan Cancer Hospital on 17.03.99. Their doctors again advised i) FNAC from swelling lymph Node (done), ii) USG of whole abdomen (to be done at C.N.C.L.) iii) CT Scan of thorax and CT guided FNAC from left lung mass (to be done out side). He was again sent on 19.03.99 for USG at Chittaranjan Cancer Hospital.

3.2. USG was done and he was again sent on 26.03.99 for review at the said hospital. But this time they informed the authority that without the CT Scan of thorax they could not give any diagnostic opinion.

3.3. The M.O. now faced a real problem, because for CT Scan of the thorax he had to be admitted at cardio-thoracic-surgery department of S.S.K.M. Hospital, which was a nearly impossible task. However after tremendous personal effort by the M.O. he managed to get admission at S.S.K.M. Hospital on 03.04.99. And between 03.04.99 and 10.04.99 with M.O.'s personal effort it was possible to perform four specialized diagnostic procedures at S.S.K.M. hospital, which is an all time record at that hospital.

4. Conclusion

Even after getting all these investigation reports M.O. failed to get him admitted at

Chittaranjan Cancer Hospital on 16.04.99 for some technical reasons. He therefore had to wait in the terminal condition at Alipore Central Jail hospital for an opportunity for admission at Chittaranjan Cancer Hospital.

Meanwhile with personal initiative the authority could managed his premature release and could avoid a custody death.

This report compiled by **Pradip Sen P A S**

Question and Answers

You have written about your daughter in your long letter. She has been a creditable student of management. She has achieved a high position in a corporate house at a very young age. She is highly acclaimed in her work. But her behaviour at home is totally different. She is angry, stubborn, rough, bad-mouthed, selfish, self-centred, jealous about her younger sister and extremely self-conceited. In spite of all your efforts during the last five years you have not been able to fix a boy for her, because nobody meets her aspirations. And as a result you are becoming increasingly worried about her. You have therefore asked whether your daughter is suffering from any mental illness. And if so, what is the form of this illness. Let me say one word before giving any opinion on this matter. You cannot absolve yourselves of any responsibility for this personality of your daughter. Perhaps in her younger days she has received your encouragement in some such behaviour and this now has become the reason for your mental anxiety.

Your daughter is probably suffering from some kind of personality problem. And with this is closely connected the emotional intelligence development of her childhood days. But it is not enough to say only this; what I want to say is that nowadays we come across several instances of similar interpersonal relationship complications or problems arising about children or between married partners. Therefore I leave it to your good judgement to select out of this reply whatever you find to be relevant to your problem. There is only one reason to give a reply to your question in this way, and that is to enable others to be benefited also. We will certainly accept that it is definitely difficult to explain or understand the subject of personality disorder.

The personality of a person is apparently formed by a process of integration of factors like intelligence, knowledge, behaviour, emotion, ideal, desire and judgement, and his specific characteristics are retained unchanged throughout his life, even in changed circumstances. This is what we call Pavlovian brain type. And as a result seems to become a standard of his primary identification. Psychiatrists also cannot always agree in their understanding and explanation of this confusion regarding the personality problems. This results in three different views on this subject. viz. 1. It is a specific illness like neurosis; 2. It is not an illness but a kind of specific characteristic; 3. It is an intermediary condition between the normal and abnormal state of the mind. Therefore this can lead to a psychiatric condition or a person can completely recover after staying in this confused mental state for some time.

In a disturbed personality we normally find impatience and obstinacy about expression of appropriate emotion, cognition, maintaining interpersonal relationships and so on. This affects the individual himself and also continuously troubles the people around him. This we call disorder of personality because this situation does not arise from an illness of any other

part of the body or the mind. It itself appears in the form of an illness. Two examples will clarify this. A lot of people while under substance abuse undergo a personality changes, but the reason for this is metabolic dysregulation due to the substance. It can be assumed that this state of confused personality can be removed if he can be freed from his chronic substance abused state. Similarly we have seen, a tumour in the forebrain can create this type of disorder. But when continue to see an otherwise normal person with changes without any visible reasons then in the normal course we refer to them as disorderly personality or a characteristic of an abnormal person.

If we sort out the normal and abnormal conditions of an individual the disorderly conditions can be put into three groups. The first group consists of individuals with indications of schizophrenia or psychological cases like paranoid. They are eccentric, reserved and preferred to stay away from the family or social front, and their anger and fear are both abnormal and of a high level. This apart talking to them one can see that they imagine various kinds of unreal things and also hope that all problems will be solved by 'magic'. They always have the firm conviction of suspicion and doubt of the outside world and that somebody will do them harm. But one cannot find a justifiable reason for this. The second group consists of people who have the tendency to be involved in unsocial or antisocial work. They are very emotive, narcissistic or histrionic. Besides, at times they are very adept at completing some work, and it is difficult to anticipate their actions.

The third group consists of people who are somewhat neurotic, dependable, always avoid people, and comparatively they have greater anxiety and fear. But these groupings are all arbitrary. In real life we find any of their traits in the practical world. At times they can may have co-morbidity with other major psychiatric illnesses. Their treatment is quite a problem. Since they do not consider that they have a problem it is practically impossible to get them to a doctor. All around us there are many people with such problems, though in a small way, and possibly some of them are also working us as colleagues. Funnily, the personality disorders of these people are not always seen in the same way by everybody. As a result many do not even see their colleague as having a problem.

It is true that if the family members at home are conscious enough then these problems will be noticed much more and early and they will also search for some solution. This is because this problem of the youngsters will be with them throughout their lives and as a result they suffer themselves and also give trouble to others. The main treatment is psychotherapy, but if and when necessary doctors in some cases use very small dosages of medicines. It is also useful to know that one does not get quick results in such cases. Hence it is essential to help the doctor by being very patient.

Now let us say a few words on the present times which we are all experiencing currently. And our younger brothers are feeling the maximum pressures from it. There is little opportunity for the younger ones to find consolation for such a situation from any form of religious culture. But you should also know that we are not aware how these pulls and pressures of the times are affecting each one of us and to what extent. But we are certain that in case there is a problem relating to our individuality then the present period will also be equally responsible.

In the present socio-economic situation the possibility of actualisation of the innate endowment of the individual is much greater and therefore modern life is very agitated.

Practically daily, specially in urban region, we are all worried about the effects of numerous problems of different varieties. Hence within the variety of worries in our mind these individual blows and counter-blows in our daily life are very clear and true. Besides this is so cruel and painful or simply irritating that it is not always possible for many to tolerate the suffering. As a result when this mind repeatedly succumbs to these proximate hard blows of reality, then he for the time being considers as ultimate truth the individual tortures inflicted on him.

Then to get rid of this alienation and unhappiness the individual looks for salvation in this so-called consumerist comfort of life. When we see any person in this condition, then within his qualities and inborn capabilities, two truths stand out -- the harshness of the daily struggle, and within it the periodic snatching of momentary relief. While giving a price for these momentary and proximate truths, automatically there grows a pent up emotion and impatience for quick accumulation. In the normal course this spontaneous, inevitable, worried swiftness attracts us towards our near ones. As a result in the shadow of the confusing pulls of things close to us, a farsight is affected. Hence inevitably whatever may be the originality or unique of our taste and the depth of our desire it gradually gets buried in the darkness of inertness or inactivity of the higher faculties of our mind. As a result whatever is visible, obvious, distinct and proximate remain true to us and out side it whatever is apparently invisible and distant but ultimate, is appear blurr in the dim light of the limited, proximate consciousness of the personality.

Replied by **Dr. Basu Dev Mukherjee.** **PAS**

Book Review

Beyond the Laboratory : Scientists as Political Activists in 1930s America

Peter J. Kuznick, University of Chicago press, Chicago Illinois 60637

Kuznick's book is of special interest to members of the US Federation of Scholars and Scientists [previously called the American Association of Scientific Workers, founded at the AAAS meeting in 1938 in response to the rise in fascism in Europe] and to scientific activists in general because it documents the origins of what is commonly called the "social responsibility of science" [J.D.Bernal's term].

In the Great War (as World War I was called before it was realized that cordination was required) the American Chemical Society offered its services to the War Department (This was before the Age of Euphemisms). The response was, " Thanks, but we already have a chemist". Actually, both World Wars provided great boosts to science. *Beyond the Laboratory* begins its outline of the spectacular development of U.S. science in the '20s, immediately following World War I, a period which was a prelude and contrast to the devastating impact of the depression of the 30s, the decade of focus in the book. As described by Kuznick, science in the early '20s appears to have much resembled science today -- privileged, complacent, apathetic, self-involved, arrogant, and conservative.

After an uncertain introduction (in which nuclear power and nuclear weapons are cited as examples of positive and negative aspects of the same science, nuclear physics), a chapter is devoted to " The Soviet Model", in which the USSR appeared ' to be a nation of

self-conscious individuals, willfully and deliberately constructing a rational, humane society ", in sharp contrast to the capitalist world in the throes of depression. In addition, the appeal of the USSR to the U.S. intellectual community in the early '30s (excluding the scientists, who were, by and large, still lingering in the conservatism of the '20s) was also attributed to its rational planning and enthusiastic embrace of science. The attention of the scientific community to the great social experiment occurring in the USSR is described as developing almost concurrently with disillusion with the model.

The history of the rise of social consciousness in science is traced from Marxist seeds planted by the high-powered USSR delegation at the 1931 Second International Congress of the History of Science and Technology in London. The delegation included Boris Hessen, director of the Moscow Institute of Physics, who delivered a seminal paper entitled, " The Social and Political Roots of Newton's *Principia* ". He rejected the traditional Hegelian interpretation of Newton in favor of a Marxist view of Newton as a natural product of seventeenth century bourgeois society. For the young British scientists, especially for J.D.Bernal, it was " ... the starting point of a new evaluation of the history ... a wealth of new ideas and points of view for understanding the history, the social function, the working of science ... by application to science of Marxist theory."

Kuznick explains how the Marxist root of social consciousness provided a foundation for the development of strongly anti-fascist internationalism in the scientific community in response to the rise of Nazism. Madame Curie, and other eminent French scientists were active in the Committee of Anti-fascist Intellectuals. [Her son, Joliot-Curie, also a Nobel Laureate, became the first president of the World Federation of Scientific Workers (WFSW) after the war.] In the U.S., the British, especially Bernal, became the recognized scholars on questions relating science and society. The 1936 Blackpool meeting of the British Association for the Advancement of Science was a milestone for internationalism in the scientific community. The AAAS joined in the call for a world union of scientists for defense of peace and intellectual freedom. There were appeals for a " Magna Carta of Science" and for a world "Supreme Court of Science" (proposed by Etienne Gilson of the College de France).

The movement rapidly developed in the U.S.. In 1938 the Harvard/MIT-based Association of Scientific Workers was extended to become the American Association of Scientific Workers (AASW), with bases in New York (Columbia), Philadelphia (University of Pennsylvania), and New Haven (Yale), as well as Boston. Its first conference convened at the 1938 Richmond meeting of the American Association for the Advancement of Science (AAAS). Kuznick refers to the "international renaissance of scientific humanism", the pinnacle of activism in the 1930s, which occurred with the rapid growth of the AASW, [which changed its name to the U.S. Federation of Scholars and Scientists (USFSS) in 1985, while maintaining its affiliations with both the WFSW and the AAAS]. An idea whose time had come, the AASW attracted many eminent U.S. scientists and engaged in many studies and investigations, including patent reform and consumer products (with the Consumer Union). It sponsored public education programs in the schools (with the WPA). It produced radio programs and operated a science press service. It organized conferences, conducted science policy studies, critiqued health care, exposed pseudoscience.

Kuznick relates how this rapid development of a social conscience for science was largely undone by liberal reaction to the USSR/Germany Non-Agression Pact. The critical juncture came with the AASW's mildly worded "peace resolution" of 1940, which recommended, "... the wholehearted and unceasing support of all reasonable programs which seek a better understanding of the causes of war, which will preserve peace for the United States and bring peace to the world." Science was not spared the same political misunderstanding

that followed the USSR/German non-aggression pact. It is here that Kuznick's interpretation most seriously fails.

Hitler may as well have been a product of spontaneous generation as far as the book's analysis is concerned. Nazism as a factor converting social consciousness into the anti-fascism in the 30s scientific community is mentioned. The international capitalist powers which established Hitler, with German arms and steel magnates Krupp and Thyssen in the lead, and with strong support from the British (Eg., Henri Deterding of Shell Oil), among others, are not mentioned. Nor is any attention devoted to the ideological purpose National Socialism was to serve, to combat Proletarian Internationalism both domestically in Germany, and as an act of international capitalist solidarity by destroying the USSR. (Put another way, the Nazi anti-communist class collaborationist strategy was to organize Germans who happened to be workers, instead of workers who happened to be German.) This failure to mention the role of international capitalism in establishing National Socialism, impairs as adequate conclusion.

The perceived failure of the USSR to achieve optimistic expectations does not consider the effects of the siege to which it was subject from its inception.

Without this background, there is little understanding of the 1940 AASW peace resolution, or the non-aggression pact, or, for that matter, Munich, where the pattern of support and encouragement of fascism is commonly conveniently ignored in order to make the standard apologist interpretation of "appeasement" credible.

There is no hint of the possibility that Nazism was an example of an anti-communist crusade working better than usually credited. It crippled progressive workers' movements in allied countries, just as it destroyed them in Germany. (The original concentration camps in Germany were built for German communists, not for Jews, although there were many "Jewish communists" -- which had become a cliché.) Of course the 1940 resolution was very mild and very limited. It mentioned none of these factors, but they were part of the context. Besides Nazism, the anti-communist crusades at the end of World War I, the Korean War, the Viet Nam War, and the Central American War are generally considered to have backfired, weakening capitalism and strengthening socialism, but perhaps they were more successful than usually recognized. They did a great deal to avert the real threat -- the threat of a good example and of the consequent "domino effect".

There is no recognition of the possibility that it was a principled position which opposed fascism as an anti-worker, anti-communist force, but did not wish to sacrifice U.S. workers in an imperial war combatting an aberration created largely by European capitalists. (They created their monster, now let them feed and clothe !) U.S. capitalists played a minor role in developing Nazism, and U.S. workers obviously shared none of that responsibility. USSR offers to join in stopping Hitler were repeatedly rebuffed. President Benesh of Czechoslovakia preferred domination by "superior Aryans to support by Bolshevik fellow Slavs" The Non-Aggression Pact diverted Hitler (only temporarily, it turned out) from his international anti-communist "Plan Barbarossa" crusade by tempting him with "patriotic" opportunities for building the Third Reich while guaranteed a secure eastern frontier. While World War I was an imperial war which erupted into class warfare, World War II started as an anti-communist crusade and was converted, in part, into an imperial conflict, although the USSR suffered the bulk of the destruction and did most of the fighting and dying in defeating fascism.

The implication in *Beyond the Laboratory* is that after the Non-Aggression Pact, the AASW (and the left) should have supported what had erupted into an imperial war which differed from World War I in that the USSR now existed and that Nazism had been established as a fascist weapon against communism both domestically and internationally. For those who refused to recognize class conflict, nations were the adversaries. Partisans of workers who

viewed the USSR as the proletarian base camp were considered by those who viewed the USSR as a competing imperial power as loyal to a foreign power, rather than the loyal to their class.

It is an unchallenged matter of faith that establishing Nazism in Germany was a big mistake for the capitalists, especially for German capitalists. However, it is sobering to recognize that after being on the losing side in two imperial wars, the Krupps entered the European Economic Community as the richest capitalists in all of Europe. Their treatment by victorious capitalist competitors stands in marked contrast to the fate of their counterparts in the USSR. What would have been their prospects had a prosperous and successful USSR led to the "domino effect" in Germany?

It seemed singularly appropriate to be asked to review *Beyond the Laboratory* jointly with Professor Dirk Struik, who was featured prominently in the book. The request arrived in the midst of preparations for the John Desmond Bernal World Scientific Conference on Security and Disarmament which was held at the New York World Trade Center in preparation for the Third Special Session on Disarmament of the General Assembly of the United Nations, sponsored by the World Federation of Scientific Workers (WFSW) and its U.S. affiliate, the U.S. Federation of Scholars and Scientists (USFSS). J.D.Bernal, whom the conference honored upon the suggestion of Linus Pauling, former Vice-President of the WFSW and Honorary Chair of the USFSS was the central figure in *Beyond the Laboratory*. Bernal's monumental book *The Social Function of Science* was published by Akademie Verlag Berlin in 1939. (Many of the conference participants are contributors to the 50th anniversary festschrift of *The Social Function of Science* to be published by the original publisher.)

At the Bernal conference, Dirk Struik gave the opening address. George Wald, who resigned from the AASW in the flap following the 1940 "peace resolution", gave the closing address, Barry Commoner, who gave a special lecture, were both prominently mentioned in the book. Much oral history recording was done of these walking archives of scientific activism to better understand our origins, but much of this has already been accomplished in this meticulously researched book.

The current climate for activism in the U.S. scientific community has changed considerably. It is more recognized that problems do not come in neat disciplinary packages. A transdisciplinary approach is required. The narrow specialization of the so-called professional societies must be overcome, which is why the name of USFSS deliberately included both scientists and scholars. [Despite the inadequacy of the term in English, "science" will be henceforth used as "Wissenschaft" (knowledge), similarly for "scientist".]

In a capitalist society, effectiveness is critically dependent upon funding. Among the people who control the bulk of the money, a grand dichotomy exists. The two groups among U.S. capitalists are variously described as "Yankees" vs. "Cowboys", "Aristocratic Eastern Seaboard" vs. "Nouveau Riche Sunbelt", or "Traders" vs. "Prussians". The "Cowboys" have never organized scientific groups of any significance. In contrast to the "Cowboys", who are more domestic, more militaristic and chauvinistic, more oriented to short term profits, more vulnerable to the anti-communist ideology which was intended for consumption by the working class, with little international capitalist class loyalty, the Trilateralist (Rockefeller) Yankees emphasize "long-term enlightened self-interest", on the need to heal their economic system, on the business disaster a nuclear war would be, on the limited military utility of nuclear weapons.

The Yankees have embarked upon a campaign to reverse the nuclear war policy of the U.S. government, to develop more rational weaponry, and a more economically viable empire, upon which it is recognized success ultimately depends. Those "peace" organizations and

those organizations of society concerned scientists which confine their concerns to "technological rationality", (i.e., whether weapons, strategies, and policies will "work", without concern for the purposes or interests to which the weapons would be put), without criticism of imperialism or of capitalism, are generously funded. The Union of Concerned Scientists (UCS), the Federation of American Scientists (FAS), Physicians for Social Responsibility, and even the International Physicians for the prevention of Nuclear War are examples. (Organizations like science for the People, Women's International League for Peace and Freedom, the War Resisters League, and of course the USFSS, have little or no chance to obtain similar funding.)

I remember my distress after a full day on the National Council of FAS during the Viet Nam War. There was no concern for the long list of scientists who had been "disappeared" in Chile. Instead, FAS boycotted a scientific conference in the USSR to support Sakharov's wife contention that USSR medicine was not capable of performing a glaucoma operation -- she must go to Italy for it ! A series of weapons systems were criticized as not being "effective", especially not "cost effective at the margin". Finally, in desperation I blurted out, "My God, do you want them to have weapons which do work?!"

At the time only two chapters remained in FAS : Boston, which became UCS, and Los Angeles, which became the Southern California Federation of Scientists (SCFS). The good news is that SCFS has become the most active local organization of concerned scientists. That is also the bad news. UCS is following FAS tradition -- it circulated a petition calling for less military reliance on nuclear weapons by reciprocating the USSR's adoption of a policy committing the government not to initiate a nuclear war. ("No first use".) Of course the USSR was given no crediting for having unilaterally adopted the policy, and, presumably in order to compensate for perceived reduction in "military clout" though the policy change, without any mention of any nuclear disarmament or deployments, UCS simultaneously called for an increase in the military budget . My membership in UCS terminated at that point.

In contrast to the picture painted by Kuznick of the AAAS in the 1930s, the AAAS currently represents an even more extreme case. It eschews responsibility for recommending solutions to societal problems of any kind " in order to preserve their credibility", as they put it. Given these circumstances, what possibilities remain for scientists who wish to acknowledge citizenship and human responsibilities, without being coopted by "technological rationality" and prescriptive scientism, which proclaims science to be neutral, objective, and value-free, or by the "professional syndrome" which declares it the study of experts to serve masters and their goals without question?

Gorbachev had appealed to the UN to marshal global expertise to address world problems through the UN. The Bernal Conference was an initial step in exactly that direction, an attempt to mobilize globally balanced thinking, the best scholars, the best ideas, to address the world's problems, and to develop, in so far as possible, a global consensus of expertise. The U.S. scientific community has become as parochial and as isolated as the U.S. government. It deserves a vehicle whereby its interests and concerns about global issues can be heard in international fora. The Rockefeller-type of organizations have no international affiliations (except for IPPNW, which is a single-issue organization), and they have no presence at the UN. The AASW was reorganized and renamed the "USFSS". (It is now "The Federation", instead of "The Association".)

The term "scientific workers" was dropped in favor of "scientists", not because the proletarian status of scientists has changed, but because current climate carries a prejudice against such terminology. And, of course "scholars" were added in recognition of the transdisciplinary nature of the problems by which we are confronted. A federation structure was adopted in order to encourage existing public interest organizations which would affiliate

to continue their previous activities unaffected.

USFSS is designed to offer a vehicle for expression of the interests and concerns of the U.S. scientific community in the international arena, especially in the UN. It is also designed to help bring the U.S. scientific community into the world community.

The "prima donna" complex is a severe problem in the scientific community. Recognition of competence and accomplishment is commonly taken to be monetary reward -- grants, subsidies, travel, organization, and conference expenses. Those who accept this criterion are allowing their personal judgement to be controlled by those who control the funding. If our activity is confined to that which can obtain funding it will by and large be supportive of the moneyed interests. If we wish to work on behalf of the public, global as well as domestic, including our self-interest, we ourselves must be the origins of the funding and the energy. We must be self-actuated.

Roger Dittmann, Ph.D.
Professor of Physics Emeritus
California State University, Fullerton. P A S

Wittgenstein's Poker

David Edmonds and John Eidinow, Faber and Faber, London, 2001

This extensively researched book deals with a seemingly minor incident : a ten-minute argument between Ludwig Wittgenstein and Karl Popper on 25 October 1946 at the Moral Science Club seminar in King's College, Cambridge. Since then, the 'poker incident' as it is now called, has passed into philosophic and academic folklore. The authors base this crucial ten-minutes - or-so of the meeting to investigate a wide range of topics -- twentieth-century philosophy to World War history, biography to sociology. They also indulge in a fictional reconstruction of the event with the help of inputs and comments from still-surviving members of that meeting. What really took place during that meeting? -- the only time that these two giants of modern philosophy came face-to-face. Popper, the guest speaker, was down from London to read a paper titled, 'Are There Philosophical Problems?' Amongst those present were Bertrand Russell, and not to mention the chairman of the club, Wittgenstein. No one seems to agree precisely on what followed. Popper began reading his paper and Wittgenstein interrupted him, expressing his displeasure and disagreement with a red-hot poker in hand. Russell tried to calm Wittgenstein down but only succeeded in turning his agitation into angry disgust. Suddenly, throwing the poker down Wittgenstein left the room. This much has been generally agreed upon. But there remain disagreements regarding certain important details. Such as Popper's mockingly witty reply when asked for an example of moral rule. (He said, "Not to threaten visiting lecturers with pokers.") In fact, this is Popper's own version to be found in his autobiography *In Unended Quest*. There Popper insists that this reply is what made Wittgenstein furious and storm out of the room. But not everyone present there agrees. Also, there is uncertainty about the role played by Russell : to some he was 'a roaring lion, a rod of reproof', but to others he remained rather inconspicuous.

These and other minor details vary from source to source. But the chief interest of the book lies in its great assimilation of information and details concerning Wittgenstein, Popper and to a lesser extent, Russell. Wittgenstein's influence on Cambridge philosophy, on his students, and indeed on anyone who came in contact with him is evoked with charming detail.

From his students imitating (often unconsciously) his mannerisms and gestures, to his complete domination of the MSC meetings -- all help conjure, rather confirm him to be 'the ultimate modernist outsider' and his image 'as a traditional wilderness-wandering tsaddik, a holy man'. His famed austerity and discipline despite becoming one of the richest men in Europe on his father's death, his services in the World Wars, his passion for precision and exactitude in everything ('a thing was either exact or it was not, and if it was not, it was literally too painful to endure') -- all these and numerous other incidents are listed which help create a lively portrait of the philosopher as an extraordinary man. Various often, contradictory, aspects of Wittgenstein's personality are brought to light. Like his harsh treatment of Friedrich Waismann, a research student who 'found life intolerable under Wittgenstein's shadow.' Careers have been wrecked of those who made the 'fatal' mistake of choosing him as their supervisor: 'he destroyed one's intellectual foundations and powers of abstract thought'. Despite this, a student who had to abandon his doctorate under him is quoted as saying, "People often say that all philosophy is just a footnote to Plato, but they should add 'until Wittgenstein' ". Such is the influence of and the loyalty inspired by the man.

Popper's influence on the other hand had been limited and slow to spread. He was newly arrived in Britain, having spent the war years lecturing in New Zealand. *The Open Society And its Enemies* had just been published in England winning him accolades for his ruthless annihilation of totalitarianism. His philosophical approach was in opposition to that of his rival's, as was his upbringing and career. Unlike Wittgenstein, he presented 'a picture of sheer human ordinariness, with an undeviating academic and married life'. In contrast with Wittgenstein's pithy, oracular pronouncements on philosophy, are Popper's contributions to political and scientific philosophy, and history written in plain English prose. Also their relationships with the Vienna Circle bear the marks of the difference in their respective viewpoints. Early Wittgenstein's *Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus* was considered the Bible of logical positivism and analytic philosophy; and his 'picture theory of language' was appropriated by the logical positivists as the supreme illustration of the 'verifiability principle'. But Wittgenstein hardly felt even remotely connected with the school. Although present at many of their meetings he often preferred reciting Tagore's poetry (Tagore being one of his favourite poets) to discussing philosophy much to the bewilderment of his audience. Facing a wall he would begin to utter the lines from *Gitanjali* which brought out the mystic in him:

"My poet's vanity dies in shame before thy sight.
O master poet, I have sat down at thy feet.
Only let me make my life simple and straight,
Like a flute of reed for thee to fill with music."

Popper on the other hand, credits himself as the man 'who killed Logical Positivism'. He introduced the 'rule of falsification', also called the 'theory of falsifiability' to replace the verification law: a scientific theory could not be proved but it could be shown to be false.

Thus, we find these two uncompromising and brilliant geniuses waiting to confront each other over a common issue. And that issue was the question raised by Popper's paper that evening in 1946, 'Are There Philosophical Problems?' According to later Wittgenstein, there were no problems but only puzzles. Philosophy stems from misuse of ordinary language which was to him perfectly sound. Popper, the champion of democracy and the scientific approach through his rule of falsification, was vehemently opposed to his opponent's all-consuming preoccupation with language. To him the world of politics and ethics, the nature of history were real, burning issues and not mere language games. Therefore, what followed at the MSC

seminar on 25 October 1946 is no surprise. It was a clash of two opposing philosophical schools, two radically different ways of looking at the world and at life.

Among the mass of information provided we can perhaps trace the influence that these two men have had on the succeeding generation -- on Derridean linguistic philosophy and the Foucauldian theory of discourse on the one hand, and on anti-totalitarian, anti-hegemonic political philosophies of the postcolonialists, on the other.

The book's lack of unity may at times prove disconcerting, plunging the reader into a galaxy of details. But written by journalists, the method adopted is reportage and assemblage of information, not the fictional unity of action. The brilliant evocation of fin de siecle Vienna, the violent years of Nazi oppression, the Jewish backgrounds of the two leading philosophers, are just some of the images recorded and recreated in the book. But the main interest lies in the philosophical assumptions of the two men and the clash of the poker incident -- a symbol of their confrontation and opposition.

Arindam Saha P A S

PAUL MARLOR SWEETZ (APRIL 10, 1910 - FEBRUARY 27, 2004) : END OF AN ERA

On February 27, 2004, Paul Sweetz breathed his last in Larchmont, New York. Progressive thinkers and activists all over the world, particularly the Third World, shall ever remember him as an authentic creative Marxist thinker.

Paul Sweetz was educated at Harvard University, where he studied neoclassical economics. In 1932, he went on to the London School of Economics, where, in the early years of the Great Depression, he went through a political and intellectual transformation. Returning to Harvard in 1933, Sweetz began work on his seminal work *The Theory of Capitalist Development*. On being denied appointment for a tenured position in Economics at Harvard only because he was a Marxist, he decided not to resume his former teaching position. Instead, along with Leo Huberman, he launched *Monthly Review: An Independent Socialist Magazine* in 1949.

MR, as it became known, went on to become one of the most independent radical forums. Its contributors were to include Albert Einstein, WEB DuBois, Jean-Paul Sartre, Fidel Castro, Che Guevara, Malcolm X, Noam Chomsky, EP Thompson, Ralph Milliband, Joan Robinson, and Isabel Allende. In 1954, during the days of McCarthyism, Sweetz was convicted for refusing to turn over notes for a lecture he had given at the University of New Hampshire. He received a jail sentence for "contempt", later overturned by the US Supreme Court.

In 1960, in the wake of the Cuban revolution, Sweetz and Huberman concluded that the transformation which was taking place there was of a socialist character. They made this claim nearly a year before Castro himself did so. Sweetz sympathized with Mao's call for a "Cultural Revolution" and the motive that had inspired it.

In 1971, during the Vietnam War, he wrote that "the principal contradiction ... is not within the developed part but between the developed and undeveloped parts" of the world, thus clearly focussing on the importance of anti-imperialist struggle in the *Third World*. At the same time, in *On the Transition to Socialism* (1971, with Charles Bettelheim), Sweetz prophetically showed that attempts to utilize the market mechanism as the central means of building socialism were likely to lead to the restoration of capitalism. Sweetz asserted that "the crisis of the Soviet Union and the collapse of its East European allies" did not herald a "failure of socialism." Explicitly averse to post-modernist ideas, he remained resolutely committed to a socialist future to the last day of his life.

His second wife, Nancy, his third wife, Zyrel, and three children, Samuel, Lybess, and Martha survive Sweetz. P A S